

CITY OF BETHLEHEM

HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

DATE: 20 July 2022

APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD

Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.

Submit original plus 10 copies.

HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION

MEMBERS PRESENT

Connie Postupack
Diana Hodgson - virtual
Joe McGavin
Rodman Young
Michael Simonson
Nik Nikolov

VISITORS PRESENT

Sal Basile, Paul Wright Roofing, 402 & 404
High Street
Evan Blose, Fastsigns, 516 Main Street
Robert C. Marshall, 54 East Wall Street
Ed Courier, Bethlehem Press
Quinn O'Connor, LVP News

MEMBERS ABSENT

Fred Bonsall

STAFF PRESENT

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer
E-Mail:
jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com

The 20 July 2022 meeting of HARB was called to order by Chairperson, Connie Postupack at 5:04 PM.

MINUTES

There were no comments on the 1 June 2022 Minutes and upon a Motion by Diana Hodgson and a Second by Connie Postupack, the Minutes were approved unanimously as submitted.

Item #1: The applicant/owner of the property located at 402 High Street proposes to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color.

Property Location: 402 High Street

Property Owner: Amy Santanasto

Applicant: Paul Wright Roofing

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 402 High Street proposes to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color. New underlayment, ice and water shield, and drip edge will also be installed. All new flashings will be of real copper material. The existing, white half round gutters and round downspouts are to be reused.

Character Defining Features: The two and one-half story home has a cross-gabled roof with intersecting, protruding, clipped-gable (Jerkinhead) roofs over two story high brick bays that face the street on the left and right ends of the structure. These clipped gables are supported by heavy brackets, have deep eaves, heavy rake trim, and a horizontal pent roof at the base of them that separates the brick bays from the sided gable face. Centered between the two gables is a small central dormer that has a shallow pitched hip roof that transitions quickly into a very steeply pitched hip roof. The gutters are half round and the downspouts are round. Both are white in color. The entire façade below the roofline is of smooth brick with gently arched window openings containing one over one light double hung windows with heavy sills. A centered porch with turned posts, small support brackets detailed with rosettes, and a simple cornice protect the painted wood porch deck and wood entrance doors containing a large single top light with five panels below.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the roof replacement project based on the Application package. Since 402 & 404 High Street are part of a contiguous twin home, they were presented and reviewed simultaneously. Mr. Phillips

asked the Applicant if the existing gutters and downspouts will be reused. The Applicant responded in the affirmative. The Applicant advised that the existing shingles are 3-tab asphalt and that the owners would like to replace them with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color. The Applicant agreed with the Historic Officer's request that all flashing be of real copper material and that all prefinished aluminum edge trims and drip edge would match the color, as closely as possible, of the adjacent wood trim. The Applicant further advised that a "wicker" color prefinished aluminum trim was the closest match to the existing paint color of the existing roof edge trims. Connie Postupack asked if any of the existing roof edge trims were proposed to be repainted. The Applicant advised that there is no repainting proposed as part of the scope of work for this project. Dianna Hodgson asked if it was only the main roof that was proposed for replacement. The applicant advised that all existing shingle roofs were proposed to be replaced. The only roof that is not scheduled for replacement is the front porch roof which is an EPDM, flat roofing, material and will remain in place. Nik Nikolov asked if any roof decking or vents were scheduled for replacement. The Applicant advised that there would be no replacement of roof decking or vents unless it was found to be necessary after removing the existing roof shingles. If replacement of these materials is found to be necessary, they will be replaced in-kind.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color.

Motion:

Dianna Hodgson made a motion to approve the removal of the existing asphalt shingle roofing on the home and replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color. New underlayment, ice and water shield, and drip edge will also be installed. The existing, white half round gutters and round downspouts are to be reused, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. New painting of existing trim, if any, will match the color of the existing trim.
2. The color of any aluminum drip edge material will be "Wicker" and match the color of the adjacent trim as closely as possible.
3. All flashings will be of a real copper material.

Second:

Rodman Young

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing asphalt shingles on the home and replace them with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 7: Roofing: The HARB encourages, Replacement of roofing materials when beyond repair, matching original color, pattern, material, and texture.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #2: The applicant/owner of the property located at 404 High Street proposes to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color.

Property Location: 404 High Street

Property Owner: Kenneth Weidner

Applicant: Paul Wright Roofing

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 404 High Street proposes to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color. New underlayment, ice and water shield, and drip edge will also be installed. All new flashings will be of real copper material. The existing, white half round gutters and round downspouts are to be reused.

Character Defining Features: The two and one-half story home has a cross-gabled roof with intersecting, protruding clipped-gable roofs over two story high brick bays that face the street on the left and right ends of the structure. These clipped gables are supported by heavy brackets, have deep eaves, heavy rake trim, and a horizontal pent roof at the base of them that separates the brick bays from the sided gable face. Centered between the two gables is a small central dormer that has a shallow pitched hip roof that transitions quickly into a very steeply pitched hip roof. The gutters are half round and the downspouts are round. Both are white in color. The entire façade below the roofline is of smooth brick with gently arched window openings containing one over one light double hung windows with heavy sills. A centered porch with turned posts, small support brackets detailed with rosettes, and a simple cornice protect the painted wood porch deck and wood entrance doors containing a large single top light with five panels below. (Simplified Victorian/queen anne/bungalow/stick.)

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the roof replacement project based on the Application package. Since 402 & 404 High Street are part of a contiguous twin home, they were presented and reviewed simultaneously. Mr. Phillips asked the Applicant if the existing gutters and downspouts will be reused. The Applicant responded in the affirmative. The Applicant advised that the existing shingle are 3-tab asphalt and that the owners would like to replace them with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color. The Applicant agreed with the Historic Officer's request that all flashing be of real copper material and that all prefinished aluminum edge trims and drip edge would match the color, as closely as possible, of the adjacent wood trim. The Applicant further advised that a "wicker" color prefinished aluminum trim was the closest match to the existing paint color of the existing roof edge trims. Connie Postupack asked if any of the existing roof edge trims were proposed to be repainted. The Applicant advised that there is no repainting proposed as part of the scope of work for this project. Dianna Hodgson asked if it was only the main roof that was proposed for replacement. The applicant advised that all existing shingle roofs were proposed to be replaced. The only roof that is not scheduled for replacement is the front porch roof which is an EPDM, flat roofing, material and will remain in place. Nik Nikolov asked if any roof decking or vents were scheduled for replacement. The Applicant advised that there would be no replacement of roof decking or vents unless it was found to be necessary after removing the existing roof shingles. If replacement of these materials is found to be necessary, they will be replaced in-kind.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color.

Motion: Dianna Hodgson made a motion to approve the removal of the existing asphalt shingle roofing on the home and replace the existing asphalt roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color. New underlayment, ice and water shield, and drip edge will also be installed. The existing, white half round gutters and round downspouts are to be reused, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. New painting of existing trim, if any, will match the color of the existing trim.
2. The color of any aluminum drip edge material will be “Wicker” and match the color of the adjacent trim as closely as possible.
3. All flashings will be of a real copper material.

Second: Rodman Young

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing asphalt shingles on the home and replace them with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 7: Roofing: The HARB encourages, Replacement of roofing materials when beyond repair, matching original color, pattern, material, and texture.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #3: The applicant/owner of the property located at 516 Main Street proposes to install an internally illuminated, halolit aluminum hanging sign.

Property Location: 516 Main Street

Property Owner: CTI-PA Investments

Applicant: Fastsigns Allentown

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 516 Main Street proposes to install an internally illuminated, double sided, 4.75 square feet on each side, halolit aluminum hanging sign. The halolit colors will be black, off white, and orange. There will be no direct external lighting.

Character Defining Features: The three-story Italianate structure was constructed in the 1870's as part of the commercial expansion of Bethlehem. The first floor has storefront display windows under ornate, leaded glass transom lights that are topped by paneled trim and a dentiled cornice. The second and third floor facades are comprised of a painted, smooth brick façade and arch-topped window openings with heavy bracketed sills and bracketed brick arched hoods containing a keystone. The openings contain 2 over 2-light double hung windows. There is a shallow dentiled cornice between the second and third floors and a heavy protruding, bracketed cornice that crowns the top of the building.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package and advised HARB that on page 15 of the Bethlehem Historic District Guidelines it states that, "The HARB discourages: New billboards, *internally illuminated box signs*, LED reader boards, flashing or changeable message signs, neon signs". The Applicant advised that the new sign will hang in the same location as the existing sign bracket, but will be hung on a new metal sign bracket as detailed in the Application. The Applicant fielded questions from HARB Members and described the attributes of a halolit sign. The sign "box" is constructed of opaque aluminum and includes internally mounted LED lighting. The actual halolit letters are made of acrylic with an opaque film on their face. This forces the interior light through the edge of the acrylic letters, which are partially recessed into the light box, but protrude approximately 3/8 of an inch from the face of the light box. Therefore, the light enters the edge of the acrylic letters on the inside of the light box and exits the edge of the letters on the exterior of the lightbox, forming a halo of light around the letters. The

halolit letters are limited to the text "SWBR" and "EST. 1969". The text "MARKETING & MEDIA" will not be lit. Nik Nikolov asked if the lighted sign will be prewired and the Applicant responded in the affirmative. The Applicant made reference to an existing internally illuminated sign incorporated as part of the Univest Bank (574 Main Street) ATM installation that is located on Broad Street and just off of Main Street. The Applicant stated that he feels the Univest sign has set a precedent for what is acceptable in the Historic District. Dianna Hodgson stated that she doesn't remember Univest Bank getting approval for an internally illuminated sign. Mike Simonson stated that he thinks that the sign may have been approved as part of the overall ATM and related equipment installation, which is a standard piece of equipment and installation for Univest Bank. Joe McGavin asked if the proposed sign was heavy and if it would be installed in the existing mounting holes. The Applicant replied that the sign is relatively light since it is manufactured using aluminum and that they are proposing to use the existing mounting holes. Dianna Hodgson asked the Applicant if his client would consider a more traditional sign design. The Applicant did not respond. The Applicant provided photographic examples of signs that incorporated halo lighting. However, these examples are of much larger building mounted signs with individual letters and do not directly represent or relate to the sign proposed in the Application. (See attached images) Nik Nikolov asked if the Applicant could provide examples of signs that match exactly what is being proposed in this Application. The Applicant agreed to provide images and physical addresses for signs that more closely match what is being proposed. Dianna Hodgson asked the Applicant if he could bring a sample of what is being proposed to the next meeting. The Applicant stated that it would be difficult and costly to prepare a sample and pulled up additional images of signs on his phone that were shared with the members of HARB. Connie Postupack asked if the "SWBR" letters are the businesses logo and the Applicant responded in the affirmative and that the colors proposed are the colors of the business logo. HARB questioned the temperature and intensity of the halo light being proposed. The Applicant advised that he could make the color temperature of the light whatever would be desired/required. Connie Postupack and Mike Simonson advised that HARB generally stipulates a color temperature of 2700 Kelvin. The Historic Officer cautioned HARB of setting a precedence with their review and action regarding this Application, further stating that a single halolit sign, such as proposed, may not impose a significant impact on the character of Main Street and the Historic District, but multiple or numerous signs of this design and nature could significantly impact the look, feel, and character of Main Street and the Historic District. The Historic Officer also advised that the typical hanging blade sign is approximately 1-1/2 to 2 inches thick. The proposed halolit sign is proposed to be a 6-inch-thick box, which is significantly bulkier and heavier visually/aesthetically and is incongruent with the size and scale of the other hanging blade signs that can be found on Main Street. Connie Postupack asked the Applicant if

the thickness of the sign box could be reduced from the proposed 6 inches. The Applicant responded that it could not be made any thinner. After much give and take between HARB and the Applicant, Connie Postupack stated that she felt that, because of the significance of HARB's decision on this Application, HARB needed additional time and information to consider this Application. The Applicant agreed to provide additional images/examples and the addresses for locations of similar signs to Mike Simonson so that this information could be distributed to HARB for their review and consideration. The Applicant also agreed to prepare a sample, showing the exact details of the sign proposed in the Application, for presentation and review at the next HARB Meeting.

The HARB agreed to table any formal action on this Application until additional information was provided by the Applicant for review and discussion at a future meeting.

Motion: Joe McGavin made a motion to table any formal action on this Application until additional information is provided by the Applicant for review and discussion at a future meeting, in accordance with the discussion outlined above.

Second: Diana Hodgson

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to table formal action on this Application, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 15: Signage: The HARB encourages signage that does not obscure or damage architectural features, identifies the business, complements the style of the building and is appropriately scaled for its location. "The HARB discourages: New billboards,

internally illuminated box signs, LED reader boards, flashing or changeable message signs, neon signs”.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work, as currently presented in the Application, does not conform with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, is not compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing and does not protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment. Furthermore, it does not conform with the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines discouraging internally illuminated signage and will have potential, significant negative impact to the historic district.

Item #4: The applicant/owner of the property located at 54 East Wall Street proposes to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles on the house and carport with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color.

Property Location: 54 East Wall Street

Property Owner: Robert C. Marshall

Applicant: Robert C. Marshall

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 54 East Wall Street proposes to replace the existing roof shingles with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color. New prefinished aluminum drip edge will be installed at the perimeter of the roofs. New chimney flashing will be installed as/if required and new vent pipe boots/flashings will be installed to replace the existing. New shingle covered ridge vents will also be installed.

Character Defining Features: The two-story home, constructed in the 1977, has a cross-gabled asphalt shingle roof facing the Street whose ridge is pierced by a centrally located brick chimney. The ‘K’ gutters and rectangular downspouts are white in color. The stone façade incorporates brick relieving arches above the window and entrance openings. All of the double hung windows, with simple heads and heavy sills, are six over six light and are fitted with black louvered shutters on second floor and black paneled shutters on the first floor. The shutters are fitted with hinges, pull rings, hooks, and locks. The off-center wood louvered entrance door with a four light transom window is recessed in an arched opening.

It was noted in the 6/5/19 presentation for 54 East Wall Street that this residence is part of a row of residences that was constructed in 1977 and replaced an earlier school

building that was located on this site. The residences are deemed contributing, but are under the 50-year-old cut-off for “historic” buildings as defined by the National Park Service and part of the original national legislation. Properties that have achieved significance within the past fifty years are generally not considered eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic places. (Must be over 50 years old to be considered historic, this building is 45)

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package and advised HARB that the same shingles were approved in an Application made to HARB on 4 May 2022 for 52 East Wall Street. The Applicant verified that the Application includes reroofing the existing carport as well. Mike Simonson asked if the carport was visible from the street. The Applicant advised that the carport is located on and is visible from Wesley Street. The Applicant opined that the shingles on all of the residential units in this row will probably be replaced in the next couple of years. In response to questions from the Historic Officer, the Applicant confirmed that all prefinished aluminum edge trims will match the color of the adjacent trim and that all chimney and other roof flashings will be installed using real copper material.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing roof shingles with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color.

Motion: Rodman Young made a motion to approve the removal of the existing roof shingles and replace them with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate Color, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The color of any aluminum drip edge material shall match the color of the adjacent trim.
2. Any chimney and/or roof penetration flashing shall be copper.

Second: Connie Postupack

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing roof shingles and replace them with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate Color, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 7: Roofing: The HARB encourages, Replacement of roofing materials when beyond repair, matching original color, pattern, material and texture

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines/Guidelines for Sustainability and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

New Business

1. None

There being no further business, upon a Motion by Mike Simonson, a Second by Connie Postupack and a unanimous vote, the meeting was adjourned at 6:35 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



H. Joseph Phillips, AIA
Historic Officer