

## **CITY OF BETHLEHEM**

### **HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

**DATE: 3 February 2021**

### **APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD**

**Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.**

Submit original plus 10 copies.

### **HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION**

#### **MEMBERS PRESENT**

Beth Starbuck  
Marsha Fritz  
Diana Hodgson  
Connie Postupack  
Rodman Young  
Derrick Clark

#### **VISITORS PRESENT/Virtual Attendance**

Darlene L. Heller, City of Bethlehem,  
Director of Planning and Zoning  
Craig D. Peiffer, City of Bethlehem,  
Planning and Zoning  
Mike Simonson, City of Bethlehem,  
Chief Code Official  
Norman Roberts, 228 East Market Street  
Art Mattes, Contractor 228 E. Market St.  
Lawanna Kendricks, The University Club of  
Bethlehem  
Brandon Edwards, The University Club of  
Bethlehem  
Elyse Garcia, The University Club of  
Bethlehem  
Larry Monte, 818 West Market Street  
Ed Courrier, Bethlehem Press

#### **MEMBERS ABSENT**

Fred Bonsall  
Connie Glagola

#### **STAFF PRESENT**

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer  
E-Mail:  
[jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com](mailto:jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com)

### **MINUTES:**

There were no comments on the 6 January 2020 Minutes. The minutes were approved unanimously as submitted. The 3 February 2020 meeting of HARB was called to order by Chairperson, Beth Starbuck at 5:01 PM.

**Item #1:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 228 East Market Street proposes to repair and replace porch roofing, gutters and downspouts on a first-floor bay window and porch.

**Property Location:** 228 East Market Street

**Property Owner:** Norman Roberts

**Applicant:** Norman Roberts

**Proposed work:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 228 East Market Street proposes to repair and replace porch roofing, gutters and downspouts on a first-floor bay window and porch. The existing roofing is a smooth metal, unseamed roofing painted red. The proposed roofing is a prefinished, standing seam metal roofing, in a red color similar to the images included of the roofing located at 218 East Market Street. The existing gutters are three-inch half round gutters with round corrugated downspouts. The proposed downspouts will be copper.

**Character Defining Features:** This structure is a two-story brick structure constructed between 1860 and 1865 with a large, broad, wood sided dormer that was later added to accommodate a third floor. It has characteristics of a narrow, primarily unadorned, Greek Revival urban house. The primary adornment of the smooth brick street façade is an ornate recessed entrance porch with a transom light above the door, paneled side walls, and paneled square pilasters with ornate scroll shaped brackets and an ornamented entablature panel between the brackets. Other character defining elements include a moderately sloped side-gabled roof running parallel to the street, half-round copper gutters and round downspouts, and an exposed, projecting, central chimney on the gable end. The windows have simple unadorned rectangular heads or lintels and sills. The first floor double hung windows are 2 over 2 with 3 panel shutters. The second floor double hung windows are 2 over 2 with louvered shutters.

**Discussion:** The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. The applicant explained that he would like to keep up with the neighborhood in the maintenance of his home and that he has appeared before HARB for past projects. He advised that there are currently aluminum gutters and downspouts on the current first floor porch and bay and that they will be replaced with copper gutters and downspouts. He further referenced a roofing project that he said was previously approved by HARB and located on the home at 218 East Market Street. The applicant would like to install the same or similar product. Beth Starbuck asked if he had the specific name and color of the metal roofing product he is proposing to use. The applicant did not. Marsha Fritz advised the applicant that a color sample would need to be submitted to the

Historic Officer for approval prior to installation. The applicant agreed to this. Ms. Fritz further questioned the applicant regarding the metal product to be used and advised that a product with a wide and tall standing seam was not acceptable. The product used should have a narrow seam of approximately one quarter inch and a height of approximately one inch. Dianna Hodgson questioned the pitch of the roofs to receive the new roofing. The applicant advised that the second-floor porch roof has a pitch of approximately 2 inches in 12 inches and the first-floor bay and porch roof has a pitch of approximately 4 inches in 12 inches. Marsha Fritz asked the applicant why he was proposing to replace the roofs. The applicant responded that it was for aesthetic reasons and to make them match. Ms. Fritz asked the applicant if the roof over the bay window and porch was in bad condition. The applicant advised that the existing roof over the bay window and porch is rusting, leaks, and requires regular maintenance with roofing cement and paint. Ms. Fritz advised the applicant that HARB discourages removal and replacement of elements that contribute to the historic fabric of the structure unless it is in very bad condition and unrepairable. The applicant responded that the reason for wanting to replace the first-floor bay and porch roofs was that they are in poor and failing condition. The reason for wanting to replace the second-floor porch roof is that it is currently a rubber roof that is inappropriate to the historic fabric of the home. Beth Starbuck questioned what the metal roofing detail would be at the hips and valleys of the roof over the bay window and adjacent porch. The applicant was unsure and agreed to submit details to the Historic Officer for approval prior to installation.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of roofing, gutters and downspouts on the east facing first-floor bay window, the east facing first floor porch adjacent to the bay window, and the south facing second floor porch.**

**Motion:**

Beth Starbuck made a motion to approve the replacement of roofing, gutters and downspouts on the east facing first-floor bay window, the east facing first floor porch adjacent to the bay window, and the south facing second floor porch, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, and with the following conditions.

1. The applicant will confirm the actual roof pitches and submit them to the Chief Code Official who will confirm whether or not the roof pitches are within the range that is allowed by code for the installation of standing seam metal roofing products.
2. The standing seam will be narrow, approximately one quarter of an inch, and approximately one inch tall.
3. The applicant must submit manufacturer's product data, cut sheets, and details of the seam profile, hip & valley details, roof edge details, etc., to the Historic Officer for review and approval.

4. The applicant must submit a sample of the actual roof color to be installed for review and approval by the Historic Officer.
5. New gutters will be half round copper and new downspouts will be round copper.

**Second:** Dianna Hodgson

**Result of vote:** The vote was unanimous to approve the replacement of roofing, gutters and downspouts on the east facing first-floor bay window, the east facing first floor porch adjacent to the bay window, and the south facing second floor porch, as per the motion.

**Item #2:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 62 East Market Street proposes to replace five existing windows.

**Property Location:** 62 East Market Street

**Property Owner:** The University Club of Bethlehem

**Applicant:** The University Club of Bethlehem, Lawanna Kendricks

**Proposed work:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 62 East Market Street proposes to replace five existing windows in a second-floor box bay. The applicant has included five different window price quotes from five different suppliers/contractors. The applicant should clarify which window type they are proposing to use for this work.

**Character Defining Features:** The University Club of Bethlehem was organized in 1911 to provide living and dining facilities and serve as a center for social activity for persons attending institutions of higher education in the Lehigh Valley area. They purchased the current residence in May of 1916 from the estate of Herman O Burkhardt, who was a plumber and originally built the mansion in 1890. The corporate charter was registered in July of 1916 and the club became a registered non-profit corporation in 1934.

The residence exhibits a mix of simplified Victorian style elements, including Second Empire, Stick, and Queen Anne.

The main body of the house is a minimally patterned brick that has been painted. The chimney is an ornately patterned brick that has been painted. The roof over the main body of the house is hipped with lower gable roofs that are plugged into the main hip roof. There is a tower that is centered on the front façade which is typical of Second Empire Style Victorians. The tower has a convex, ogee, or “S” curved roof. This contrasts with the other simpler hip and sloping gable roof forms. The symmetrical gable elements on each side of the central tower are differentiated

by the location of a two-story angled bay on the gable element on the right side of the front façade, creating a subtle asymmetry.

The rear and east facades exhibit elements of the Stick Victorian Style. This includes a wood shingle clad box-bay window element, on the second and third floor, over an angled-bay window on the first floor. Horizontal and vertical bands of wood trim are raised from the wall surface of the box-bay for emphasis. The horizontal and vertical wood bands mimic the exposed structural members of half-timbered medieval houses. This highlights the wall surface as a decorative element rather than just a wall plane. Overhanging roof eaves have exposed rafter tails. There is a one story, shed roofed, front porch with a central, front facing gable roof that is aligned with the tower.

Windows are double hung with a variety of muntin patterns. The windows to be replaced on the second floor of the box-bay are 9 light prairie style over 1 light in the center of the bay and 6 over 1 on the two sides of the second-floor bay.

**Discussion:** The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Beth Starbuck asked Joe Phillips if the Prairie Style replacement window being proposed by the applicant would be original to this style of home. Mr. Phillips responded that most typically Victorian homes from this time period would have 2 over 2 or 1 over 1 windows. Marsha Fritz asked the applicant if they knew whether or not the windows proposed for replacement were original to the house. The applicant responded, “yes, they have ropes”. Ms. Fritz advised that having ropes does not necessarily mean that the windows are historic. She further asked if the applicant has any documentation showing what the original windows looked like. The applicant advised that they do not. Dianna Hodgson asked if there will multiple panes in the top sash and 2 panes in the lower sash. The applicant responded in the affirmative. Marsha Fritz added that in the late Victorian period a variety of window styles were utilized and whatever light patterns could be made or fabricated were often times used, leading to a great variety of window light configurations. Connie Postupack asked the applicant if they have given consideration to restoring the windows and Marsha Fritz asked what condition the windows are in. The applicant responded that the windows that are proposed to be replaced are in horrific condition with loose glass, rotting wood, and sash that do not operate up or down. Ms. Fritz advised the applicant that HARB always recommends that historic elements, such as windows, be repaired/restored and not replaced if at all possible. Windows are very important to the historic fabric of a building. Connie Postupack and Beth Starbuck advised that they have the names of some sources that may be able to assist the applicant with repair/restoration of the windows. With the above in mind, Marsha Fritz recommended that the application be tabled and that the applicant should explore the repair/restoration of the windows instead of replacement.

**The HARB agreed to table this item.**

**Motion:** Marsha Fritz made a motion to table this item, in accordance with the discussion outlined above.

**Second:** Dianna Hodgson

**Result of vote:** The vote was unanimous to table this item, as per the motion.

#### Other Discussion

Beth Starbuck asked HARB Members if they would be willing to spend ten to fifteen minutes after each monthly HARB Meeting to discuss continuing education topics. All in attendance stated that they would. She also advised that the HARB Bylaws allow for appointment of a Secretary and that we should consider doing so. She also would like HARB to review the Bylaws, and amend if necessary, the section(s) regarding the replacement of members that consistently do not attend meetings. Ms. Starbuck advised that Ordinance and Bylaw information is available on the City's website and that she would also email everyone a link.

Marsha Fritz added that the continuing education discussions at the end of each meeting will help everyone gain knowledge on "why we do what we do" as a HARB Board. There is a manual entitled "A Manual for Pennsylvania Historic Architectural Review Boards and Historical Commissions" that she will email to HARB Members and call out pages to read regarding conducting HARB Board business. Everyone should read the recommended pages prior to next month's meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:11 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "H. Joseph Phillips". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA  
Historic Officer