

CITY OF BETHLEHEM

HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

DATE: 4 May 2022

APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD

Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.

Submit original plus 10 copies.

HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION

MEMBERS PRESENT

Connie Postupack
Michael Simonson
Diana Hodgson
Nik Nikolov

VISITORS PRESENT

Donald & Rockwell, 52 E. Wall Street
Robert & Jenine Littner, 512 N. New Street
Trish & Brian Carnahan, 444 N. New Street
Ed Courrier, Bethlehem Press
Alexis Kovacs, Electric Cheetah Tattoos
Evan Blose, 77 West Broad Street

MEMBERS ABSENT

Fred Bonsall
Joe McGavin
Rodman Young

STAFF PRESENT

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer
E-Mail:
jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com

The 4 May 2022 meeting of HARB was called to order by Chairperson, Connie Postupack at 5:03 PM.

MINUTES

There were no comments on the 6 April 2022 Minutes and the Minutes were approved unanimously as submitted.

Item #1: The applicant/owner of the property located at 52 East Wall Street proposes to replace the existing roof, skylights, and windows.

Property Location: 52 East Wall Street

Property Owner: Donald & Elke Rockwell

Applicant: Donald & Elke Rockwell

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 52 East Wall Street proposes the replacement of 22 windows on the first, second, and third floors. The proposed Andersen, 400 Series Woodwright, double hung, wood windows will closely replicate the existing/original double hung windows installed when the home was constructed in 1977. The windows are proposed to incorporate Full Divided Lights that simulate true divided light windows with permanently applied grille bars on the interior and exterior glass surfaces and an aluminum spacer between the interior and exterior glass panes. The windows are manufactured with a Fibrex, composite material, coating that will be prefinished white in the factory. The owner advised that the proposed windows are the same as windows replaced in recent years at 54, 56, and 58 East Wall Street. A search of previously completed Meeting Minutes shows that HARB approved this window for use at 54 East Wall Street at their 5 June 2019 meeting. (58 first, 54 second, 56 third, now 52)

Furthermore, the applicant/owner proposes to replace the existing roof shingles on all sections of the roof and is looking for HARB to state their preference for one of the manufacturers and colors included in the Submittal. There are three manufacturer's products submitted for consideration. They are, GAF Slateline, (HARB prefers Antique Slate Color) IKO Royal Estate, (Mountain Slate approved at April meeting for 539 1st Ave.) and Owens Corning Oakridge Laminated Architectural Shingles. It should also be noted that the Applicant is proposing the use of the SmartVent roof cavity insulation system to provide venting/airflow in the cavity between the top of the roof insulation and the underside of the roof decking. This system causes one course of shingles near the bottom of the roof to be elevated or raised approximately ¾" to 1" to allow for air intake that then flows up the roof to exhaust through the ridge vent. A cut sheet has

been provided with the Application. HARB will need to decide if this ventilation system is appropriate to a structure that is contributing to the Historic District.

Lastly, the applicant/owner proposes to replace two existing Velux Skylights with new in-kind units. One of the skylights is located on the south-facing roof and the other skylight is located on the east-facing roof. The new skylights will replicate the rectangular shape, black frame color, and square dimensions of the existing skylights.

Note: It was noted in the 6/5/19 presentation for 54 East Wall Street that this residence is part of a row of residences that was constructed in 1977 and replaced an earlier school building that was located on this site. The residences are deemed contributing, but are under the 50-year-old cut-off for “historic” buildings as defined by the National Park Service and part of the original national legislation. Properties that have achieved significance within the past fifty years are generally not considered eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic places. (must be over 50 years old to be considered historic, this building is 45)

Character Defining Features: The two-story home, constructed in the 1977, has a cross-gabled asphalt shingle roof facing the Street. The half ‘K’ gutters and rectangular downspouts are white in color. The simple brick façade incorporates brick relieving arches above the window and entrance openings. All of the double hung windows, with simple heads and heavy sills, are six over six light and are fitted with black louvered shutters on second floor and white paneled shutters on the first floor. The shutters are fitted with hinges, pull rings, hooks, and locks. The off-center wood paneled entrance door with a four light transom window is recessed in an arched opening with wood panel sides.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package.

Windows

Upon questioning from Mr. Phillips, the Applicant advised that the existing shutters and related hardware would be reused, the window trim would remain and be repaired in place as/if necessary, and the existing exterior storm windows would be removed. Dianna Hodgson asked if the windows would be painted and the Applicant replied that the would be painted in the factory and the color would be white. Mr. Phillips advised that the proposed windows are the same window that were approved by HARB for 54 East Wall Street.

Roofing

The Applicant advised that GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color is his preferred shingle. The Applicant also asked, if by chance the Slateline shingles in Antique Slate are not available, that the GAF Timberline HDZ shingle in the Slate color be approved as an alternative. Mike Simonson advised the Applicant the HARB does not approve the use of Architectural Shingles, such as the Timberline HDZ. The Applicant then asked if the Slateline shingle in English Gray could be approved as an alternative. Mr. Simonson responded that he felt that the Slateline Royal Slate color is the most appropriate alternative. The other HARB members agreed. Mr. Phillips advised the Applicant that, prior to an alternate color being purchased and installed, a letter must be received by Mr. Simonson, from the installing contractor, stipulating that the GAF Slateline shingle in the Antique Slate color is not available. The Applicant agreed.

The Applicant advised that the location of the smart vent system has been revised and provided HARB with a revised cut sheet showing the location of the smart vent to be at the bottom of the roof, just above the fascia. In this way, the smart vent would be concealed from view by the existing K gutter. Diana Hodgson asked the Applicant why he was proposing to use the Smartvent system. The Applicant stated that the existing soffit vents are either too small or nonexistent in the bulk of the soffits and the smart vent system would eliminate the possibility of the roof cavity insulation sliding down and blocking the traditional soffit vents. The Applicant further advised that a new ridge vent would be installed as part of the reroofing. Diana Hodgson asked if the existing gutters and downspouts would remain. The Applicant responded in the affirmative.

Skylights

Mike Simonson asked the Applicant if the new skylights would be the same as the existing skylights. The Applicant advised that the new skylights will be the same size, color, and profile and be as in-kind as possible to the existing skylights.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing windows and replace them with Andersen, 400 Series, Woodwright, double hung, wood windows.

Motion #1:

Mike Simonson made a motion to approve the removal of the existing windows and replace them with Andersen, 400 Series, Woodwright, double hung, wood windows, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The color of the windows shall be white.
2. The existing window trim shall remain and will be repaired in place on an as/if needed basis. The color of the trim will remain white.
3. The existing shutters and all related hardware will be maintained.
4. The existing exterior storm windows will be removed.

Second:

Diana Hodgson

Result of vote:

The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing windows and replace them with Andersen, 400 Series, Woodwright, double hung, wood windows, as per the motion.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing roof shingles on the home and replace them with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate Color.

Motion #2:

Diana Hodgson made a motion to approve the removal of the existing shingles on the home and replace them with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The color of any aluminum drip edge material shall match the color of the adjacent trim.
2. Any chimney and/or roof penetration flashing shall be copper.
3. The installation of the SmartVent roof cavity ventilation system shall be at the bottom of the roof and just above the fascia as shown on the revised cutsheet provided by the Applicant at this meeting.
4. The existing gutters and downspouts shall be reused.
5. GAF Slateline shingles in the Royal Slate color are approved as an alternative, if and only if, the Antique Slate color is legitimately not available. Prior to an alternate color being purchased and/or installed, a letter must be received by Mr. Simonson from the installing

contractor stipulating that the GAF Slateline shingle in the Antique Slate color is not available.

Second: Mike Simonson

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing shingles on the home and replace them with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color, as per the motion.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing skylights on the home and replace them in-kind.

Motion #3: Nik Nikolov made a motion to approve the removal of the existing skylights on the home and replace them in-kind, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The new skylights will be the same size, color, and profile as the existing skylights.

Second: Mike Simonson

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing skylights on the home and replace them in-kind, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 7: Roofing: The HARB encourages, Replacement of roofing materials when beyond repair, matching original color, pattern, material and texture

City of Bethlehem HARB Guidelines for Sustainability

Page 6: Windows: If replacement windows or doors within existing openings are warranted, the HARB/HCC encourage: Installing quality wood replacement windows in existing openings with an exterior painted wood finish, matching the historic window appearance and design. The HARB/HCC discourage: Removing, covering or altering surrounding trim.

Page 6: Shutters: The HARB/HCC encourage: Maintaining and utilizing historic operable shutters.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines/Guidelines for Sustainability and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #2: The applicant/owner of the property located at 512 North New Street proposes to Change the color of the door from brown to black and paint the existing brown colored circle top window infill material black.

Property Location: 512 North New Street

Property Owner: Robert V. Littner

Applicant: Robert V. Littner

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 512 North New Street proposes to Change the color of the door from brown to black and paint the existing brown colored circle top window infill material black. It appears that the construction material of the three styles of doors being presented for consideration is fiberglass. Bright brass hardware is being proposed to match existing.

Character Defining Features: The one story, flat-roofed structure, originally a U.S. Post Office Building, has a smooth stone base and a smooth brick upper wall. A centrally located arched door opening is topped with cast a stone ornamented panel and surrounding trim. Two arched topped window openings symmetrically flank the double entrance doors on each side and are fitted with cast stone surrounding trim with a keystone. The square 24 light window is topped by an infill panel. The alternating height parapet is topped with a cast stone cap.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package. Mike Simonson asked if the existing windows are wood. The Applicant advised that they are aluminum. Connie Postupack asked if the existing doors are wood. The Applicant advised that they are metal and that the original Post Office Doors were glass. Nik Nikolov asked the Applicants which of the three options included in the Application they preferred. The Applicant advised that they preferred option #1. Connie Postupack asked the Applicants if they provided an option for wood doors. The Applicant responded that they had not and that they would like to stay with a maintenance free material such as the fiberglass construction proposed in option #1. Mr. Phillips asked if the doors would come with the color integral to their fiberglass construction. The Applicant advised that the doors would be painted black to match the painting of the other surfaces above the windows and in the infill wall in front of the existing onsite parking space. The Applicant also confirmed that the new mail slot and door hardware would be bright brass to match the existing. Diana Hodgson questioned what was being planned for the replacement of the address numbers currently on the existing doors. Mike Simonson advised that the numbers must be a minimum of four inches high and in a color contrasting the background they are mounted on. After a bit of back-and-forth discussion, the Applicant advised that the numbers for the building's street address would be mounted on the right door leaf and would be in bright brass to match the other door hardware. The mail slot will be located on the left door leaf. Connie Postupack asked if and how the existing door frame would need to be modified. The Applicant stated that the door frame would be replaced as required and would be painted black to match the door.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove and replace the existing entrance doors, change the color of the doors from brown to black and paint the existing brown colored window and wall infill material black.

Motion:

Diana Hodgson made a motion to approve the removal and replacement of the existing entrance doors, change the color of the doors from brown to black and paint the existing brown colored window and wall infill material black, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The door will be option #1, Item 0001 as provided in the Application. The new door will be fitted with simple trim, painted black to match the door.

2. The number 512 will be located on the right-side door leaf, will be a minimum of four inches high, and will be bright brass to contrast with the black door.
3. The existing downspouts on the sides of the building will be painted to match the color of the existing brick they are attached to.
4. The existing lighting fixtures to the left and right sides of the door will be painted black.

Second: Mike Simonson

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal and replacement of the existing entrance doors, change the color of the doors from brown to black and paint the existing brown colored window and wall infill material black, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

City of Bethlehem HARB Guidelines for Sustainability

Page 6: Windows: If replacement windows or doors within existing openings are warranted, the HARB/HCC encourage: Installing quality wood replacement windows in existing openings with an exterior painted wood finish, matching the historic window appearance and design. Installing historically appropriate wood doors. The HARB/HCC discourage: Removing, covering or altering surrounding trim.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines/Guidelines for Sustainability and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #3: The applicant/owner of the property located at 444 North New Street proposes to replace concrete steps and landing along Wall Street and redo the parking pad along Wall Street.

Property Location: 444 North New Street

Property Owner: Brian Carnahan

Applicant: Brian Carnahan

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 444 North New Street proposes to replace concrete steps and landing along Wall Street and redo the parking pad along Wall Street. The new steps will be five feet wide and have flagstone treads. The landing will be constructed with brick pavers similar to the pavers used in the Wall Street sidewalk and will include the use of some of the old bricks that are already on the property. The retaining wall adjacent to the parking pad will be repaired using existing stone. The parking pad will be excavated four inches down and new decorative red chipped stone, the same type of stone that currently exists, will be installed.

Character Defining Features of the Site: The existing site consists of simple garden beds with a concrete walk and concrete steps leading from the brick sidewalk at the street to the side porch and rear of the home. The red stone chipped parking area is bordered by a dry-laid natural stone wall. Large trees screen the view of the home from Wall Street.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package. The Applicant stated that they would like to install a new brick walkway with solid flagstone steps. Nick Nikolov asked if the walkway would have an edging material and the Applicant advised that the walkway would be edged with flush brick. The Applicant further advised that the brick walkway would be bedded on sand or screenings. Diana Hodgson asked if the new stair would be the same width as the existing stair. The Applicant advised that the new stair would be wider than the existing stair and would be centered on the porch steps. Nik Nikolov advised the Applicant that the new stair would require a handrail. The Applicant agreed and noted that the new handrail would be fabricated out of metal or cast iron. Mike Simonson advised the Applicant that they would need to come back before HARB for approval of the handrail. The Applicant acknowledged and agreed to this.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace concrete steps and landing along Wall Street and redo the parking pad along Wall Street.

Motion: Nik Nikolov made a motion to approve the replacement of the concrete steps and landing along Wall Street and the redo of the parking pad along Wall Street, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The new, solid, flagstone steps will be on axis with/centered on the existing porch steps.
2. The new brick walks will be edged with flush brick.
3. The existing parking pad will be excavated four inches down and new crushed stone will be installed to match existing.
4. The stone walls at the perimeter of the parking pad will be repaired in place as indicated in the Application.
5. The Applicant will submit an Application to HARB for review and approval of the handrail required for the new flagstone steps. The handrail will also require submission to the city code department for review and approval.

Second: Connie Postupack

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the replacement of the concrete steps and landing along Wall Street and the redo of the parking pad along Wall Street, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

#5 Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 13: Site Elements: The HARB encourages, Installing natural stone walls. The HARB encourages, the retention & maintenance of existing historic paving materials, such as brick, stone, and gravel.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines/Guidelines for Sustainability and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

New Business

1. A Motion was made by Connie Postupack to elect Diana Hodgson as Vicechair of HARB. The Motion was seconded by Mike Simonson. A vote was taken and the Motion carried unanimously.
2. It was noted that HARB currently has seven members and can have up to nine members. Mike Simonson advised that anyone having interest in serving on HARB can apply through him or Darlene Heller and they will see to it the information is forwarded to the Mayor.

There being no further business, upon a Motion by Connie Postupack, a Second by Mike Simonson and a unanimous vote, the meeting was adjourned at 6:17 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



H. Joseph Phillips, AIA
Historic Officer