

**CITY OF BETHLEHEM**

**HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

**DATE: 3 March 2021**

**APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD**

**Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.**

Submit original plus 10 copies.

**HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION**

MEMBERS PRESENT

Beth Starbuck  
Marsha Fritz  
Diana Hodgson  
Connie Postupack  
Rodman Young  
Derrick Clark  
Fred Bonsall

VISITORS PRESENT/Virtual Attendance

Darlene L. Heller, City of Bethlehem,  
Director of Planning and Zoning  
Shawn Fuller, City of Bethlehem, Dept. of  
Community & Economic Development  
Mike Simonson, City of Bethlehem,  
Chief Code Official  
Lawanna Kendricks, The University Club of  
Bethlehem  
Steven Glickman, 29 East Church Street  
Dino Fantozzi, 29 East Church Street  
Gary Dologite, Sun Inn Preservation Assoc.  
Ed Courier, Bethlehem Press  
Rachel A. Galassi, 76 West Market Street

MEMBERS ABSENT

Connie Glagola

STAFF PRESENT

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer  
E-Mail:  
jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com

### **MINUTES:**

There were no comments on the 3 February 2021 Minutes. Upon a motion by Beth Starbuck and second by Marsha Fritz, the minutes were approved unanimously as submitted. The 3 March 2021 meeting of HARB was called to order by Chairperson, Beth Starbuck at 5:00 PM.

**Item #1:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 62 East Market Street proposes to replace five existing windows.

**Property Location:** 62 East Market Street

**Property Owner:** The University Club of Bethlehem

**Applicant:** The University Club of Bethlehem, Lawanna Kendricks

**Proposed work:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 62 East Market Street proposes to replace five existing windows in a second-floor box bay. The applicant has included five different window price quotes from five different suppliers/contractors. The applicant should clarify which window type they are proposing to use for this work.

At our February meeting the Board recommended that the application be tabled and that the applicant should explore the repair/restoration of the windows instead of replacement. The Historic Officer forwarded the names of potential restoration contractors to the applicant, as well as a publication prepared by Preservation Pennsylvania titled, "Considering the Repair, Retrofit, and Replacement of Historic Windows". In the afternoon of the day of this meeting, the applicant submitted a scope of work outline and cost proposal from a preservation/restoration contractor to repair and restore the windows in question. The applicant should clarify their current intent regarding this application.

**Character Defining Features:** The University Club of Bethlehem was organized in 1911 to provide living and dining facilities and serve as a center for social activity for persons attending institutions of higher education in the Lehigh Valley area. They purchased the current residence in May of 1916 from the estate of Herman O Burkhardt, who was a plumber and originally built the mansion in 1890. The corporate charter was registered in July of 1916 and the club became a registered non-profit corporation in 1934.

The residence exhibits a mix of simplified Victorian style elements, including Second Empire, Stick, and Queen Anne.

The main body of the house is a minimally patterned brick that has been painted. The chimney is an ornately patterned brick that has been painted. The roof over the main body of the house is hipped with lower gable roofs that are plugged into the main hip roof. There is a tower that is centered on the front façade which is typical of Second Empire Style Victorians. The tower has a convex, ogee, or "S" curved roof. This contrasts with the other simpler hip and sloping gable

roof forms. The symmetrical gable elements on each side of the central tower are differentiated by the location of a two-story angled bay on the gable element on the right side of the front façade, creating a subtle asymmetry.

The rear and east facades exhibit elements of the Stick Victorian Style. This includes a wood shingle clad box-bay window element, on the second and third floor, over an angled-bay window on the first floor. Horizontal and vertical bands of wood trim are raised from the wall surface of the box-bay for emphasis. The horizontal and vertical wood bands mimic the exposed structural members of half-timbered medieval houses. This highlights the wall surface as a decorative element rather than just a wall plane. Overhanging roof eaves have exposed rafter tails. There is a one story, shed roofed, front porch with a central, front facing gable roof that is aligned with the tower.

Windows are double hung with a variety of muntin patterns. The windows to be replaced on the second floor of the box-bay are 9 light prairie style over 1 light in the center of the bay and 6 over 1 on the two sides of the second-floor bay.

**Discussion:** The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Mr. Phillips reviewed, in brief, each of the six replacement window types included in the application and stated that none of them met the recommendations included in the City of Bethlehem, “Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines”. The Guidelines state in part, that with “window deterioration requiring replacement”, the new windows should be “true divided light replacement windows with an exterior painted finish that match the material, historic size, shape, operation, muntin pattern, profiles, and detailing to the greatest extent possible”. The Historic Officer noted that all of the replacement window types included in the application were either of vinyl construction or incorporated aluminum or vinyl cladding that was in conflict with the Guidelines. Furthermore, Mr. Phillips reviewed the cost of each replacement window type included in the application and the cost stipulated in the repair/restoration quote provided. The cost of repair/restoration falls within the cost range of the replacement windows.

The Historic Officer asked the applicant to clarify her current intent regarding this application and whether she was requesting reconsideration of replacement windows or repair/restoration. The applicant advised that she would just like the windows to be safe and operable and that she was willing to move forward with the repair/restoration of the windows. Marsha Fritz asked the applicant to include exterior storm windows as part of the repair/restoration. The applicant advised that the windows currently have exterior storm windows and that it is her intent to keep them in place. Ms. Fritz asked the applicant to paint the storm windows a color that matches the existing color scheme of the house. The applicant agreed to this. Beth Starbuck asked the applicant to refit the storm windows so that they fit snugly in their openings. Marsha Fritz thanked the applicant for her time, effort and research to locate a restoration contractor and her willingness to undertake the restoration. Ms. Fritz further stated that the applicant did not need to hire the particular restoration contractor submitted, but if other cost proposals were

solicited, they should be checked carefully to be sure the scope of work matched the submitted proposal.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the repair/restoration of five existing double hung windows and exterior storm windows in a second-floor box bay.**

**Motion:** Dianna Hodgson made a motion to approve the repair/restoration of five existing double hung windows and exterior storm windows in a second-floor box bay, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, and with the following conditions.

1. The scope of work shall be, at a minimum, as outlined in the proposal prepared by Building Preservation Services, LLC and submitted by the applicant.
2. The storm windows shall be adjusted and refit so that they fit snugly in their openings.
3. The windows and storm windows shall be painted a color that matches the existing color scheme of the house.

**Second:** Fred Bonsall

**Result of vote:** The vote was unanimous to approve the repair/restoration of five existing double hung windows and exterior storm windows in a second-floor box bay, as per the motion.

**Item #2:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 29 East Church Street proposes to replace two garage doors and a man-door on the rear garage with added light fixtures.

**Property Location:** 29 East Church Street

**Property Owner:** Dino Fantozzi

**Applicant:** Steve Glickman, Architect

**Proposed work:** The existing masonry and wood framed garage building has 3 swing type garage doors. The applicant/owner of the property located at 29 East Church Street proposes to modify the existing three openings and install two modern overhead garage doors of similar historic styling and a centered man-door between two new brick piers to match the existing brickwork. Two cast metal arm and glass globe light fixtures are proposed to be located on the existing brick piers at each end of the building. The existing woodwork above the doors will remain and the new doors will be painted in the existing color scheme.

**Character Defining Features:** This structure is a one-story accessory garage building with a mono-pitched roof sloping away from Wesley Street. The building structure is a combination of

concrete masonry with brick veneer. The street elevation consists of brick piers with wood frame bearing walls above the garage doors. Character defining elements include two-leaf, hinged, swinging, wood garage doors. Each individual leaf has three solid wood panels below a six light wood window on the upper portion of the door. The siding above the garage doors appears to be beaded wood "roofer" boards. The wood rafter tails are exposed under a shallow roof overhang. The exposed sidewalls of the garage are brick veneer without any openings. The garage doors are the primary character defining element of this structure. The lower solid panel and upper glazed panel proportions of the proposed doors are significantly different than those of the existing doors. The applicant should clarify door and hardware material.

**Discussion:** The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Steven Glickman, Architect and applicant advised that the proposed doors are modern upward acting garage doors and because of industry standard horizontal panel size, the solid and glass panels cannot be the same proportion as the existing hinged doors. However, the hardware can be similar to the existing hardware. Marsha Fritz asked if the proposed wider doors were required by the size of today's vehicles and the applicant responded in the affirmative. Ms. Fritz noted that there is not a lot of parking available on the street and that Wesley Street is very narrow. Ms. Fritz stated that if the garage is made useable, it will provide needed parking for the applicant and open up parking on the street. Therefore, she feels that the width and proportion of the proposed doors is a reasonable compromise for the tight access conditions that exist. Ms. Fritz asked what condition the existing garage is in. The applicant advised that the garage is in generally sound condition. Ms. Fritz asked if the existing brick could be removed and reused for the proposed new piers. The applicant stated that this is the hope, but some new brick may be required for the new piers. The applicant further advised that the doors currently existing may be replacements and not original to the building. Ms. Fritz stated that she does not like fake, nonfunctional hardware and would prefer the only hardware to be a simple handle/pull at the bottom of the door. Diann Hodgson asked if the existing hinges could be installed on the new doors. The applicant advised that the new doors are a cellular wood material over the structural door panel and that the existing hinges could be installed on the new doors in a nonfunctioning manner. Marsha Fritz asked what type door hardware was proposed for the man door. The applicant responded that the man door would receive a vertical iron loop with a key cylinder. Ms. Fritz asked if the existing basketball backstop and hoop are going to remain in place. The applicant responded in the affirmative. Ms. Fritz stated that the lighting fixtures proposed and included in the application are not appropriate to a simple building of this nature. She feels that a smaller lantern type fixture would be more appropriate. She recommended a fixture more appropriate to the age of the building or a simple can light. Connie Postupack stated that she felt a lantern style fixture would be more appropriate to this specific installation since a lantern style fixture would cast more light onto the street which tends to be very dark at night.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two garage doors and a man-door on the rear garage building with added light fixtures.**

**Motion:** Connie Postupack made a motion to approve the installation of two garage doors and a man-door on the rear garage building with added light fixtures, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, and with the following conditions.

1. The lighting fixtures will be lantern type lighting fixtures similar to those shown in an image on page 6 of 8 of the application. The applicant will submit product information for the proposed lighting fixture to the Historic Office for review and approval.
2. The existing garage door hinges will be installed on the new garage doors in a nonfunctioning manner.
3. The applicant must submit manufacturer's product data for the proposed man door hardware to the Historic Officer for review and approval.

**Second:** Derrick Clark

**Result of vote:** The vote was unanimous to approve the installation of two garage doors and a man-door on the rear garage building with added light fixtures, as per the motion.

**Item #3:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 76 West Market Street proposes to replace four existing attic windows.

**Property Location:** 76 West Market Street

**Property Owner:** The Estate of Janice K. Galassi

**Applicant:** Rachel A. Galassi

**Proposed work:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 76 West Market Street proposes to replace four existing third floor attic windows in order to better the property in aesthetics and energy efficiency. The existing windows have broken panes of glass and rotted wood. Information has been provided on three models of Pella windows, as well as Andersen 400 Series WoodWright double-hung windows. The existing windows are four light over one light.

**Character Defining Features:** The existing structure is one-half story out of grade plus two main floors and an attic made habitable by three dormers on the side-gabled roof. The existing colonial revival building was constructed in the 1760's and has been greatly altered in the subsequent time period. A stucco finish conceals many of the alterations. The building was originally built as a residence for William Boehler and was enlarged in 1812 with an addition to the west, which is 78 West Market Street. At some point the structure was altered and renovated into a duplex residential unit. Character defining elements include a sweeping double stair that climbs one-half story above street level to a covered entrance for each of the duplex units. The

hipped porch roof is supported by wood brackets. The street façade shows symmetrically balanced double hung windows. First floor windows are six over one, second floor windows are two over two, and the attic windows are four over one.

**Discussion:** The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Marsha Fritz gave a description and overview of the discussion and action related Agenda Item #1, 62 East Market Street. Ms. Fritz noted that the building in general needs a great deal of maintenance so that its condition doesn't get worse and the windows are just one of the many items needing repair/restoration. Ms. Fritz recommended that the applicant prioritize the required repairs in coordination with their overall plan for the building. The applicant advised that the building is currently in her mother's estate and that the estate would like to sell the building. Ms. Fritz recommended that the applicant repair/restore the windows that are the subject of this application and add exterior storm windows. Beth Starbuck noted that the old, hard-growth wood of the existing windows will last for years if properly repaired/restored and maintained over time. The applicant referred to a Pella Window representative who attended with her. The Pella representative explained the characteristics and attributes of the replacement windows he was recommending. After further discussion by HARB and the applicant, the applicant agreed to repair/restore the four attic windows and add exterior storm windows. The Historic Officer agreed to forward the names of potential restoration contractors to the applicant from the Window Preservation Alliance, as well as a publication prepared by Preservation Pennsylvania titled, "Considering the Repair, Retrofit, and Replacement of Historic Windows". Beth Starbuck thanked the applicant for agreeing to repair/restore the windows and reiterated that the windows appear to be relatively easily repairable.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the repair/restoration of four existing third floor attic windows and the installation of exterior storm windows.**

**Motion:** Fred Bonsall made a motion to approve the repair/restoration of four existing third floor attic windows and the installation of exterior storm windows, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, and with the following conditions.

1. Either wooden or metal storm windows are acceptable.
2. The windows and storm windows shall be painted a color that matches the existing color scheme of the house.

**Second:** Dianna Hodgson

**Result of vote:** The vote was unanimous to approve the repair/restoration of four existing third floor attic windows and the installation of exterior storm windows, as per the motion.

**Item #4:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 91-97 West Broad Street proposes to replace an existing fire escape.

**Property Location:** 91-97 West Broad Street

**Property Owner:** Sun Inn Preservation Association

**Applicant:** Gary Dologite

**Proposed work:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 91-97 West Broad Street proposes to replace an existing fire escape with in-kind materials. The proposed work is at the back of the building and will be seen at a distance from Main Street. The location of the stair is on a non-descript one story section at the rear of the building.

**Character Defining Features:** The existing structures are two and one-half story and three stories as they face West Broad Street. The existing structures were built in the 1870's and 1880's and house ground floor shops with living units above. The Greek Revival & Italianate structures were built around the Sun Inn during the commercial expansion of the downtown area in the late nineteenth century. However, the area of the proposed work is very utilitarian and has little or no character defining elements.

**Discussion:** The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Marsha Fritz noted that there are two fire escapes in the photograph included in the application and asked the applicant which fire escape was the subject of this application. The applicant clarified that the fire escape in the foreground, which extends from grade to the second floor, is the subject of this application. Ms. Fritz questioned the age of the fire escape and the applicant advised that he believed it was approximately 10 years old. Ms. Fritz asked if the fire escape was allowed by building code and if a permit was granted for its construction. The applicant responded in the affirmative. Ms. Fritz expressed her concern for its pressure treated wood construction since it is at a very visible location at the back of the Sun Inn Courtyard. Connie Postupack asked if the applicant was proposing to just replace the handrails or if it was also proposed to replace the steps. The applicant advised that the fire escape would be replaced in its entirety. Fred Bonsall asked if the existing and proposed finish was to be weathered or painted. The applicant responded that the existing fire escape is natural/weathered and it is proposed to paint/stain the new fire escape. Marsha Fritz recommended a solid color stain after the pressure treated wood has aged for a year or so. Ms. Fritz also recommended that the 2"x4" wood member shown under the interior of the cap rail be moved to the exterior of the wood spindles to provide for better scale and proportions. Beth Starbuck asked if the 2"x6" cap rail was in accordance with Code. Mike Simonson advised that it does not meet the code requirements for a handrail because it is not graspable. Marsha Fritz asked the applicant if he had priced a metal fire escape. The applicant advised that he had not. Ms. Fritz asked the applicant if they would rethink their solution and resubmit at a later date. The applicant advised that this project has been in the works for some time and that he would like to gain approval so that it can be completed. Joe

Phillips suggested the installation of a planting or green screen in front of the fire escape to enhance the appearance from the Sun Inn Courtyard. Marsha Fritz stated that she has been disappointed in the screening of the emergency generator for the Sun Inn. Beth Starbuck advised HARB that the applicant is not proposing an in-kind replacement and that the details of the existing fire escape are more appropriate than those being proposed on the drawings included in the application. Ms. Fritz asked the applicant if he would be willing to refine the details and resubmit the project for review next month. The applicant reiterated that he would like to get the project completed and stated that he would be willing to commit to staining the fire escape within the next two years and resubmit to HARB for stain color approval prior to staining.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of an existing fire escape with in-kind materials.**

**Motion:**

Marsha Fritz made a motion to approve the replacement of an existing fire escape with in-kind materials, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, and with the following conditions.

1. The applicant will utilize pressure treated wood.
2. The rise and run of the stair will match the existing and be in compliance with applicable building codes.
3. The applicant will return to HARB within two years for approval of a stain color prior to staining.
4. The construction details of the fire escape will be revised to move the 2"x4" wood member under the 2"x6" cap rail to the outside of the spindles and a 1"x4" wood member will be installed on the interior of the spindles and under the 2"x6" cap rail.
5. The applicant will work with the building code official to agree upon the installation of a graspable, code compliant handrail.
6. All handrails, guardrails, spindles and other elements will be installed in accordance with applicable building codes.
7. The applicant will endeavor to use the stair as an aesthetically pleasing asset/element as viewed from the Sun Inn Courtyard by the use of plantings or other aesthetic treatments.

**Second:**

Connie Postupack

**Result of vote:**

The vote was unanimous to approve the replacement of an existing fire escape with in-kind materials, as per the motion.

Other Discussion

Beth Starbuck advised that she is working on revisions to the By-Laws that reflect the current election of a Chair and Vice Chair at the January meeting of each year. Furthermore, she is looking for the "Period of Significance" for the Historic District and would like to also include this information in the By-Laws. She will email a copy of the proposed revisions to all HARB members when she completes them.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:39 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "H. Joseph Phillips". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looped initial "H".

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA  
Historic Officer