

CITY OF BETHLEHEM

HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

DATE: 1 September 2021

APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD

Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.

Submit original plus 10 copies.

HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION

MEMBERS PRESENT

Beth Starbuck
Marsha Fritz
Diana Hodgson
Connie Postupack
Michael Simonson

VISITORS PRESENT/Virtual Attendance

Wilma Rosario, City of Bethlehem, Admin.
Assistant of Planning and Zoning
Helen & Keith Smith
Barry Pell, Central Moravian Church
Sean Burke, 213-215-217 West Broad Street
Ed Courrier, Bethlehem Press

MEMBERS ABSENT

Derrick Clark
Fred Bonsall
Rodman Young
Joe McGavin

STAFF PRESENT

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer
E-Mail:
jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com

MINUTES

There were no comments on the 7 July 2021 Minutes and the minutes were approved unanimously as submitted. The 1 September 2021 meeting of HARB was called to order by Vice Chairperson, Marsha Fritz at 5:00 PM.

Item #1: The applicant/owner of the property located at 56 West Market Street proposes to replace a simple address/street number with an address sign stating the street number and street name.

Property Location: 56 West Market Street

Property Owner: Market Street Condominium Association

Applicant: Market Street Condominium Association

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 56 West Market Street proposes to replace a simple address/street number with an address sign stating the street number and street name. The sign has a rectangular base section containing the street name and a central rounded arch containing the street number.

Character Defining Features: The sign is proposed to be located above a segmental arched brick entry. This entry portal is located in an approximately eight-foot-tall brick wall with brick banding and a brick cap detail. The wall defines the courtyard of the condominium complex. The opening contains an ornamental wrought iron gate. The arch of the proposed sign is a round arch while the arch of the brick entry is segmental. This creates an uncomfortable juxtaposition and tension between the two. The new sign should be carefully proportioned so that it doesn't appear too crowded in that space.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project and stated his concern with the uncomfortable juxtaposition and tension between the round arch of the proposed sign and the segmental arch of the brick entry wall. The applicant explained that the existing small street numbers are hard to read and that they would like to provide clarity with the larger sign. Marsha Fritz agreed that clarity of the street number would be helpful, but echoed Mr. Phillips' concern with the juxtaposition of the round and segmental arches. She also felt that if included in a sign, the numbers would still be too small to provide the proper clarity and asked if the applicant had considered enlarging the numbers only. The applicant agree that this could be done. Mike Simonson advised that code requires the numbers to be four inches tall and clearly differentiate themselves from the background. Ms. Fritz asked if the sign came with a segmental arched top. The applicant did not know the answer to this and asked what HARB would suggest. Ms. Fritz responded that the applicant could mirror the arch on the sign with the arch on the brick opening, install larger numbers mounted to the wall without the rest of the sign, or use text that mirrored the curve of the brick arch to spell out fifty-six. Beth Starbuck noted that a rectangular sign containing numbers was another possible solution. The applicant remarked that larger numbers would probably be her preference. Ms. Fritz further advised the applicant that the numbers must be of a serif font and must be installed/attached in the mortar joints and not into the face of the brick. The applicant indicated that she understood and was in agreement with this.

The HARB recommended to table any formal decision on this application and that the applicant come back to HARB at the next meeting for final review and approval of the larger individual numbers. The applicant agreed with this.

Motion: Diana Hodgson made a motion that the applicant come back to HARB at the next meeting for final review and approval of the larger individual numbers, in accordance with the discussion outlined above.

Second: Marsha Fritz

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous that the applicant come back to HARB at the next meeting for final review and approval of the larger individual numbers, as per the motion.

Item #2: The applicant/owner of the property located at 415 High Street proposes to replace slate shingles on a rear, two car garage building with GAF Slateline asphalt shingles.

Property Location: 415 High Street

Property Owner: Mary Louise Brion

Applicant: Paul Wright Roofing

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 415 High Street proposes to replace slate shingles on a rear, hipped roof, two car garage building with GAF Slateline asphalt shingles. Existing, white aluminum, half round gutters and round downspouts are to remain. The garage fronts on and is visible from Wesley Street.

Character Defining Features: The garage is constructed of brick with relatively high, but simple, frieze and cornice trim. All four sides of the pyramidal hipped roof structure are fitted with white aluminum gutters and downspouts. The North, Wesley Street Façade is fitted with two carriage style garage doors each having two six light windows. The East façade, facing the main residence, is fitted with a six over one, double hung window and a door containing a nine light upper glass section.

Discussion: Neither the owner nor the applicant was present to present the application. Therefore, this application was tabled until a future HARB Meeting when the owner and/or applicant is present to present the application.

Item #3: The applicant/owner of the property located at 40 West Church Street proposes to install hoods over three lower-level doors, as well as wood brackets and new lighting.

Property Location: 40 West Church Street
Property Owner: Central Moravian Church

Applicant: Barry Pell

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 40 West Church Street proposes to install hoods over three lower-level doors on the East, West, and South elevations of the Central Moravian Church's Christian Education Building to provide cover at each entry. Slate shingles, to match existing roofs, will be installed on the roofs of the hoods and roof to wall flashing will be copper. Wood brackets, fascias, and trims will be detailed to be in keeping with existing Neo-Federal Style, 1960's renovation/addition and will be painted to match the existing trim. New lighting will be recessed in the wood soffits and the existing emergency lighting will be repositioned and the existing wall hung lanterns will be removed.

Character Defining Features: The original brick structure was constructed in 1902. The areas of proposed work are located on the 1960's Neo-Federal Style renovation/addition to the existing structure. Character defining features include a lower level, one story, heavy stone base and brick upper stories. The corners of the brick façade are quoined. The second story is topped with a heavy frieze and cornice. The doors at the proposed hood locations are six panel, solid wood doors. The Southside door has six light sidelights on both sides of it. The intersecting, low sloped, gable roofs are clad in slate. Window openings utilize brick heads with keystones and heavy sills. The west façade contains a grouping of three arched, brick openings with rectangular windows on the main floor and circle topped windows on the second floor. There is a round or circular window located in the brick gabled pediment with a brick surround and keystones at its quarter points.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Marsha Fritz asked the applicant if he had anything to add and the applicant did not. Ms. Fritz stated that she feels the solution proposed is a good and appropriate solution. The applicant confirmed that the hood/roof proposed for the west façade would not conflict with the existing window on the side wall. Ms. Fritz asked if the applicant was proposing a star design on the side elevation of the hood. The applicant responded in the affirmative. Diana Hodgson asked if the star would be painted or carved and the applicant advised that the star would be applied or incised and then painted. Ms. Hodgson asked how many lighting fixtures would be located at each hood and the applicant advised that a single recessed lighting fixture would be located in the underside/soffit of each hood. Ms. Fritz asked the applicant to consider making the lighting over the entrance door to the Zinzendorf Parlor brighter so that it would be easily recognizable at night and the applicant agreed to take this into consideration.

Beth Starbuck advised that 3,000 Kelvin is the preferred color of lighting that most closely approximates incandescent lighting and is not a measure of brightness.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of hoods over three lower-level doors on the East, West, and South elevations of the Central Moravian Church's Christian Education Building to provide cover at each entry.

Motion: Beth Starbuck made a motion to approve the installation of hoods over three lower-level doors on the East, West, and South elevations of the Central Moravian Church's Christian Education Building to provide cover at each entry as depicted in the application, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, and with the following conditions.

1. Slate shingles, to match existing roofs, will be installed on the roofs of the hoods and roof to wall flashing will be copper.
2. Wood brackets, fascias, and trims will be detailed to be in keeping with existing Neo-Federal Style, 1960's renovation/addition and will be painted to match the existing trim.
3. New lighting will be recessed in the wood soffits and the existing emergency lighting will be repositioned and the existing wall hung lanterns will be removed.

Second: Michael Simonson

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the installation of hoods over three lower-level doors on the East, West, and South elevations of the Central Moravian Church's Christian Education Building to provide cover at each entry, as per the motion.

Item #4: The applicant/owner of the property located at 213-215-217 West Broad Street proposes to install wood handrails on the second story roof for emergency egress from the third floor.

Property Location: 213-215-217 West Broad Street

Property Owner: George Persin

Applicant: Sean Burke, Equinox Property Management, Inc.

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 213-215-217 West Broad Street proposes to install wood handrails on the second story roof for emergency egress from the third floor. The purpose of the wood handrails is to guide and protect occupants in an emergency egress situation from the third floor. The proposed wood handrails will run from an existing third floor egress door, across the minimally sloped roof and connect to an existing metal fire escape/stair. The construction and details of the proposed wood handrails is similar to the existing handrails located at the porch and access ramp at the Southwest, rear corner of the building.

Character Defining Features: With the exception of the concave pitched mansard roof and its hooded windows, which are minimally visible when viewed from the rear parking area, there are little to no character defining features remaining on the rear of this building that has had windows bricked-in and a fire escape installed that dominates the aesthetics of the rear of the building. From the Broad Street Façade, the structure is a nice example of a simplified Italianate / Second Empire (Early Victorian) Style Building characterized by a concave pitched mansard roof, dormer windows with hoods and trim surrounds, and deep, but simplified cornice and frieze trim. The simple, flat brick walls are quoined at the corners. The first and second floor windows have shallow arched tops with arched brick heads and heavy sills. A low-sloped, hipped roof porch is located centrally on the main building façade.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project and stated that he would be recusing himself from discussion on the project because he has business dealings with Lee Architectural Associates, and specifically John Lee, who prepared the drawings included in this application. Marsha Fritz asked Mike Simonson if he would like to react to this application since it involved building codes and exiting from a building. The applicant advised that the need for railings on the “flat” roof came to light during a city inspection of the building. The applicant further advised that there are four apartments on the third floor. Diana Hodgson asked if the roofing material was rubber or shingles. The applicant advised that the existing roof is comprised of six layers of built-up asphalt and that the proposed new roof would utilize rubber roofing. Mike Simonson advised that the slope of the roof must be minimal to the fire escape at the rear wall of the building. The applicant advised that the roof pitch is very shallow. Ms. Fritz asked if there are other railings, similar in detail to the railings being proposed, on other areas of the building. The applicant responded that there are similarly detailed existing railings on the building and provided photographs showing this. The applicant also noted that the new roof and railing system on the roof would be very difficult to see from the parking area and adjacent alley and that the railings would be painted a color to match the building. Ms. Fritz concurred that the new railing system will be minimally visible from the parking area and adjacent alley and that the proposed railing is required by the building code to provide safety for exiting in the case of an emergency. Ms. Fritz feels that the railing proposed appears to be a reasonable solution. Mr. Simonson advised the applicant that the railing needs to have a

greppable handrail and that the applicant must submit the required building permit application and drawings/documents to the Building Codes Department for review, approval, and issuance of a Building Permit. The applicant agreed to do so.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of wood handrails on the second story roof for emergency egress from the third floor.

Motion: Diana Hodgson made a motion to approve the installation of wood handrails on the second story roof for emergency egress from the third floor as proposed and submitted, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, and with the following conditions.

1. The applicant must submit the required building permit application and drawings/documents to the Building Codes Department for review, approval, and issuance of a Building Permit.

Second: Connie Postupack

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the installation of wood handrails on the second story roof for emergency egress from the third floor, as per the motion.

Item #5: The applicant/owner of the property located at 231 East Church Street proposes to replace the upper front and rear roofs with GAF Sovereign 25 Year Silver Lining fiberglass shingles.

Property Location: 231 East Church Street

Property Owner: John & Charlotte McGorry

Applicant: John & Charlotte McGorry

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 231 East Church Street proposes to replace the upper front and rear roofs with GAF Sovereign 25 Year Silver Lining fiberglass shingles. (It is said that this is an in-kind replacement.) Aluminum drip edge will be installed at the roof perimeter and new vent pipe flanges will be installed to replace the existing vent pipe flanges. Seal-a-ridge hip and ridge shingles will be installed over the Cobra Snow Country Ridge Vent. The home is the right side of a twin/duplex structure. The home to the left appears to have the same shingle type and color as the property in question. It also looks like there is a single, continuous "K" type gutter that runs the full length of both homes and has rectangular downspouts at each end. The existing gutter and downspouts will remain.

Character Defining Features: The two-story structure has a side facing gabled roof with a prefinished aluminum soffit and fascia. A single continuous “K” type gutter, with rectangular downspouts at each end, runs the full length of both of the attached homes. A brick chimney penetrates the roof at each end of the duplex structure. There are two six over six double hung windows on the second floor and one six over six double hung window on the first floor. The second-floor windows are fitted with louvered shutters and the first-floor window is fitted with raised panel shutters. All windows are fitted with a heavy head trim. The front door breaks symmetry and is fitted with a heavy, scalloped head trim and fluted pilasters. The door itself is a six paneled solid door. The main level of the home is raised one half level above the street and is accessed by simple concrete steps and a landing fitted with simple pipe rails painted black. The facades of the home are clad in horizontal siding.

Discussion: Neither an owner or applicant were present to present the application. Therefore, this application was tabled until a future HARB Meeting when the owner and/or applicant is present to present the application.

Other Business:

Marsha Fritz advised HARB Members of the following.

1. There will be a virtual PHMC Training Workshop on October 5th and 7th in the evening. All members are encouraged to attend.
2. PHMC distributes a monthly newsletter and other educational, virtual workshops that members are encouraged to take advantage of.
3. This will be the last HARB Meeting that will allow for virtual attendance. All future HARB and other city meetings will be in-person.
4. As of the September HARB Meeting, Mike Simonson is now an official, voting member of HARB.
5. The Bi-Laws amendments proposed, reviewed, and passed at the July HARB meeting have been approved by the City Solicitor as discussed at the July HARB Meeting. Mike Simonson will forward a final copy of the amended Bi-Laws to all HARB Members and the Historic Office for their record and reference.

There being no further business, the vote was unanimous to adjourn the meeting at 5:45 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



H. Joseph Phillips, AIA
Historic Officer