

RESOLUTION NO. 2025-_____

RE: CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS UNDER THE PROVISIONS
OF THE ACT OF PENNSYLVANIA LEGISLATURE 1961, JUNE 13, P.
L. 282 (53 SECTION 8004) AND BETHLEHEM ORDINANCE NO. 3952
AS AMENDED.

The applicant/owner of the property located at 555 Main Street proposes to construct additional stories above the existing building.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Bethlehem that a Certificate of Appropriateness is hereby DENIED for the proposal.

Sponsored by: /s/ _____

/s/ _____

ADOPTED BY THE COUNCIL THIS _____ DAY OF _____, 2025.

/s/ _____
President of Council

ATTEST:

/s/ _____
City Clerk

HISTORICAL & ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

APPLICATION #1: The applicant/owner of the property located at 555 Main Street proposes to construct additional stories above the existing building.

OWNER: Rubel Street II, L. P.
555 Main Street
Bethlehem, PA 18018

The Board upon motion by Connie Postupack and seconded by Joseph McGavin adopted the proposal that City Council DENY a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of two additional stories set back from the existing two-story façade that fronts Main Street and three additional stories at the rear of the building that fronts Rubel Street, with the following citations;

1. Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines, page 16, Compatible Design Principles for Additions & New Building Construction, including but not limited to the following:

(1) Scale: Height & Width - Proportions and size of the addition/new building compared with existing building/neighboring buildings.

(2) Building Form & Massing - Three-dimensional relationship and configuration of the addition/new building footprint, its walls and roof compared with existing building/neighboring buildings.

2. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

#1 A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

#3 Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties will not be undertaken.

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Additional Comment/

Discussion:

Michael Simonson stated that the Applicant has made the revisions requested by HARB at the December 2024 Meeting and asked why HARB did not bring up the Secretary of Interior's Standards citations at the December Meeting. Connie Postupack responded that the setback of the addition was discussed at the December Meeting. Diana Hodgson reminded the Applicant that, at the December Meeting, she asked if the building addition could be reduced by one story and she was told by the Applicant that this was not feasible. The Applicant stated that HARB has

had multiple opportunities for the building massing to be mentioned and it has not been brought up until this time.

The vote was 3 yes to 1 no to deny construction of two additional stories set back from the existing two-story façade that fronts Main Street and three additional stories at the rear of the building that fronts Rubel Street, as per the motion.

Result of roll call vote to deny this Application.

Connie Postupack: Yes

Diana Hodgson: Yes

Joseph McGavin: Yes

Michael Simonson: No

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#1 A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

#2 The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

#3 Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties will not be undertaken.

#5 Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

#6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired

Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District – It is the purpose and intent of the City of Bethlehem to promote, protect, enhance, and preserve historical resources and traditional

community character for the educational, cultural, economic, and general welfare of the public through the preservation, protection, and regulation of buildings and areas of historical interest or importance within the City

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 16: Compatible Design Principles for Additions & New Building Construction, including, but not limited to, the following:

- (1) Scale: Height & Width - Proportions and size of the addition/new building compared with existing building/neighboring buildings.
- (2) Building Form & Massing - Three-dimensional relationship and configuration of the addition/new building footprint, its walls and roof compared with existing building/neighboring buildings.
- (3) Setback: Yards (Front, Side, and Rear) - Distance of the addition/new building to the street and property lines when compared with the existing building or other buildings on the block.
- (4) Site Coverage - Percentage of the site that is covered by addition/new building compared to comparable nearby sites.
- (5) Orientation - The location of the addition/new building and its principal entrance relative to other buildings on the block.
- (6) Architectural Elements and Projections - The size, shape, proportions, and location of doors, porches, balconies, chimneys, dormers, parapets, and elements that contribute to an overall building's shape and silhouette relative to neighboring buildings.
- (7) Alignment, Rhythm, and Spacing - The effect the addition/new building will have on the existing street patterns.
- (8) Façade Proportions: Window and Door Patterns - The relationship of the size, shape, and location of the addition/new building façade and building elements to each other, as well as to other buildings on the existing building/block.
- (9) Trim and Detail - The moldings, decorative elements, and features of a building that are secondary to major surfaces such as walls and roofs and how they related to the existing and neighboring buildings.
- (10) Materials - The products with which something is composed or constructed and how they related to the existing and neighboring buildings.

Together with the Secretary of Interior's Standards, these Design Guidelines establish a framework of encouraging additions to existing buildings and new construction that are sensitive to neighboring spatial relationships, forms, and materials while differentiating new construction from historical building fabric.

Page 8: Exterior Woodwork & Siding:

The HARB encourages,

- Regularly maintaining and repainting exterior woodwork including repainting, and addressing potential areas of moisture including clogged gutters and downspouts, groundwater, leaky pipes, and interior condensation
- Retaining decorative woodwork since it is a character defining element that can be difficult to replace

- Repairing smaller areas of deterioration by reinforcing or patching – small cracks and checks can be repaired with an exterior wood filler, glue, or epoxy – Loose elements can be refastened with nailing or drilling and screwing
- Selectively replacing deteriorated wood elements that are beyond repair with wood pieces that match the size, profile, exposure and pattern, and character of the historic wood element – Wood filler in the joints between the new and old wood will help provide a smooth finish
- Large scale or significant replacement of exterior wood siding with paintable material that match the size, profile, exposure, pattern, and character of the historic wood

The HARB discourages,

- Removing or encapsulating with vinyl or aluminum siding, trim, decorative features, and trim elements such as brackets, spindles, cornices, columns, posts, etc.
- Vinyl or aluminum siding over wood, brick, stone, or stucco
- Wood grained, wavy edged, vertical, and textured plywood simulated siding
- Installing non-wood trim

Page 9: Masonry & Stucco:

Exterior masonry, including stone, brick, terra cotta, and stucco, provides a strong, durable, and attractive appearance with relatively low maintenance. Historic masonry walls tend to protect a building's interior from weather and act as the principal load bearing system. Aesthetically it acts as an important design feature, helping to define a building's style and add visual interest to the streetscape.

Mortar: Mortar, which bonds masonry units, was generally composed of a few ingredients: sand, lime, and water, and possibly additives such as animal hair or oyster shells. Starting in the mid-19th century, a small amount of Portland cement was added into the mix to improve the workability and hasten the setting time. In the early 20th century, Portland cement in mortar was increased, corresponding with the manufacture of harder bricks.

The HARB encourages,

- Regular maintenance, repair and selectively repointing deteriorated areas with compatible mortar in material, hardness, composition, color, joint style. Incompatible mortar is often too hard and can lead to spalling or chipping of the bricks or stones, it can also be visually mismatched.
- Installing fasteners for signs and other devices into mortar joints rather than brick or stone faces
- Installing local stone and pointing with ribbon joints

The HARB discourages,

- Using Portland cement-based mortar for repointing – it is typically too hard for most historic masonry and can result in damage, including spalling

Stucco: Stucco is a relatively inexpensive material that can provide a more finished appearance to brick, stone, or wood framed buildings. In some cases, the surface was scored to look like stone. It acts as a weather repellent coating, protecting the building from the elements including rain, sunlight, and wind, and can moderately increase its fire resistance. Stucco can also provide an insulating layer to a wall, reducing the passage of air to the interior.

The HARB encourages,

- Matching the color and texture of historic stucco when repairing or applying stucco to new construction

The HARB discourages,

- Installing stucco over brick, stone, or terra cotta walls
- Installing artificial stucco (EIFS Exterior Insulation and Finish Systems) which can trap moisture within the thickness of a wall and cause long-term damage

Masonry & Stucco Cleaning: Appropriate masonry and stucco cleaning can enhance the character and overall appearance of a building. However, improper cleaning of historic masonry can cause damage to the historic surfaces and cause more harm than good both physically and aesthetically.

The HARB encourages,

- Cleaning masonry and stucco with the gentlest means possible, typically low-pressure water, with the possible use of a gentle detergent and brushing

The HARB discourages,

- Masonry cleaning unless a building is heavily soiled
- Masonry and stucco cleaning with harsh chemicals, sand blasting, power washing over 400 psi, grinders, or metal brushes

Masonry Coatings & Paint: Water repellent and waterproof coatings, which include paint, are generally applied to prevent water from entering a masonry and stucco wall, but tend to be unnecessary on weather-tight historic buildings. Water tends to enter masonry buildings through open mortar joints, surface cracks and areas of poor or deferred maintenance. In instances where the surface of the masonry has been severely compromised, such as at sandblasted brick, the use of water repellent coatings might be appropriate.

The HARB discourages,

- Applying water repellent or waterproof coatings
- Painting of previously unpainted masonry or stucco

Page 10: Windows:

The HARB encourages,

- If the applicant can demonstrate evidence of window deterioration requiring replacement, installing true divided lite replacement windows with an exterior painted finish that match the material, historic size, shape, operation, muntin pattern, profiles, and detailing to the greatest extent possible

The HARB discourages,

- Decreasing, increasing, or altering window size, shape, or operation to allow for installation of stock window sizes or picture windows
- Encasing or capping window surrounds with aluminum or vinyl
- New window openings at publicly visible elevations
- Installing tinted or colored glazing

- Installing vinyl or aluminum-clad replacement windows at window openings that are visible from a public right-of-way

Page 8: Paint

The HARB encourages,

- Hand washing with mild detergent and bristle brush, hand scraping, and hand sanding

The HARB discourages,

- Rotary tools – disks can leave circular marks and wires can tear into the surface
- Heat guns and heat plate – can ignite paint or underlying surface if left in one location too long
- Chemical paint removers – can raise grains, be expensive, and potentially volatile; runoff can be hazardous
- Flame tools, blow torches to soften paint – smoldering sparks can potentially start a fire; lead components in paint can vaporize and create highly toxic fumes
- Sandblasting – can be abrasive to surface, wear away protective exterior coating, and raise the wood grain
- High-pressure water wash – forces water into open joints affecting interior finishes and structural framing; can be abrasive to exterior surface and raise the grain

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work does not conform with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have a negative impact to the historic district.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "H. Joseph Phillips". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Date of Meeting: January 8, 2025

By: **H. Joseph Phillips**
Title: **Historic Officer**