

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-_____

RE: CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS UNDER THE PROVISIONS
OF THE ACT OF PENNSYLVANIA LEGISLATURE 1961, JUNE 13, P.
L. 282 (53 SECTION 8004) AND BETHLEHEM ORDINANCE NO. 3952
AS AMENDED.

The Applicant/owner of the property located at 33 West Walnut Street proposes to replace the existing Walnut Street Parking Garage with a new parking garage with an alternative/second design that removes 63 spaces from the upper deck and lowers the height of the rear/south façade of the overall garage. All other aspects of the original garage proposal remain the same.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Bethlehem that a Certificate of Appropriateness is hereby DENIED for the proposal.

Sponsored by: /s/ _____

/s/ _____

ADOPTED BY THE COUNCIL THIS _____ DAY OF _____, 2024.

/s/ _____
President of Council

ATTEST:

/s/ _____
City Clerk

HISTORICAL & ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

APPLICATION #1B: The Applicant/owner of the property located at 33 West Walnut Street proposes to replace the existing Walnut Street Parking Garage with a new parking garage with an alternative/second design that removes 63 spaces from the upper deck and lowers the height of the rear/south façade of the overall garage. All other aspects of the original garage proposal remain the same.

OWNER: Bethlehem Parking Authority (Kevin Carrigan, ED)
85 West North Street
Bethlehem, PA 18018

The Board upon motion by Joe McGavin and seconded by Rodman Young adopted the proposal that City Council DENY the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing Walnut Street Parking Garage with a new parking garage with an alternative/second design that removes 63 spaces from the upper deck and lowers the height of the rear/south façade of the overall garage, with the following recommendation;

1. The Applicant revise the Application's design with a building design that utilizes the entire existing site and matches the existing garage's footprint and height profile, calling specific attention to building scale, height, width, form, and massing as outlined in the Guideline Citations included below.

The vote was 4 to 1 to deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing Walnut Street Parking Garage with a new parking garage with an alternative/second design that removes 63 spaces from the upper deck and lowers the height of the rear/south façade of the overall garage, as per the motion.

Connie Postupack	Yes
Diana Hodgson	Yes
Rodman Young	Yes
Joe McGavin	Yes
Michael Simonson	No

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 16: Compatible Design Principles for Additions & New Building Construction, including but not limited to following:

- (1) Scale: Height and Width - Proportions and size of the addition/new building compared with existing building/ neighboring buildings.
- (2) Building Form and Massing - Three-dimensional relationship and configuration of the addition/new building footprint, its walls and roof compared with existing building/neighboring buildings.
- (3) Setback: Yards (Front, Side and Rear) - Distance of the addition/new building to the street and property lines when compared with the existing building or other buildings on block.
- (4) Site Coverage - Percentage of the site that is covered by addition/new building, compared to comparable nearby sites
- (5) Orientation - The location of the front of the addition/new building and its principal entrance relative to other buildings on the block.
- (6) Architectural Elements and Projections - The size, shape, proportions and location of doors, porches, balconies, chimneys, dormers, parapets, and elements that contribute to an overall building's shape and silhouette relative to neighboring buildings.
- (7) Alignment, Rhythm and Spacing - The effect the addition/new building will have on the existing street patterns.
- (8) Façade Proportions: Window and Door Patterns - The relationship of the size, shape and location of the addition/new building façade and building elements to each other, as well as to other buildings on the existing building/block.
- (9) Trim and Detail - The moldings, decorative elements and features of a building that are secondary to major surfaces such as walls and roofs and how they related to the existing and neighboring buildings.
- (10) Materials - The products with which something is composed or constructed and how they related to the existing and neighboring buildings.

Together with the Secretary of Interior's Standards, these Design Guidelines establish a framework of encouraging additions to existing buildings and new construction that is sensitive to neighboring spatial relationships, forms and materials while differentiating new construction from historical building fabric.

Item #1B - Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work does not conform with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have a negative impact to the historic district.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "H. Joseph Phillips". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looped "H" and "P".

Date of Meeting: January 3, 2024

By: **H. Joseph Phillips**
Title: **Historic Officer**