

RESOLUTION NO. 2021-

RE: CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS UNDER THE
PROVISIONS OF THE ACT OF PENNSYLVANIA
LEGISLATURE 1961, JUNE 13, P. L. 282 (53 SECTION 8004)
AND BETHLEHEM ORDINANCE NO. 3952 AS AMENDED.

The applicant/owner of the property located at 223 East Church Street proposes to replace the existing wood porch floor with Azek Porch Vintage Collection Coastline composite material and Remove the existing wood porch railings and spindles.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Bethlehem that a Certificate of Appropriateness is hereby DENIED for the proposal.

Sponsored by: /s/ _____

/s/ _____

ADOPTED BY COUNCIL THIS DAY OF , 2021.

/s/ _____
President of Council

ATTEST:

/s/ _____
City Clerk

HISTORICAL & ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

APPLICATION #1: The applicant/owner of the property located at 223 East Church Street proposes to replace the existing wood porch floor with Azek Porch Vintage Collection Coastline composite material and remove the existing wood porch railings and spindles.

OWNER: Jeffrey A. & Susan F. Parks
223 East Church Street
Bethlehem, PA 18018

Motion #1:

Beth Starbuck made a motion to approve the use of Azek composite porch flooring material with the smooth side facing up and the textured side facing down. The motion was not seconded.

Result of Vote:

This motion died for lack of a second.

Motion #2:

Joe McGavin made a motion, seconded by Rodman Young, to approve the use of Azek composite porch flooring material with the textured side facing up and with a bullnose edge on all three sides of the porch.

Result of Vote:

The vote was split, with three members voting to approve and four members voting to deny the use of Azek composite porch flooring material with the textured side facing up and with a bullnose edge on all three sides of the porch. Therefore, the Motion was denied.

Motion #3:

Marsha Fritz made a motion, seconded by Beth Starbuck, to deny the removal of the porch railings, citing that the porch railings are a significant, contributing feature to the historic character of the home.

Result of Vote:

The vote was split, with five members voting to deny and two members voting to approve the removal of the porch railings, as per the motion. Therefore, the Motion to deny the removal of the porch railings carried.

The Board adopted the proposal that City Council DENY the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing wood porch floor with Azek Porch Vintage Collection Coastline composite material and the removal of the existing wood porch railings and spindles.

Guideline Citation: Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#2 The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

#5 Distinctive features, finishes, (paint) and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

#6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials.

Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

#9 Exterior alterations shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 12: Porches: Because of the importance porches play in the perception of historic buildings and streetscapes, original materials and details should be preserved.

Page 21: To maintain the historic character of a porch, wood decking and steps should be retained; they should not be replaced with concrete. Never remove wood columns or balustrades.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work does not conform with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation or the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have a negative impact on the historic district.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "H. Joseph Phillips". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looped initial "H".

Date of Meeting: November 3, 2021

By: **H. Joseph Phillips**
Title: **Historic Officer**