

BETHLEHEM CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
10 East Church Street - Town Hall  
Bethlehem, Pennsylvania  
Tuesday, February 20, 2024 – 7:00 PM

PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

1. ROLL CALL

President Colón called the meeting to order. Present were Bryan G. Callahan, Grace Crampsie Smith, Hillary G. Kwiatek, Colleen S. Laird, Kiera L. Wilhelm, and Michael G. Colón, 6; absent was Rachel Leon, 1.

President Colón announced that Ms. Leon had a family commitment this evening and could not attend this meeting.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

February 6, 2024

3. PUBLIC COMMENT (on any subject not being voted on this evening – 5 Minute Time Limit)

*Call for Ceasefire, Divestiture of Funds*

Resident Harry Faber offered history on political Zionism and a summary of events and statistics in the Middle East since October 7, 2023. The United States needs to call for a ceasefire in this conflict and to divest funds from Israel and Israel-supporting companies. Mr. Faber said these actions start at the local level with calls for the federal government to take these actions.

*Supports Ceasefire Resolution*

Resident Kelsi Weber asked Council to take a stand on creating pressure calling for a ceasefire in Gaza.

*Runoff Concerns/Reconsider Garage Vote*

Resident Mary Jo Makoul offered gratitude that the City had a contractor repair a broken stormwater pipe and add a fourth storm drain at Grandview Boulevard and Ritter Street; however, the result has alleviated street flooding but promoted flooding of the sidewalk. She added that these storm drains were rendered useless when City trucks during a recent snowstorm plowed the openings shut leaving nowhere for eventual runoff to go. She asked that the City mark these drains similar to fire hydrants so that blockage might be avoided. She also objected to parking along Grandview Boulevard during snowstorms. Ms. Makoul additionally revisited the Walnut Street Garage discussion from the February 6 meeting. She requested that President Colón have the Solicitor review HARB's denial for a Certificate of Appropriateness and that Council reconsider its vote. She believed that federal Standards for Rehabilitation developed in 1995 were not considered.

*Progress Toward Resolving Concerns*

Resident Angela Mitchell thanked Council and the Mayor for helping her to resolve her previously stated issue involving her bed and breakfast. She also thanked Council for connecting her with the right department to address her concerns about garbage and recycling. She is still concerned about odor and other health issues related to garbage in her neighborhood and throughout the City, but she has an appointment set up that she hopes will bring progress. Ms. Mitchell also said she is working with City departments to address busy intersections and speed in the Cherokee Street area.

*Landlord Concerns*

Resident Jo Daniels raised landlord/tenant concerns. She said the property management company for a residence has said it cannot make the repairs until it is authorized to do so by the owners. She also said that a City inspection, despite requiring that the roof be repaired and walls and ceilings be primed and painted, was an incomplete effort that did not look at or note other obvious violations. A citation was issued for the previously stated violations, but Ms. Daniels said that other unsafe conditions are present that have not been noted. She stated concerns for a lack of oversight of the landlords and the public perception that the City is “in cahoots with property management/owners.” She believes the latter is not the case, but is instead the lack of staffing and systems in place. She has raised the issue of landlord notification before but has been told by City officials that contact information can be difficult to obtain. However, she pointed out that Article 1739 §2.6 states that the identity, address, and telephone numbers of a designated manager shall be provided to the City and kept current. She called for a system to review contact lists annually.

*Don't Use Tax Money to Support Israel*

Nia W. presented a letter signed by more than 100 Lehigh Valley artists and community members calling on elected officials to call for an immediate and permanent ceasefire in Gaza. The letter states that the three cities in the Lehigh Valley allow an estimated \$3,114,155 of federal tax money to be sent annually to help arm Israel. Instead, this money should be kept within the community to provide public housing, low-cost healthcare for children, student loan cancellation and more.

*Supports Position*

HARB member Connie Postupack expressed disappointment in Council's First Reading override of the recommended denial of the smaller size option for the Walnut Street Garage. She cited several standards of the U.S. Department of the Interior for historic district guidelines, particularly height standards and incompatible appearance with the neighborhood, that she believes support the HARB's position.

*HARB Did its Job*

HARB member Nic Nikolov, a longtime architect, reminded that members are not random selections but are appointed for their qualifications. He said the building mass does not meet the

character of the neighborhood. He rejected the notion stated at the February 6 Council meeting that HARB did not do its job when reviewing this project.

*Keep the Charm*

HARB member Diana Hodgson said it seems the expertise that members bring to their volunteer positions has been overlooked by Council. She was disappointed by the Council override of HARB's recommendation. She added that the project's urban planners and architects could have come up with a much more acceptable design if they had involved HARB sooner in the process. Losing the charm of the Historic District would affect Bethlehem's future.

*Height Was the Primary Objection*

HARB member Joe McGavin said the height of the garage was the major factor in HARB's recommended rejection of the COAs. The Board's January minutes will show that HARB repeatedly asked the applicant to expand the length of the garage and reduce the height. This would have allowed for the number of requested parking spaces while maintaining the original height. It was not required that the garage stay within its existing footprint. He pointed to the Secretary of Interior's standards and emphasized that the new work of a building shall be compatible with old with historic materials, features and size, scale, proportion, and massing to protect the historic property and its environment. The HARB guidelines mirror these requirements. Mr. McGavin said he asked the applicant to reduce the height and was told there would be no additional changes. He added that the HARB guidelines are those set forth by the City and they should be followed.

*This is a Local Issue*

Resident Allison Mickel compared her ancestral history to current events in Palestine. She anticipated a response that she has heard from other cities: This is not a local issue. She disagreed both because of the use of tax dollars to support this controversial conflict and because of increasing displacement that local municipalities will have to answer to. Consequently, she asked Council to support calling for a ceasefire.

*Speedy Decision Encouraged*

Drew Swedberg, a Moravian University professor, supported the call for a ceasefire. He agreed that this is a local issue, repeating a figure cited earlier that Bethlehem residents collectively send an estimated \$1.9 million annually in federal tax money to help arm Israel. He urged a swift decision by Council because of the humanitarian crisis.

*Enforcement Questioned*

Resident Arthur Curatola objected to the strong enforcement provided by the Bethlehem Parking Authority. He additionally objected to receiving a \$300 fine for passing a school bus with its lights activated. He said he was distracted by a pedestrian. Mr. Curatola said the reality was that the cost of disputing the violation likely would not be money well spent, but the citation received was unfair.

*Pass a Resolution*

Yashera Veras said she is not Palestinian, but she speaks out on the situation in the Middle East. She opposes the use of tax dollars to help arm Israel and called on Council to pass a Resolution to, as a bare minimum, call for a ceasefire. She said taxpayers will remember who acted in this matter.

*Wants Representation*

Resident Srdan Nisic is frustrated and is scared for the people of Palestine. He said he does not feel represented by elected officials. He has called his federal and state representatives the last five months and is not getting responses that anyone will help. He asked for at least one Council Member to draft an immediate and permanent Resolution for a ceasefire in Gaza.

*HARB Was Disrespected*

Resident Bruce Haines lamented the February 6 Council vote that approved a Certificate of Appropriation for a smaller Walnut Street Garage. He said it disrespected the HARB board. This will hurt the small business people on Main Street. It will turn away some of those wishing to park on 265 days of the year. Mr. Haines repeated his assertion that the UNESCO World Heritage Site Designation will be jeopardized by this decision. He added that the City has told UNESCO that it has a HARB in place to preserve history yet Council disregarded that board's recommendation.

*Don't Support War with Tax Money*

Resident Gabriel Elsheakh contended that the Gaza situation is one of federal, state, and local interest. In addition to sharing the name "Bethlehem" with the city in the Middle East, this is of local interest because local tax dollars are being sent to support the war effort yet there is much to do here. The money should stay here. He said that Council refusing to support a ceasefire would validate the notion that the lives of Arabs do not matter.

*Voter Voices*

Lafayette College student Ari Ismail was present at today's rally at Lehigh University attended by several hundred people on this same subject. Many were young voters who are watching what Council will do. She added that many in Gaza do not have the ability to leave the war-torn land.

*Minds Made Up*

Resident Stephen Antalics was quite impressed by the comments from the HARB members tonight. He also was disturbed that several Council members at the February 6 meeting read from prepared notes, suggesting that they ignored HARB and resident comments made that night and had their minds made up before the meeting. Council became an extension of the Administration rather than being a watchdog for residents. The alternative for dissatisfied residents is to elect other representatives.

*Don't Discount Activists' Messages*

Resident Nina Abdulzala believes that Council has bought into a false narrative about the Middle East conflict. She said that if they have repeated words of Martin Luther King, Jr. and Nelson Mandela but now discount the activists present tonight, Council Members have “failed the litmus test of our time.” She urged Council to support a ceasefire initiative.

*Consider Withholding Aid/Garage Too Tall, Too Small*

Resident William Scheirer agreed that the United States should seriously consider suspending military aid to Israel until there is definite movement toward a two-state solution. He next commented on the Walnut Street Garage proposal, saying that it is too tall and too small. He has had trouble finding parking in this deck except for on the top level. Mr. Scheirer questioned the accuracy of the statistics provided, at least as being typical. And he believes the new height would “diminish the historical character of Bethlehem.”

*Snow Comments/Parking Meters*

Resident Terry Kloiber said that at Eaton Avenue and Union Boulevard, snow was piled so high that motorists could not properly see oncoming traffic. She used the MyBethlehem app yesterday to report the condition and it was reduced by earlier today to a safe height. She thanked those responsible. She also reported snow from the Grandview Boulevard and Florence Avenue intersection was plowed and tightly packed onto her brother's sidewalk. Despite a call to the City and use of the MyBethlehem app, he was left to clear the snow on his own. Ms. Kloiber also reported difficulty using some parking meters.

*Do Not Let Tax Money Be Misdirected*

A Lehigh University student identifying himself as Bishop said the government is supposed to give citizens something in return for their tax money. It is not proper to use tax money to pay to support Israel. He added that not speaking up is a form of assaulting the truth.

*Don't Tax the Elderly*

Resident Rawan Katz has heard the elderly talk about a struggle to pay their taxes. She has two older parents who are struggling to pay their bills. She particularly does not want to see tax money be funneled toward funding wars that have nothing to do with the United States. We must take care of our elderly. She added that once people retire, they should not have a tax burden. She supported a call by Council for a ceasefire.

*Action By Other Cities*

Lehigh student Tommy Parise said there are several American cities in which their leaders have called for a ceasefire in Gaza. He urged Bethlehem to do the same. Silence is the equivalent of supporting military support to Israel.

*Support Causes Equally*

Anisa, no last name provided, said she has been an organizer in the Lehigh Valley for seven years. She has seen elected officials at other rallies, but not at the Palestinian rallies. She asked why. All of these causes are important. She also said that this is a local issue. Council's voice will be taken to Harrisburg and Washington, D.C.

*Speak Because Representatives Have Not*

A resident who identified herself as Raya said her ancestors had to leave the Middle East in 1948 because of the Nakba. She said this is a Bethlehem issue because refugees come here. It is important for Council to speak because Representatives Susan Wild, John Fetterman, and Robert Casey have not stood up on this matter.

*Snow Concerns/Support Ceasefire*

Resident Valerie Noonan said that Westgate Mall does not plow its sidewalks. She reported this to the City's Engineering Department. Snow was not cleared for the rest of the week or after the snowstorm this weekend. She also offered support for a ceasefire in Gaza issue.

*Democracy Begins Locally*

Lehigh University student Kieran pointed out the Boycott, Divest, and Sanctions Movement that led to the end of Apartheid South Africa. He said that movement started in City Halls just like this and universities just like Lehigh with students demanding that elected representatives invest their money ethically. He said students do not accept more than \$3 million from the Lehigh Valley being channeled annually toward arming Israel. Democracy begins at the local level. The least that can be done is a call for a ceasefire, but he would also like to see divestiture.

*Need for Compassion*

A Lafayette College student spoke of a need for compassion. He said the Western powers are supporting the downfall of Palestinians.

*Cut Aid to Israel*

A woman who did not give her name recalled first learning in a 2019 social studies class of the decades-old conflict in the Middle East. The most recent flare-up is the most recent in these clashes. The technology that allows live-streaming to show the world what is happening leaves her unable to understand how people and their governments are still silent when they can see for themselves what is going on. Like others, she urges the immediate and permanent ceasefire but also cutting U.S. ties and aid to Israel.

*Is There Any Support?*

A woman who identified herself as Gaselle asked Council for a show of hands if anyone was considering passing a Resolution calling for a ceasefire. Some hands were raised.

*Show Empathy*

Gabriella Delgado, a DeSales University student, came to support the people of Palestine and this cause tonight. She has attended rallies and written and called her representatives, but it has been discouraging that there has not been a call for a ceasefire. She is a nursing student and has empathy for those who are not safe in this conflict. She spoke of the many innocent men, women, and children who have died or are otherwise affected by the fighting.

*Know What Your Constituents Want*

A Muhlenberg College student said elected officials have a responsibility to know things about their constituents. It appears to him that Council does not know about its constituents. He said members should do what the audience is asking for a call for a ceasefire.

*Ceasefire Issue Most Important*

A woman who did not provide her name said she was born and raised in Bethlehem. She believes the ceasefire request is a local issue. She said the matters of parking garages and snow discussed tonight are important, but if we want to keep talking about those, we need to talk about the larger issues such as the ceasefire first.

*Take a Stand*

A Lehigh University student said activism is not prevalent in her hometown. She was excited when she got to the Lehigh Valley to see that people here cared. She is disappointed on this issue to see politicians backing away from calls for a ceasefire and related subjects. She believes politicians are ignoring people who are speaking up.

With this portion of Public Comment complete, President Colón stated that reaction to public comments often comes later in the meeting under New Business. He invited those wishing to stay to do so or they could follow from home on Youtube. The next Council meeting will be at 7:00 PM on March 5 if they wish to return.

Mr. Callahan noted that Council has discussed moving New Business closer to the beginning of the meeting agenda in the near future. In deference to those gathered, he suggested moving it up tonight if a Council majority supported that.

President Colón said the intention is to vote tonight on moving up New Business as a regular practice. However, since that vote will not come until later in the meeting, it would be necessary to act on Mr. Callahan's suggestion for this single instance.

Mr. Callahan made a motion to move New Business on tonight's agenda behind Old Business. Ms. Laird seconded the motion. AYES: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Motion passed.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT (on ordinances and resolutions to be voted on by Council this evening – 5 Minute Time Limit)

*Supports Service Weapon Purchase*

Resident Stephen Antalics referred to Agenda Item 10 F and thanked Sgt. Galloway for his service as a Bethlehem police officer. He also urged Council to unanimously approve the purchase of his service weapon. He said it is safest for a retired police officer to have this weapon.

*Concern for Bus Loading Location*

Resident Bruce Haines requested that the Ordinance for the vacation of a portion of Walnut Street be tabled. There is no place for buses to drop off riders. There are no locations on Main Street for this purpose. A good location would be in front of the new Walnut Street Garage, but the plans to make that street narrower eliminates the option for a bus loading zone. It is too soon to vacate this portion of Walnut Street until the loading location has been determined.

*Maintain RT Zoning Designation*

Resident William Scheirer agreed with Mr. Haines' concerns about the street vacation as it relates to the need for a bus loading zone. He also spoke about the rezoning matter. As matters stand, the zoning designation under the proposed apartment building is RT, the densest residential district. This would limit the apartment building to 3 ½ stories. However, if this zoning district were changed to CB, this same building could have a maximum height of 150 feet or 12-plus stories. He recognizes that HARB likely would object and then Council would again be asked to agree or disagree, setting up the same circumstances as we are in now with the garage. He suggested keeping the zoning designation as RT to better manage the maximum apartment building height.

5. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Members of Council
- B. Tabled Items
- C. Unfinished Business

NEW BUSINESS (agenda amended tonight by prior Council vote)

Mr. Callahan recognized the conflict between Palestine and the Israelis as a long historical matter. He agreed with a recent statement by President Biden that the fighting is now "over the top." Mr. Callahan said he would be proposing in time for the March 5 Council meeting a Resolution calling for an immediate ceasefire in Gaza. He said he wished to know where Mayor Reynolds stands on this issue, but noted that the Mayor's chair was empty at this time.

President Colón said the Mayor may speak on this subject during the Mayor's Report if he chooses.

Ms. Kwiatek said she was hopeful for the Israeli government, but it is clear to her that the leader is an autocrat and no longer serving the proper purpose.

Ms. Laird said that most of us know someone who has been affected by this conflict. She looks forward to seeing what Council can put together on this matter.



Ms. Wilhelm said she learned many new things tonight. She thanked the group for using the tool available to them to share perspectives with Council and ask for a Resolution of support for a ceasefire. She also looks forward to seeing what could be included in a Resolution.

Ms. Crampsie Smith said it is true that we cannot know the extent of what is going on in Gaza, but as a school counselor she has some idea of family difficulties here that have resulted from injustice and abuse.

President Colón said he hoped that those who spoke felt comfortable and respected in doing so. He hoped that this was an opportunity to air issues at the very least and noted that there is no related action on tonight's agenda but that it sounds as if there may be in the near future.

Mr. Callahan asked Solicitor Stephanie Steward if it would be permissible for him to propose a Council Resolution calling for an immediate ceasefire in Gaza.

President Colón noted that a Resolution is generally prepared in advance and read by the Clerk for Council's consideration. These are generally full statements, paragraphs in length, that comprehensively offer the will of Council. Theoretically this could be done "on the fly", but this would be an ad lib effort rather than one more thoughtfully prepared and considered.

Mr. Callahan said it is evident that those on Council want to call for a ceasefire proposal. He proposed that Council pass a Resolution today calling for an immediate ceasefire in Gaza. He said he was open to additional suggested language. He believed this could pass with one reading.

Solicitor Steward said this would not require a Codified Ordinance, so there are not two readings required for passage. But to be able to "solidify and clearly state" the will of Council in a written Resolution would be the preferred, and more typical, course of action. That is her recommendation. She noted that it appeared that Mr. Callahan had made a motion, they could see if there would be a second to it, and vote if that is the will of Council.

Mr. Callahan said in the past, a proposal was made and then it was verified on video and through the meeting minutes to confirm what was said.

Solicitor Steward said she was thinking that there might be "whereas clauses that may be particular language that you would want to included that you wouldn't be afforded the opportunity to do" if Council voted on the motion as stated by Mr. Callahan.

President Colón said there is a motion on the floor. He added that typically time is taken to draft a Resolution to "capture the will of Council", but he was speaking historically.

Ms. Crampsie Smith seconded the motion to advance this matter for discussion. She feels that it is important to draft a Resolution, and Council has indicated a willingness to do so in members' comments, but she does not recall in her time on Council approving a Resolution "off the cuff." She believes research should be done to make sure the Resolution gets written as Council wants it to and thoughtfully.

Ms. Kwiatek agreed with Ms. Crampsie Smith. She wanted this to be a strong Resolution. "The Resolutions mean something if we are trying to send a strong message," she said.

Ms. Laird noted that most people who spoke tonight prepared their remarks in advance to make the strongest statement. She believed that Council when making a statement like this "should take the time to think through, unify our voices ... and make sure that it is the strongest that it can be."

Mr. Callahan said his fear is that between now and the next meeting there could be influence to include language that would "water down" what is being considered tonight. He believes this matter is simple. Those present are asking for a Resolution calling for a ceasefire. He now suggested a Resolution stating: "Bethlehem City Council hereby passes a Resolution calling for an immediate ceasefire in Gaza."

President Colón said that he hoped to "capture the weight" communicated by speakers tonight. He said there were Council comments that they may wish to put together a Resolution. He invited interested Council Members to work together or individually to determine what they want to put on the next agenda for consideration. He said he would not support the motion to pass the stated Resolution but would look forward to what might appear on the next agenda.

Ms. Wilhelm said that by waiting and putting this on the next agenda, it would allow public comment on what is being proposed. She agreed with comments that taking time would be best to allow for more thoughtful consideration.

Ms. Kwiatek asked for the understanding of the audience. She said voting no tonight is not voting against the concept of approving a Resolution. The intention is "to get the best Resolution that we can" and to get community input. She encouraged those who spoke to email their remarks to City Council. Some of this language might be used as part of the Resolution.

Mr. Callahan again asked if the Mayor would like to comment.

Mayor Reynolds said he hoped that those attending felt welcome and safe in speaking out. He added that Bethlehem takes seriously how money is being spent as well as social injustices and related issues. The Mayor added that the point is not just to stop the fighting but to have the permanent peace. The language and the words that are used are incredibly important. It makes sense because of the legacy that it could bring and the complexities of the issue, that a message be sent about ceasefire and the permanent peace and what the conditions are that are included in it. It is important to get the words right. He encouraged those present to offer their time and talents to the City and become involved in other initiatives such as homelessness and affordable housing.

Mr. Callahan referred to the letter received earlier in the meeting from Lehigh Valley Artists for a Free Palestine that urged the mayors of the three Lehigh Valley cities along with Council Members, to release Resolutions calling for a permanent ceasefire. Mr. Callahan asked if Mayor Reynolds would support such a Resolution.

Mayor Reynolds said he wanted to see the language of such a Resolution before committing to it. He agrees with the "spirit" of what is being discussed tonight, but he cannot agree at this moment to something that has not yet been drafted.

President Colón reminded all that Council Members' email addresses are posted on the City's website. Residents may comment through email or through the City Clerk's Office. He added that the agenda and materials associated with that agenda are posted online for review prior to meetings.

Voting AYE: Mr. Callahah, 1; NAY: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 5. The Motion fails.

6. COMMUNICATIONS

A. *Chief of Police – Handgun Purchase for Retiring Sgt. Galloway*

The Clerk read a February 5, 2024 memorandum from Police Chief Michelle Kott with an attached Resolution and Agreement for the purchase of a duty weapon by a retired Officer of the Bethlehem Police Department. Pursuant to the Third Class City Code, retired officers may purchase their duty firearms at fair market value.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 F is on the agenda.

B. *DCED Business Manager – Destruction of Records*

The Clerk read a February 9, 2024 memorandum with a proposed Resolution from DCED Business Manager Tiffany Wismer, requesting the Destruction of Records from her department. Ms. Wismer has reviewed the Municipal Records Retention Act, and the records listed on the exhibit accompanying the memo fall within the categories where destruction is permitted.

President Colón stated that a Resolution will be place on the March 5, 2024 agenda.

C. *City Solicitor – Use Permit Agreement – North Bethlehem Little League and Liberty Baseball Partners*

The Clerk read a February 14, 2024 memorandum from Solicitor John F. Spirk, Jr. with an attached Amendment 1 to a Use Permit Agreement and a Resolution. The Permittee is North Bethlehem Little League, which no longer desires to use the Annex Field at Monocacy Complex as part of its sanctioned baseball/softball program. In addition, the memorandum also has an attached Use Permit Agreement and a Resolution for Permittee Liberty Baseball Partners to use the Annex Field at Monocacy Complex between March 1 and December 31, 2024 for its sanctioned baseball/softball program.

President Colón stated Resolutions 10 G and 10 H are on the agenda.

D. *City Solicitor – Use Permit Agreement – Northwest Youth Athletic Little League and BASD*

The Clerk read a February 14, 2024 memorandum from Solicitor John F. Spirk, Jr. with an attached Amendment 1 to a Use Permit Agreement and a Resolution. The Permittee is Northwest Youth Athletic Little League, which no longer desires to use the Spring Street Fields as part of its sanctioned baseball/softball program. In addition, the memorandum also has an attached Use

Permit Agreement and a Resolution for Permittee Bethlehem Area School District to use the Spring Street Fields between March 1 and December 31, 2024 for its sanctioned baseball/softball program.

President Colón stated Resolutions 10 I and 10 J are on the agenda.

*6 E. Director of Public Works – Contract – WSP USA, Inc. – Climate Action Plan Support*

The Clerk read a February 12, 2024 memorandum with an attached Resolution from Public Works Director Michael Alkhal. Mr. Alkhal recommends a contract with WSP USA, Inc. of Bethlehem to assist the City in implementing its Climate Action Plan during 2024. The cost of the contract is \$34,052.50. There are no renewals. WSP prepared the Climate Action Plan in 2021 and has contractually provided support in 2022 and 2023.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 M is on the agenda.

7. REPORTS

A. *President of Council*

B. *Mayor*

*7B1. Administrative Order – Thomas Donchez– Bethlehem Authority*

Mayor Reynolds appointed Thomas F. Donchez to the Bethlehem Authority effective through January of 2029. Ms. Leon and Ms. Cramspie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-023 to confirm the appointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Resolution passed.

*7B2. Administrative Order – Alison Pilorz – Sister City Commission*

Mayor Reynolds appointed Alison Pilorz to the Sister City Commission effective through July of 2026. Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-024 to confirm the appointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Resolution passed.

*Community Updates*

Mayor Reynolds said a community caucus will be held March 13 at NCC to discuss plans for the South Bethlehem Community Center. He added that he and Director of Equity and Inclusion Janine Santoro continue to work toward projects for We Build Bethlehem. The web page will be freshened within the next few weeks to update housing efforts and provide short summaries of progress on long-term plans. This will include updates on the Community Recovery Fund. An estimated 27 nonprofit organizations were supported last year. The intention

would also be for those curious about improving Internet connectivity or food access to provide short-term updates and links with the longer-term plans about the housing study.

C. Finance Committee – Crampsie Smith

Ms. Crampsie Smith said that the Finance Committee met tonight, Tuesday, February 20, 2024 at 6:00 PM in Town Hall. The Committee discussed eight agenda items: General Fund – Year-end Adjustments, 2. General Fund Adjustments – Police Northampton County Public Safety Grant, 3. General Fund – Electrical Street Lights Repair-Replacement, 4. General Fund Adjustments – Police DCED Grant, 5. Budget Adjustments – Stormwater Fund – Year-end Adjustments, 6. Budget Adjustments – Non-Utility Capital Improvement Fund – Year-end Adjustments, 7. Proposed Rates for the 2024 Recreation Season, and 8. Change Method to Determine Actuarial Value of Assets for the Fire and Police Pension Funds. Committee votes were taken on each of the eight agenda items. The committee voted to recommend placement of appropriate Bills and Resolutions on tonight’s Council meeting agenda for each agenda item.

8. ORDINANCES FOR FINAL PASSAGE

A. *Bill No. 01-2024 – Walnut Street Garage – Ordinance for Zoning Map Amendment*

The Clerk read Bill No. 01-2024 – Walnut Street Garage – Ordinance for Zoning Map Amendment, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Mr. Colón and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM, COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON, COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, AMENDING PART 13 OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM, AS AMENDED, KNOWN AS THE ZONING ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM, BY AMENDING THE CITY ZONING MAP.

Mr. Callahan repeated his comments from the February 6 meeting. He predicted that this would be a huge mistake that will lead to the selling of City land, land that is within the Historic District, to a developer that is not yet known to City Council. Until he knows who the developer is and whether they have political or personal ties to anyone associated with the City, he believes the rezoning is a mistake until these questions are answered. There are other areas of the City where residential development could take place.

Ms. Kwiatek asked for a clarification that Council is not voting on the sale of City property.

President Colón said that was correct. The vote is on the zone map amendment.

Mr. Callahan said the property is being rezoned for residential purposes.

President Colón said Council would be bringing the property into uniform zoning.

Mr. Callahan said that is correct, which will lead to residential development.

Ms. Kwiatek said it is her understanding that the zoning classification would go from RT to CB, which would be the same as the rest of the block.

President Colón deferred to Planning and Zoning Director Darlene Heller and noted that she was nodding that Ms. Kwiatek's statement was correct.

Ms. Laird asked that the title of the Ordinance be reread by the Clerk so that she could be sure what she was voting on rather than potential future implications.

President Colón asked Ms. Heller to come to the microphone for some questions. He again asked if this action is to amend a portion of the district from RT to CB.

Ms. Heller said that was correct.

Ms. Laird asked what RT and CB designations mean.

Ms. Heller said CB is the Central Business District and is the most-dense commercial district in the City. RT is high-density Residential. It is the most-dense residential district. The action would remove the RT designation and make all of the lot CB, since this is currently a commercial parking lot.

Ms. Crampsie Smith said her position has not changed. She feels even more confident in her opposition to aspects relating to redevelopment of the garage after speaking with more constituents. She commended the HARB members, adding that she could not recall ever seeing members from other boards attend Council meetings and speaking publicly with such passion and conviction defending their stance. She said they followed the guidelines that the City imposed. If the City will not follow its own rules, why should others have to who live within the Historic District? Ms. Crampsie Smith does not understand why a smaller garage is being proposed when an influx of visitors is expected within the downtown area. She also is upset at the sale of land presumably to a developer who will build apartments that most of the public will not be able to afford. She believes we must balance progress and preservation. If this is not done, the soul of the City will be lost.

President Colón asked Ms. Heller if a parking garage was a non-conforming use in the Historic District.

Ms. Heller said a parking garage is permitted in a CB District. The portion over the RT District would be non-conforming. She is unsure how the land was zoned allowing the garage to fall within two different districts.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, and Mr. Colón, 4; NAY, Mr. Callahan, and Ms. Crampsie Smith, 2. Bill No. 01-2024, now known as Ordinance No. 2024-02, passed on Final Reading.

*B. Bill No. 02-2024 – Walnut Street Garage – Ordinance for Street Vacation*

The Clerk read Bill No. 02-2024 – Walnut Street Garage – Ordinance for Street Vacation, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Colón and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM, COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND  
NORTHAMPTON, COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, AUTHORIZING THE  
VACATION, DISCONTINUANCE AND STRIKING FROM THE CITY'S GENERAL  
PLAN OF STREETS OF PORTIONS OF WEST WALNUT STREET IN THE 7<sup>TH</sup> WARD  
OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM, COUNTY OF NORTHAMPTON PENNSYLVANIA

Ms. Laird noted that transit buses stop at the transportation center 1/10 of a mile away. She asked whether charter buses also could load and unload there.

BPA Executive Director Steven Fernstrom said the other BPA properties could be considered. There have been some early discussions. The Spring Street lot could be upgraded to be a bus hold-over area.

Ms. Laird asked if buses other than LANTA and Trans-Bridge are permitted to use the transit center.

Mr. Fernstrom said he was unsure. LANTA and Trans-Bridge are the only ones that he has seen use it.

Mayor Reynolds said the area outside of the transit center is a public street, so it could be used. Identifying himself as the Chairman of the World Heritage Council, he said the Council would have spoken up if bus parking related to the street vacation was a concern.

Ms. Laird wanted to confirm that the proposed street width would allow for one lane in each direction as well as the current number of on-street parking spaces.

Ms. Crampsie Smith returned to Mr. Fernstrom's comments about the Spring Street lot. She asked if that meant that riders would have to walk up the hill to get to Main Street.

Mr. Fernstrom said his mention of the Spring Street lot was just where buses could hold over. A drop-off area has not been identified.

Mayor Reynolds said the drop-off location will be determined on where City organizers want the visitors to go. The location and related strategy have not yet been decided.

Ms. Crampsie Smith said she was additionally concerned about people with disabilities and not wanting them to walk up a hill.

Mayor Reynolds agreed these factors will have to be taken into account.

Ms. Crampsie Smith asked what accommodations have been made for buses during recent holiday seasons. She noted that some concerns have been raised.

Mr. Fernstrom said that some metered spaces on Main Street have been taken out of service to make room for buses to load and unload for the past two years.

Mr. Callahan said it would make the most sense to him to have buses arriving in front of the Visitors Center on Main Street. He suggested some space might be taken back for bus use from the Hotel Bethlehem to the restaurant at 515 Main Street.

President Colón reminded that the item being voted on involved the street vacation. Mr. Callahan said bus parking is related because the street vacation could take away a potential bus loading zone. Mr. Fernstrom said there is not adequate space for buses near the Walnut Street Garage even if the street were not to be vacated.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. and Mr. Colón, 4; NAY, Mr. Callahan, and Ms. Crampsie Smith, 2. Bill No. 02-2024, now known as Ordinance No. 2024-03, passed on Final Reading.

9. NEW ORDINANCES

A. *Bill No. 03-2024 – Adopt Year-End Adjustments – General Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 03-2024 – Year-End Adjustments – General Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
AMENDING THE GENERAL FUND BUDGET FOR 2024.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Bill No. 03-2024 was passed on First Reading.

B. *Bill No. 04-2024 – Northampton County Public Safety Grant – General Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 04-2024 – Northampton County Public Safety Grant – General Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
AMENDING THE GENERAL FUND BUDGET FOR 2024.

Mr. Kwiatek pointed out that this grant money would support purchasing 20 ballistic shields for police. One of the needs would be in case of school shootings.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Bill No. 04-2024 was passed on First Reading.

C. *Bill No. 05-2024 – Electrical Street Lights Repair-Replace – General Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 05-2024 – Electrical Street Lights Repair-Replace – General Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
AMENDING THE GENERAL FUND BUDGET FOR 2024.



Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Bill No. 05-2024 was passed on First Reading.

*D. Bill No. 06-2024 – Police DCED Grant – General Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 06-2024 – Police DCED Grant – General Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
AMENDING THE GENERAL FUND BUDGET FOR 2024.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Bill No. 06-2024 was passed on First Reading.

*E. Bill No. 07-2024 – Amend 2024 Storm Water Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 07-2024 – Amend 2024 Storm Water Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, AMENDING  
THE 2024 STORM WATER FUND BUDGET ADJUSTMENT

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Bill No. 07-2024 was passed on First Reading.

*F. Bill No. 08-2024 – Non-Utility Capital Fund – Year-End Budget Adjustments*

The Clerk read Bill No. 08-2024 – Non-Utility Capital Fund – Year-End Budget Adjustments, sponsored by Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, AMENDING  
THE 2024 CAPITAL BUDGET FOR NON-UTILITIES.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. Bill No. 08-2024 was passed on First Reading.

10. RESOLUTIONS

*A. Approve Resolution – Records Destruction – Deputy Controller*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-025 that authorized the disposal of public records in the Controller's Office, as set forth in Exhibit A.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*B. Approve Resolution – Records Destruction – Police Department*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-026 that authorized the disposal of public records in the Police Department, as set forth in Exhibit A.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*C. Approve Resolution – Records Destruction – Police Department*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-027 that authorized the disposal of a second set of public records in the Police Department, as set forth in Exhibit A.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*D. Approve Resolution – Rules of Council Amendments – Rule 3A – Order of Business*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-028 that authorized that Council has amended Rule 3A of the Rules of Council to eliminate the Invocation from its Order of Business and move up “New Business” to follow “Unfinished Business” and precede “Communications.”

President Colón explained the purpose of these changes. The Invocation was discontinued during the Pandemic when meetings were conducted virtually. This was not re-introduced. Arranging the Invocation became onerous for the Clerk’s Office. As to moving “New Business” on the agenda, he believes that tonight’s placement served as an example that permitting this sooner might provide answers to questions raised sooner in meetings.

Mr. Callahan supported moving “New Business” up on the agenda, but he would vote no on this Resolution because he does not want to eliminate the Invocation.

Ms. Laird supported both parts of this Resolution. She believed eliminating the Invocation would be a good way to further separate Church and State. She respects a lot of the religious leaders in our community, but she does not believe that the Invocation has to do with City business.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 5; NAY: Mr. Callahan, 1. The Resolution passed.

*E. Approve Resolution – Rules of Council Amendments – Rule 4 – Agenda Item Deadline*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-029 that authorized that Council has amended Rule 4 of the Rules of Council to change the deadline for items to be considered by Council to no later than 4:00 PM of the Wednesday preceding a Council meeting.

President Colón said this resulted from a conversation with the Clerk's Office that more time would be helpful in preparing for meetings. This moves up the deadline one-half day.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*F. Approve Resolution – Sgt. Galloway – Handgun Purchase – Disposition of Police Handgun*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-030 that authorized to execute an Agreement to effectuate the transfer of the City-issued handgun assigned to Sgt. Thomas Galloway, a retired City police officer.

Mr. Callahan said these handgun purchases by retiring City police used to be routine when he was previously on Council. He wondered if anything has changed and alluded to Mr. Antalics' earlier comment supporting duty weapon purchases. He asked how much a gun costs.

Police Chief Michelle Kott estimated \$430-\$450.

Mr. Callahan said he views the purchase by the officer who owned the gone as a sentimental token of service and the weapon would be in good hands. He asked whether the gun would be sold on the free market if Council opposes this practice.

Chief Kott said the City would not sell it. It might be traded in toward the purchase of another officer's firearm, but his would not be sold to an arms dealer or private citizen.

Mr. Callahan observed that a trade-in would eventually lead to the gun reaching the open market.

Chief Kott could not be sure but said possibly.

Ms. Kwiatek acknowledged that issues raised likely deal with her past votes on this subject. She said each Council Member gets one vote. These votes do not have to be unanimous. She understands that. She wishes the officer well in retirement and thanked him for his service, but she still opposes the concept of the sale because of the number of gun incidents in our society.

Ms. Laird said this type of vote is the first in her time on Council. She also said that her questions are not a reflection on the retiring officer. In researching this issue, she saw news articles from 2022 that referenced discussions about what could be done with the guns. Ms. Laird wondered where these discussions have led.

Chief Kott said discussions have been had. An escrow account exists where money is kept from the proceeds of the officers' purchases. Suggestions were made that the money could be donated toward an anti-gun violence group or a gun buy-back program. If the firearm were kept, she said the intent would be to keep it for training purposes before going to the last-case scenario of trading the guy to convert the proceeds to new duty weapon purchases. The funds brought in to date remain in escrow.

Ms. Laird asked what needs to happen to determine a course of action.

The Chief said the determination still must be made as to the appropriate action.

Mayor Reynolds agreed that they continue to look at the use of the funds. There is some debate as to the effectiveness of gun buy-back programs. Northampton County recently did one. The money has been held until that determination can be made.

Ms. Laird asked whether firefighters or other City workers have the ability to buy their equipment at the end of their tenure.

Fire Chief Warren Achey said that firefighters are given their helmets upon retirement.

Ms. Laird asked how much would it cost to destroy a duty weapon if an officer does not wish to purchase it.

Chief Kott said the City is having trouble disposing of weapons that have been in evidence, so that would only add to that problem right now. This is a matter of finding a company to melt them down.

Mayor Reynolds said there also might be an issue with destroying City property with reasonable value. Other City property must be sold at auction. There may be restrictions on the destruction of duty weapons.

Ms. Laird asked whether this might be advanced by holding a Public Safety Committee meeting.

President Colón noted that the Ms. Leon, the Chair of that committee, was not present tonight. Questions might be answered by contacting Chief Kott or other members of the Administration or Ms. Laird could discuss with Ms. Leon the possibilities of holding a Public Safety Committee meeting.

Mr. Callahan said he believed the best person to own the weapon is the person who has used it in a safe manner for the years that it was in service. He does not want to lose money by destroying it.

Voting AYE: Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 5; NAY: Ms. Kwiatek, 1. The Resolution passed.

*G. Approve Use Permit Agreement – North Bethlehem Little League – Amendment 1*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-031 that authorized to execute Amendment No. 1 to a Use permit Agreement and such other agreements and documents as deemed necessary by the Solicitor with North Bethlehem Little League with respect to its use of public property for its Sanctioned Baseball/Softball program.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*H. Approve Use Permit Agreement – Liberty Baseball Partners – Annex Field at Monocacy Complex*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-032 that authorized to execute a Use Permit Agreement and related documents with Liberty Baseball Partners with respect to its use of public property for its Sanctioned Baseball/Softball program.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*I. Approve Use Permit Agreement – Northwest Youth Athletic Little League – Amendment 1*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-033 that authorized to execute Amendment No. 1 to a Use permit Agreement and such other agreements and documents as deemed necessary by the Solicitor with Northwest Youth Athletic Little League with respect to its use of public property for its Sanctioned Baseball/Softball program.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*J. Approve Use Permit Agreement – BASD – Spring Street Fields*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-034 that authorized to execute a Use Permit Agreement and related documents with Bethlehem Area School District with respect to its use of public property for its Sanctioned Baseball/Softball program.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*K. Approve Resolution – Rates for 2024 Recreation Season*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-035 that authorized that rates for the 2024 Recreation Season are hereby adopted as listed on Exhibit A.

Ms. Kwiatek noted that that the Finance Committee voted earlier this evening to move this Resolution forward to the full Council. She observed that there are some increases, but lifeguards must be paid higher wages in order for the City to compete with other businesses for their employment to maintain staffing levels. However, she would like to see ways found to make fees affordable for lower-income families. She will support the rates, but she wants to find ways to make these facilities affordable for all families.

Ms. Laird agreed with this point and would like to raise it through the Parks and Recreation Committee, which she Chairs. This is an environmental justice issue.

Ms. Crampsie Smith added that some of this was discussed at the Finance Committee meeting. Points were raised to explore grant possibilities or perhaps raising non-residential rates to potentially offset costs for the financially disadvantaged.

Mr. Callahan will vote against this. He agrees with points raised about trying to create more access for those who can least afford admission. He said the Administration just raised taxes and water rates and it has been said that the City is in the best financial position in a long time, so raising rates that include those of lesser means does not make sense.

Ms. Wilhelm recognized the increase in employee wages and their right to a fair wage. She also looks forward to conversations on how to help those who have lower incomes be able to participate.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 5;  
NAY: Mr. Callahan, 1. The Resolution passed.

*L. Approve Resolution – Asset Smoothing Resolution 2024*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-036 that authorized that the five-year smoothing method to determine the actuarial value of assets be adopted for the City of Bethlehem Firemen's Pension Fund and the City of Bethlehem Police Pension Fund, effective with the January 1, 2023, actuarial valuation report.

Mr. Callahan asked for an explanation from Business Administrator Eric Evans.

Mr. Evans said this involves the police and fire pensions. Every two years, a calculation is required to determine the City's Minimum Municipal Obligation to keep the plan funded based on fluctuations including how investment funding performed, and the number of employees paying into and drawing from the plan. These numbers are based on 2021 and 2022 investments. The 2022 market was not good, so this will cause the need for a higher City contribution. Use of the "smoothing method" allows for a review of five years of returns. It does not just look at the 2021-2022 period. Most municipalities use this method, and the City's consultant has advised it. There are no fees to use this method.

President Colón observed that the peaks will not be as high with the smoothing method because those numbers will have been averaged to offset underperforming years, but nor will the valleys be so low requiring the City to add significant MMOs.

Ms. Crampsie Smith said that Mr. Evans during the Finance Committee meeting agreed to keep monitoring if the smoothing method was working or if factors would make it more feasible to return to the market value approach and getting away from averaging five years' worth of figures. It is permissible to choose the more favorable method when the next actuary study is done.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

*M. Approve Resolution – Contract – WSP USA, Inc. – 15 Climate Action Plan Support*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-037 that authorized to execute all documents and agreements with WSP USA, Inc. to provide Climate Action Plan Support.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

President Colón said he would accept a motion and a second to group consideration of four Certificates of Appropriateness, 10 N through 10 Q. Mr. Callahan made a motion, seconded by Ms. Wilhelm, to consider the COAs as a group.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

President Colón asked the Clerk to read 10 N through 10 Q and call the roll.

*N. Certificate of Appropriateness – 41 East Market Street 1A – February 2024*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-038 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace asphalt shingles with GAF Slateline Shingles on the main house and the detached garage. At the detached guest house, the Applicant proposes to replace the south facing portion of the roof with GAF Slateline Shingles, but will only replace slate shingles as necessary on the north facing portion of the roof. This is consistent with the Application to install solar panels previously submitted and reviewed at the 4 October 2023 HARB Meeting;

*O. Certificate of Appropriateness – 41 East Market Street 1B – February 2024*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-039 to install eleven new double hung replacement windows in the rear detached guest house;

*P. Certificate of Appropriateness – 17 East Church Street – February 2024*

Mr. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-040 to change the paint color scheme of the home; and

*Q. Certificate of Appropriateness – 58 East Wall Street – February 2024*

Ms. Leon and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2024-041 to install a new 6-foot-high fence.

Voting AYE: Ms. Kwiatek, Ms. Laird, Ms. Wilhelm, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Crampsie Smith, and Mr. Colón, 6. The Resolution passed.

11. NEW BUSINESS

(Moved up on tonight's agenda.)

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned 11:27 PM.

ATTEST:

Tad J. Miller  
City Clerk