
M I N U T E S

BOARD: HISTORIC CONSERVATION COMMISSION, CITY OF BETHLEHEM

MEMBERS PRESENT: SETH CORNISH, ROGER HUDAK, GARY LADER, MICHAEL SIMONSON, BETH STARBUCK

MEMBERS ABSENT: CRAIG EVANS, KENNETH LOUSH, ANTHONY SILVOY

STAFF PRESENT: KELLEY ANDRADE, JEFFREY LONG, TINA ROSEBERRY

PRESS PRESENT: ED COURRIER

VISITORS PRESENT: CRAIG BEACH, LARA BLY, TODD CHAMBERS, JACKSON EIGHMY, MISSY HARTNEY, TINA SARGENT, LEE SNYDER, SALVATORE VERRASTRO, ZEKE ZELKER

MEETING DATE: MAY 17, 2021

The regular meeting of the Historic Conservation Commission (HCC) was held on May 17, 2021, at the City of Bethlehem Rotunda, Bethlehem City Hall, 10 East Church Street, Bethlehem, PA as well as via GoToMeeting virtual meeting platform. HCC Chair Gary Lader called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

Agenda Item #1

Property Location: 1 West Fourth Street
Property Owner: Richard McCormick
Applicant: L&H Signs (for DTLR, Inc.)

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: This structure is a detached, 3-story, 6-bay painted brick commercial building with a detailed projecting cornice and flat roof. The main façade includes a modified street-level storefront along with 2-over-1 double-hung windows with ornate hoods at the upper floor levels. The building dates from the late 19th century and is Italianate in style.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to replace existing signage.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SIS) 9.** -- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- It is the purpose and intent of the City of Bethlehem to promote, protect, enhance and preserve historic resources and traditional community character for the educational, cultural, economic and general welfare of the public through the preservation, protection and regulation of buildings and areas of historic interest or importance within the City.
- **Historic Conservation Commission 'Guidelines for Signage and Awnings'** -- Care should be taken in mounting signs and awnings to minimize damage to historic materials. This includes reusing hardware or brackets from previous signs. If reusing existing hardware or attachment locations is not an option, select mounting locations that can be easily patched if the sign is removed. This includes locating holes in mortar joints rather than directly into bricks or masonry, which will facilitate repair if the sign is removed or relocated in the future.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: COA Application indicates intent to replace two existing signs for new tenant at entry-level commercial location. Current signage previously determined by HCC as appropriate is installed within modified sign band below lower cornice,

with one sign above recessed entrance at main (south) façade facing West Fourth Street and another sign within existing frame above storefront window at side (east) façade facing South New Street. Proposed sign at main façade measures 37.5-inches high x 144-inches wide while similar proposed sign at side façade measures 32.5-inches high x 120-inches wide. Each sign reads “DTLR” company logo in large, upper-case, bold, stylized, italic lettering in red color outlined in white followed by slogan “YOUR FASHION ... YOUR LIFESTYLE!” in small, upper-case, bold, sans-serif, italic lettering in white color. Letters and slogan are ½-inch thick flat vinyl cutouts while backer is flat Aluminum Composite Material (ACM) in black color; no thickness dimension of backer board nor indication of installation method are provided.

Proposed signage is appropriate with following clarifications:

- lettering outlined with another color is typically considered inappropriate within Historic Conservation District (HCD); however, proposed red lettering on black backer would prove difficult to discern so discussion is warranted before appropriateness can be determined
- include off-set pinstripe detail around perimeter of each sign in complementary color
- identify thickness dimension of backer board
- describe intended method for installing new signage that avoids damage to historical facades beneath

Discussion: Craig Beach (L&H Signs) represented proposal to replace existing signage. Applicant clarified installation method of new signage involves inserting backer into one-inch-thick frame, allowing fasteners to be installed on all sides of frame rather than directly into building façade, which also avoids visible fasteners on sign face. Mr. Lader inquired if sizes of proposed signage relate to existing signs; Applicant responded to confirm sizes of new signage match sizes of existing signage. Mr. Lader requested Applicant to consider off-set pinstripe detail around sign border, also noting need to slightly compromise size of various lettering to accommodate. Applicant agreed to return to Client with suggested pinstripe detail and inquired about appropriate color; Mr. Lader suggested red to match color of logo. Ms. Starbuck inquired how new sign frame will be affixed to building façade; Applicant explained that sign frame will be attached to new angles installed into existing holes in plywood sign band created by current signage. Ms. Starbuck continued by inquiring if proposed lettering represents company logo; Applicant noted existing tenant will remain in commercial location but is re-branding store so proposed design incorporates new company logo, which includes white outline around red lettering to make legible. Mr. Simonson requested Applicant to consider signage version with pinstripe detail in white color in addition to version in red color.

Public Commentary: none

Motion: HCC upon motion by Mr. Lader and seconded by Mr. Simonson adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed work as presented, with modifications described as follows:

1. Proposal to replace existing signage was presented by Craig Beach.
2. New signage includes following details:
 - a. sign above commercial entrance at main (south) façade facing West Fourth Street measures 37.5-inches high x 144-inches wide; sign within existing frame above storefront window at side (east) façade facing South New Street measures 32.5-inches high x 120-inches wide
 - b. each sign reads “DTLR” company logo in large, upper-case, bold, stylized, italic lettering in red color outlined in white followed by slogan “YOUR FASHION ... YOUR LIFESTYLE!” in small, upper-case, bold, sans-serif, italic lettering in white color; letters and slogan are ½-inch thick flat vinyl cutouts while backer is flat Aluminum Composite Material (ACM) in black color
 - c. new sign backers to be inserted into new one-inch-thick frames, allowing fasteners to be installed on all sides of frames; sign frames to be attached to new angles installed into existing holes in plywood sign band created by previous signage to avoid damage to building façades
3. Applicant agreed to submit two revised sign options that integrate off-set pinstripe detail around perimeter of each sign (one with pinstripe in red color and one with pinstripe in white color) prior to fabrication via City of Bethlehem for final consideration by HCC Chair and Historic Officer.

The motion for the proposed work was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item #2

Property Location: 202 East Third Street

Property Owner: Mario Paniccioli

Applicant: Lara Bly

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: This structure is a 3-story, semi-detached, stone and brick masonry, mixed-use commercial and residential building with a Mansard roof sheathed with red clay tiles. Constructed in ca. 1920, it is Classical Revival in style with Second Empire details, including a Mansard roof with wall dormers, parapets and balconies, a round corner turret with bell-shaped roof along with a Classical cornice and entry columns. Clay roof tiles on the corner turret were replaced with Slateline asphalt shingles in "Victorian Red" color, previously determined by HCC as appropriate.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to add gold vinyl decal on large window, add two gold stencils on two small windows and add metallic black and gold painted sign on metal or wood.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SIS) 9.** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Historic Conservation Commission 'Guidelines for Signage and Awnings'** -- see Agenda Item #1

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: COA Application indicates intent to install vinyl decals on several shop windows for new commercial tenant at entry-level corner location. One vinyl decal measuring approximately 24-inches high x 30-inches wide intended for "large window" while two gold stencils (no dimensions provided) intended for "two smaller windows". Scale drawing required for all sign submittals (as indicated on COA Application) is not provided so unable to discern proportional relationships of proposed signage within intended windows nor determine which windows are intended to receive proposed signage. COA Application also indicates intent to install "metallic black and gold painted sign on metal or wood"; however, proposed location and dimensions of new sign are not provided. Proposed decals, stencils and sign warrant further clarification before appropriateness can be determined.

Discussion: Lara Bly represented proposal to add gold vinyl decal on large window, add two gold stencils on two small windows and add metallic black and gold painted sign on metal or wood. Mr. Lader requested clarification about intended locations for proposed signage; Applicant clarified current business location is at 321 South New Street while new business will be located at entry-level store on corner of East Third Street and Webster Street, with planned opening at new location by May 31. Applicant noted architectural features of new location serve as design inspiration for new company logo with Art Nouveau influences and requested HCC approval of design before sizes of window decals are finalized. Mr. Lader explained that HCC does not assess artistic design of proposed signage but rather conformance with design guidelines and encouraged Applicant to cooperate with signage company before returning to HCC with required scale drawings during subsequent meeting. Applicant noted desire for appropriate signage is hastened by plans to open new business location prior to next HCC meeting, with window decals more important than painted sign at corner entrance. Applicant continued by clarifying proposed window decal design intended for large window (at left of entrance facing East Third Street) includes company name "Lara Bly" in large stylized cursive lettering following by slogan "Fashion Design Studio & Boutique" in small, sans-serif lettering installed along arc within curvature of Art Nouveau-inspired stylized filigree surround; overall dimensions are 24-inches high x 30-inches wide, with lettering and filigree surround in gold metallic color while voids between remain clear. Applicant also clarified proposed window decals intended for smaller windows (one at left and one at right of corner entrance) include Art Nouveau-inspired filigree brackets in gold metallic color at upper left and lower right of each window to frame views of window displays. Mr. Simonson inquired if decals are temporary until more finalized signage can be developed; Applicant responded that proposed decals represent finalized signage. Mr. Simonson continued by inquiring if proposed window signage will include black background; Applicant explained that proposed window signage only includes gold metallic details while voids between remain clear. Applicant continued that design for new sign at corner entrance would include similar details but on black background ... including voids between gold

metallic details; agreed to cooperate with sign fabricator to finalize design before submitting scale drawings of each window with proposed signage for review.

Applicant suggested transom above corner entrance door as potential location for new painted sign; continued by confirming that existing transom measures approx. 24-inches high x 36-inches wide. Ms. Starbuck expressed preference for retaining existing transom above door and suggested two-sided blade sign installed at underside of turret above corner entrance as appropriate alternative. Applicant explained that on-going renovations include replacement of corner entrance door and/or transom so waiting until work is complete before finalizing sign location is preferred; Ms. Starbuck noted HCC has not assessed proposal to replace door and/or transom at project location. Mr. Lader inquired about potential for indicating contact information, operational hours, etc.; Applicant admitted such details have yet to be considered but assumes appropriate location would be main entrance door at corner location. Mr. Hudak expressed appreciation of new signage design; Mr. Cornish noted designs seem appropriate and suggested that scale drawings of signage for each intended window be submitted to HCC Chair and Historic Officer for final consideration.

Public Commentary: none

Motion: HCC upon motion by Ms. Starbuck and seconded by Mr. Simonson adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed work as presented, with modifications described as follows:

1. Proposal to add gold vinyl decal on large window, add two gold stencils on two small windows and add metallic black and gold painted sign on metal or wood was presented by Lara Bly.
2. New signage includes following details:
 - a. window decal for large window (at left of entrance facing East Third Street) includes company name "Lara Bly" in large stylized cursive lettering following by slogan "Fashion Design Studio & Boutique" in small, sans-serif lettering installed along arc within curvature of Art Nouveau-inspired stylized filigree surround; overall dimensions are 24-inches high x 30-inches wide, with lettering and filigree surround in gold metallic color while voids between remain clear
 - b. window decals for smaller windows (one at left and one at right of corner entrance) include Art Nouveau-inspired filigree brackets in gold metallic color at upper left and lower right of each window to frame views of window displays
 - c. COA Application for proposed blade sign at corner entrance location (including scale drawing of sign in relation to existing architectural features) to be submitted for future HCC assessment
3. Applicant agreed to cooperate with sign fabricator to provide scale drawings of each intended window with new signage and submit via City of Bethlehem for final consideration by HCC Chair and Historic Officer prior to fabrication and installation.

The motion for the proposed work was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item #3

Property Location: 409-411 Wyandotte Street

Property Owner: Palace Row, LLC

Applicant: Jackson Eighmy

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: These two adjacent structures are very similar, 3-story, 3-bay brick commercial and residential buildings with detailed upper cornices at the front (west) façades and flat roofs. The entry-level front façade at #409 Wyandotte Street has been significantly altered and now includes two entrance doors in the left (north) portion along with a punched window opening in the right (south) portion, with the former storefront façade covered over with a stucco finish that is in poor condition. The upper portion of the original brick masonry façade has been painted over in a deep red color and is in poor condition, as are the 1-over-1 double-hung window sash, lintels and sills at both upper floor levels. The side (north) and rear (east) facades are covered in vinyl siding that is currently in poor condition and requires patching and replacing in various areas. The entire front façade at #411 Wyandotte Street has been significantly altered and now includes one entrance door of deteriorated plywood centered within the entry-level façade, which is sheathed in vertical board siding painted in a light

gray color. The remaining front façade was treated with a stucco veneer and given an etched brick pattern (often referred to as “Brickote”) in a light gray color with implied mortar joints in a darker gray color sometime during the mid-20th century. The central bay of upper-level windows was lost over time and resulting voids were covered over with Brickote while remaining upper-level window openings currently have undersized 1-over-1 double-hung windows with stucco to patch resulting voids.

These existing structures comprise part of an entire block of very similar, attached, mixed-use commercial and residential structures dating from ca. 1880 which are all Italianate in style and collectively referred to as ‘Palace Row’. Rear portions of these two structures exhibit a series of later additions dating from the mid-20th century. HCC conducted various reviews of this project location in 2020, ultimately approving a motion in support of a COA on November 16, 2020 for select project components, including approval to demolish non-contributing rear additions at #409 Wyandotte Street, with various project details to be assessed by HCC during subsequent meetings.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to renovate, remodel and partially demolish portions of these buildings.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (SIS) 2.** -- The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
- **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (SIS) 5.** -- Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
- **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (SIS) 6.** -- Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
- **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (SIS) 7.** -- Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
- **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (SIS) 9.** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- see Agenda Item #1

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: COA Application indicates intent to build upon original proposal to renovate, remodel and partially demolish select building elements by offering details concerning proposed materials and finishes. Current Application confirms intent to complete project components previously determined by HCC as appropriate at front (west) façades, including: repair upper cornice in-kind and paint; repair upper-level façades and paint light warm grey for uniformity; reestablish upper-level windows at #411 Wyandotte Street; install new lower cornice at uniform height for both façades, with details to match nearby #417 Wyandotte Street; removal of inappropriate entry-level façades in preparation for new storefronts.

Current Application addresses HCC request for more detailed information and materials samples regarding new windows at upper-level façades (including proposals for new and existing headers and sills) and new storefront assemblies. Proposed windows are Pella Lifestyle Series insulated, aluminum-clad wood, 2-over-2, double-hung with black exterior finish, beveled glazing profiles, exterior and interior applied muntins with between-glass spacers, with clear glass (not tinted or reflective). Proposed headers are PVC to match existing and new cast stone sills match existing. Proposed windows, headers and sills are appropriate, with clarification that windows are custom sized to match existing and new openings rather than standard sizes with additional trim to bridge size differential with existing openings. Proposed storefront assembly is: Kawneer EnCORE Aluminum Framing System with black finish, with 4-inch depth and with clear glass (not tinted or reflective). Proposed storefront is appropriate, with option to center depth of front glaze (to create deeper relief between framing and glazing), but with additional clarifications about material of faceted apron panels, intended façade treatment between both storefronts and below storefront apron as well as steps and handrail assembly leading up into #409 Wyandotte Street. Signage and exterior lighting proposals are not included and require future HCC assessments.

Current Application also confirms intent to complete project components previously determined by HCC as appropriate at side (north) and rear (east) façades, including: removal of inappropriate vinyl siding in preparation for new brick veneer; establish three new upper-level window bays at side façade; demolish non-contributing rear additions at #409 Wyandotte Street in preparation for new 3-story stair and mechanical tower with flat roof with smooth-surface fiber-cement horizontal lap siding; repair existing Brickote finish at side and rear façades and paint light warm grey; establish three new upper-level window bays at rear façade; establish two new lower-level window bays and one new lower-level entrance door.

Current Application addresses HCC request for more detailed information and materials samples regarding new windows, headers and sills along with new storefront assembly (same as previously noted). HCC previously expressed concerns about size(s) of smaller windows proposed for new rear addition; clarification is warranted before appropriateness can be determined. Application references steel handrail assembly with round profile rails and posts painted black for access ramp; though not necessarily appropriate, proposed handrail is required for ADA-compliance and is considered life safety necessity. Application also references similar systems for balcony railing and privacy fencing with steel posts and rails painted black and composite infill as 1x4 tongue-and-groove with wood-look surface in “weathered teak” finish. Similar systems were previously suggested by Applicant; however, HCC noted such systems are not referenced within relevant Design Guidelines as appropriate materials within HCD and no similar application is found within HCD so discussion is warranted before appropriateness can be determined. Application also references proposal for insulated brick cladding system for side (north) façade that includes blend of red and orange colors and “light warm gray” mortar inspired by nearby structures. Similar to previous comment, insulated brick cladding system was previously suggested by Applicant; however, HCC noted such systems are not referenced within relevant Design Guidelines as appropriate materials within HCD and no similar application is found within HCD so discussion is warranted before appropriateness can be determined. Application confirms proposed fiber-cement horizontal lap siding for new rear addition is smooth-surface and has 7-inch exposure, which is appropriate; continues by identifying proposed colors, with “Aged Pewter” medium warm-gray factory-applied finish for siding at new stair and mechanical tower, Sherwin-Williams “Iron Ore” dark warm-gray for painted trim elements and Sherwin-Williams “Windfresh White” light warm-gray for adjacent lower-level façade. Application continues by describing fabricated steel exterior staircase leading from lower-level rear yard up to first-floor patio; exterior staircases are typically inappropriate within HCD but current design is screened from public right-of-way with privacy fence and does not require HCC review. Application concludes by depicting fabricated steel canopy with angled hanger rods tied back to side (north) façade through proposed brick veneer and painted black above access ramp to side entrance. Accompanying detail does not indicate overall length or depth dimensions and provided computer-generated view is not to-scale so proportional relationship of proposed canopy with existing façade is difficult to discern. Applicant previously submitted similar steel canopy design but that was met with reluctance by HCC due to overly industrial design aesthetic and potential visual conflict with lower cornice of front (west) façade, so discussion is warranted before appropriateness is determined. As alternative to steel canopy, Application suggests awning, which is considered appropriate within HCD, conditional that awning fabric is Sunbrella canvas (or comparable) and ends are open along with potential for front valance flap.

Discussion: Todd Chambers and Jackson Eighmy represented proposal to renovate, remodel and partially demolish portions of these buildings. Mr. Lader noted current discussion involves review of proposed building materials; expressed appreciation to Applicant for submitting many product samples. Applicant confirmed on-going cooperation with HCC to assess proposed products and confirmed design (including façade articulation) has not changed since previous HCC review. Ms. Starbuck requested clarification that proposed windows are custom to fit existing upper-level window openings at front façade of #409 Wyandotte Street and openings at adjacent #411 Wyandotte Street are revised to match openings at #409 Wyandotte Street; Applicant confirmed proposed Pella windows are custom to fit existing window openings at #409 Wyandotte Street while original window openings at #411 Wyandotte Street will be reestablished in preparation for new windows, which also match openings at #409 Wyandotte Street. Applicant expressed willingness to center depth of front glaze at proposed storefronts to create deeper relief between framing and glazing; continued that apron below requires further development before seeking HCC assessment but initial intent is millwork fabricated from wood or composite material, with panels painted black to match adjacent storefront. Applicant also confirmed façade element between both

storefronts will be painted warm gray to match upper-level front façades while foundation below storefront apron will be parged in dark color for uniform appearance. Mr. Lader noted transoms above entrance doors should align with transoms of adjacent storefronts; Applicant agreed to align all transoms, noting entrance door at #411 Wyandotte Street necessitates secondary transom to compensate for floor-level differential with adjacent structure. Ms. Starbuck observed that sizes of entrance doors and/or adjacent side lites appear different; Applicant agreed that entrance doors and side lites should be uniform while also confirming entrance door at #411 Wyandotte Street should swing out (toward street) rather than swing in, as currently depicted. Ms. Starbuck suggested parged foundation below storefront should be same warm gray color to match upper-level front façade because dark foundations quickly stain with dirt from adjacent sidewalk; Applicant agreed to revised color of foundation accordingly. Applicant also agreed to provide more details about entrance at #409 Wyandotte Street for subsequent HCC assessment.

Applicant confirmed sizes of proposed windows for new rear tower addition remain, as originally proposed; otherwise, all new windows at side are rear façades are Pella Lifestyle Series aluminum-clad wood windows to match proposed windows at front façades.

Applicant noted new proposal for handrail and privacy fence that includes metal structural elements painted black in deference to nearby ironwork within HCD and also relates to handrail assembly at access ramp while screen infill is tongue-and-groove composite material; submitted product sample is wood look in “weathered teak”. Ms. Starbuck expressed concern about proposed composite screen material due to lack of structural integrity and potential for warping over time; Applicant noted that proposed structural posts for guardrails are installed 4-5-foot on-center while posts for privacy fence are installed 5-6-foot on-center for structural integrity. Ms. Starbuck explained personal concern is based on observation of similar product that warped over time and offered image of warped fencing; recommended Applicant to confirm with product representative about product longevity. Mr. Simonson inquired if system is UL Listed (by Underwriter Laboratories); Applicant confirmed proposed assemblies are UL Listed.

Applicant submitted samples for proposed brick veneer at side façade; Ms. Starbuck expressed concern that insulated façade systems become electrically “charged” over time, attracting grime that proves difficult to clean. Applicant noted proposed system was recently used at several nearby St. Luke’s Health Network projects and had positive experiences; continued that product arrives in units that are hand-laid, hand-mortared and hand-struck like traditional brick masonry façades. Mr. Lader inquired if Applicant would consider traditional thin-brick or brick veneer as alternative to proposed material; Applicant noted side façade has compromised structural stability and limited insulation so proposed material addresses those issues while traditional brick products do not. Mr. Lader challenged HCC to consider appropriateness of proposed insulation product with acrylic finish in comparison to traditional brick masonry veneer.

Applicant confirmed that proposed fiber-cement horizontal lap siding for new rear addition has smooth-surface, with 7-inch exposure; also confirmed rear exterior stair is screened from public view by proposed privacy fence. Mr. Lader continued by requesting clarification about proposed metal canopy at side façade; Applicant confirmed canopy proposal has not changed from previous COA Application, so original dimensions remain. Ms. Starbuck inquired if Applicant would set back canopy from corner to avoid conflict with lower cornice at front façade; Applicant agreed to start canopy 2-3 feet from corner to avoid lower cornice, noting initial flat platform in sidewalk before ADA-compliant ramp initiates. Ms. Starbuck continued by inquiring about depth of proposed canopy; Applicant responded that current proposal is 7-feet deep but could consider reducing to 5-6 feet deep, with need to cover 5-foot wide ramp. Applicant continued by confirming willingness to consider canvas awning over metal frame as alternative to proposed metal canopy. Ms. Starbuck inquired about height of proposed awning if limited to 5-foot depth; Applicant estimated similar height to angle bracing needed for metal canopy ... installed just under sills of second-level windows. Mr. Cornish noted opinion that canvas awning is more appropriate for proposed location; Ms. Starbuck agreed, noting awnings typically imply main façades while canopies imply secondary façades and service locations like loading docks. Mr. Lader continued that canvas awning would also represent significant cost savings over proposed canopy; Mr. Simonson expressed concern that awning would cover over more building features while canopy allows visual appreciation of new side façade. Applicant agreed that awning ends can be open and confirmed no need for front valance flap; also noted intent to plant new trees nearby so side façade will soon be obscured somewhat from public view.

Mr. Lader noted main goal of current discussion should lead to permit issued by City of Bethlehem for Applicant to demolish non-contributing rear additions; Applicant confirmed various third-party reviews

leading to various building permits should conclude soon, with desire to initiate demolition thereafter. Mr. Simonson noted previous COA required Applicant to submit more detailed product information; continued that City has better understanding of proposed materials (even if HCC assessments of appropriateness are pending) so demolition permit can be issued upon satisfaction of third-party reviews. Mr. Cornish noted difficulty with assessing various submitted products by HCC members participating remotely and requested opportunity to personally inspect submittals sometime soon; Mr. Simonson agreed to collect various product samples and make available for individual inspection by HCC members in Planning Department at City Hall. Applicant confirmed on-going willingness to cooperate with HCC to propose alternative materials if current product submittals are determined inappropriate.

Public Commentary: none

Motion: HCC upon motion by Mr. Lader and seconded by Ms. Starbuck adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed work as presented, with modifications described as follows:

1. Proposal to renovate, remodel and partially demolish portions of these buildings was presented by Todd Chambers and Jackson Eighmy.
2. Rehabilitation of front (west) façades includes following details:
 - a. new windows are Pella Lifestyle Series (or comparable) insulated, aluminum-clad wood, 2-over-2, double-hung with black exterior finish, beveled glazing profiles, exterior and interior applied muntins with between-glass spacers, with clear glass (not tinted or reflective) and custom size to match existing openings at #409 Wyandotte Street; headers are PVC to match existing and new cast stone sills match existing
 - b. new storefront assembly is Kawneer EnCORE Aluminum Framing System (or comparable) with black finish, with 4-inch depth and with clear glass (not tinted or reflective) and center depth of front glaze; transoms above entrance doors align with transoms of adjacent storefronts, with both entrance doors of uniform dimension swinging out toward street
 - c. façade element between both storefronts to be painted warm gray to match upper-level front façades; foundation below storefront apron to be parged in similar warm gray color

note: Applicant agreed to return to HCC with clarifications about design and material of faceted apron panels beneath new storefronts, details of entrance at #409 Wyandotte Street along with building signage and exterior lighting proposals.

3. Rehabilitation of side (north) and rear (east) façades includes following details:
 - a. new windows are Pella Lifestyle Series (or comparable) insulated, aluminum-clad wood, 2-over-2, double-hung with black exterior finish, beveled glazing profiles, exterior and interior applied muntins with between-glass spacers, with clear glass (not tinted or reflective); headers are PVC to match existing and new cast stone sills match existing
 - b. new storefront assembly is Kawneer EnCORE Aluminum Framing System (or comparable) with black finish, with 4-inch depth and with clear glass (not tinted or reflective) and center depth of front glaze; transoms align with transoms of adjacent storefronts at front façade
 - c. fiber-cement horizontal lap siding for new rear addition has smooth-surface, with 7-inch exposure; "Aged Pewter" medium warm-gray factory-applied finish for siding at new stair and mechanical tower, Sherwin-Williams "Iron Ore" dark warm-gray for painted trim elements and Sherwin-Williams "Windfresh White" light warm-gray for adjacent lower-level façade
 - d. new Sunbrella canvas (or comparable) awning over metal frame with no end panels and no front flap valance in black color; awning extends 5-feet over ramp below, initiates at least 2-feet from front corner and is installed beneath sills of second-level windows

notes: Applicant agreed to return to HCC with clarifications about design and material of faceted apron panels beneath new storefronts along with building signage and exterior lighting proposals. Submittals of proposed composite material (privacy fencing and balconies) as well as insulated brick veneer require further review by HCC (especially by those attending meeting virtually) before appropriateness is determined. HCC expressed concerns about longevity and potential warping over time of proposed composite material as well as potential electrical "charge" of proposed insulated brick-look product with

acrylic finish (leading to staining from dirt residue); Applicant agreed to address concerns by contacting product manufacturers and requesting relevant specifications.

The motion for the proposed work was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item #4 -- note: Mr. Lader confirmed a conflict of interest with this agenda item, abstaining from discussion and resulting resolution.

Property Location: 306 South New Street

Property Owner: Greenway I, Inc.

Applicant: Zeke Zelker

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: Construction of this semi-detached 6-story commercial building located on the corner of South New Street and West Third Street was initiated in 2016 and it is Contemporary in style. The primary facades on both streets include glass and aluminum storefronts at the street level, are clad in brick on the second through fourth floors, while the upper-most floor levels and the corner are clad in glass and metal panels. The façade of the sixth floor is set back and has a thin projecting roof, creating an open-air terrace along the north and east facades. As a reminder, HCC is mandated with preserving structures dating from the designated era of the Historic Conservation District (ca. 1895 - 1950); thus, this building is not considered a contributing structure to the District.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to replace the existing sign for a new business.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (SIS) 9.** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Historic Conservation Commission ‘Guidelines for Signage and Awnings’** -- see Agenda Item #1

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: Submitted COA Application indicates intent to replace existing sign above far-left entrance doors at east façade (facing South New Street) for new commercial tenant. Proposed signage is comprised of 3/8-inch-thick acrylic letters in silver metallic color mounted onto 2-inch-thick sign backer; background is black in color. Letters spell out company name “ZEKRAFT” in large, bold, upper-case, stylized lettering with slogan “CURATORS OF TASTE” in small, bold, upper-case, sans-serif lettering justified right beneath company name. Signage also includes pinstripe detail in silver metallic color as border around sign perimeter. Overall dimensions of proposed sign are 28” high x 144” wide, which match dimensions of existing sign; panel backer to be mounted to existing sign band on fixed aluminum angle. Installation of modern lettering on Contemporary style structure is appropriate.

Discussion: Zeke Zelker represented proposal to replace existing sign for new business. Ms. Starbuck noted that submitted sign detail indicates white background, black lettering and orange pinstripe detail around sign perimeter; Applicant confirmed that proposed lettering and pinstripe detail are silver metallic in color while backer is black in color, as labeled on provided detail.

Public Commentary: none

Motion: HCC upon motion by Mr. Cornish and seconded by Ms. Starbuck adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed work as presented, with modifications described as follows:

1. Proposal to replace the existing sign for a new business was presented by Zeke Zelker.
2. New signage above far-left entrance doors at east façade (facing South New Street) includes following details:
 - a. dimensions of sign are 28” high x 144” wide, which match dimensions of existing sign; panel backer to be mounted to existing sign band on fixed aluminum angle
 - b. signage consists of 3/8-inch-thick acrylic letters in silver metallic color mounted onto 2-inch-thick sign backer; background is black in color

- c. letters spell out company name “ZEKRAFT” in large, bold, upper-case, stylized lettering with slogan “CURATORS OF TASTE” in small, bold, upper-case, sans-serif lettering justified right beneath company name
- d. pinstripe detail in silver metallic color serves as border around sign perimeter

The motion for the proposed work was approved: 4-0-1; abstention by Mr. Lader.

Agenda Item #5

Property Location: 337 Wyandotte Street

Property Owner: New Bethany Ministries

Applicant: Salvatore Verrastro, Spillman-Farmer Architects

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: This structure is a 3-story, 6-bay brick masonry commercial and residential building with a Mansard roof, ornate painted wooden brackets at the upper cornice, 1-over-1 double-hung windows with simple Federal style headers and sills, a Colonial Revival door surround, and an altered façade at the corner of West Fourth Street where there was originally a storefront. The building is Second Empire in style with Federal and Colonial Revival details. The building dates from the late 19th century.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to replace the existing asphalt shingles and the flat (low-sloped) EPDM roof area.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards (SIS) 9.** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- see Agenda Item #1

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: COA Application indicates intent to replace existing asphalt shingles on both pitched planes of Mansard roof with GAF Slateline asphalt shingles in “Antique Slate” color, which represents improvement to existing simple-tab shingles and is appropriate. Current inappropriate valleys are woven so proposed work should include appropriate open valleys flashed in copper; step flashing at visible required locations (chimneys, party wall to adjacent structure, etc.) should also be copper.

COA Application also indicates intent to replace existing EPDM synthetic rubber roofing membrane at flat (low-sloped) area of upper roof and also at lining of existing box gutters. Locations of proposed EPDM are in-kind replacements and not visible from public right-of-way so HCC review is not required; however, new metal drip-edge at fascia of box gutters is visible and should be painted to match adjacent trim. Applicant should clarify intended flashing and counter flashing at transition from upper flat roof to new asphalt shingles at Mansard roof due to visibility of detail.

COA Application also indicates request to demolish one existing chimney at roof landscape due to lack of use and as source of on-going roof leaks. Though slightly visible from public right-of-way, existing chimney does not contribute to historical integrity of original structure so request to demolish existing chimney warrants discussion, in consideration of HCC approval.

Discussion: Tina Sargent and Salvatore Verrastro represented proposal to replace existing asphalt shingles and flat (low-sloped) EPDM roof area. Applicant confirmed chimney is leaking and abandoned as justification for request to demolish; also clarified that current work scope does not involve rehabilitation of any visible wood trim, corbel brackets, etc. Applicant confirmed existence of one roof valley, currently woven with simple-tab asphalt shingles and agreed to replace with open valley (not woven) during rehabilitation but requested valley flashing to be aluminum rather than copper due to lack of visibility from public right-of-way. Applicant continued that flashing and counterflashing as transition between upper flat EPDM area and Mansard roof is in-kind aluminum replacement with factory-applied finish in cream color; similarly, new flashing with drip edge at box gutters is in-kind aluminum replacement with factory-applied finish to match adjacent trim in cream color. Applicant confirmed that EPDM membrane at upper flat roof and inside box gutters represents in-kind replacement and is not visible from public right-of-way; however, new copper drops will lead from box gutters into existing downspouts. Mr. Lader inquired about proposed material for hips (not valley) of roof landscapes; Applicant confirmed hips will not be woven shingles but

rather fabricated caps in new Slateline asphalt shingles. Applicant also noted that cheek walls of roof dormers as well as dormer roofs will receive Slateline asphalt shingles with copper flashing, as needed.

Public Commentary: none

Motion: HCC upon motion by Mr. Lader and seconded by Ms. Starbuck adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed work as presented, with modifications described as follows:

1. Proposal to replace existing asphalt shingles and flat (low-sloped) EPDM roof area was presented by Tina Sargent and Salvatore Verrastro.
2. Existing simple-tab asphalt shingles on both pitched planes of existing Mansard roof as well as on cheek walls and roofs of each roof dormer to be replaced as follows:
 - a. new roofing is GAF Slateline asphalt shingles in "Antique Slate" color
 - b. open valley (not woven) to be flashed with aluminum rather than copper because of inability to see from public right-of-way; hips to be fabricated with asphalt shingle caps to match new Slateline shingles
 - c. visible step flashing, as needed, to be copper
3. Existing EPDM synthetic rubber roofing membrane at flat (low-sloped) area of upper roof and at lining of existing box gutters (not visible from public right-of-way) to be replaced as follows:
 - a. in-kind replacement of EPDM synthetic rubber roofing membrane at flat upper roof and at lining of existing box gutters
 - b. in-kind replacement of aluminum flashing and counterflashing between flat EPDM area and Mansard roof with factory-applied finish in warm white or ivory color
 - c. in-kind replacement of aluminum flashing with drip edge at box gutters with factory-applied finish in warm white or ivory color
 - d. new copper drops lead from box gutters into existing downspouts
4. HCC approved Applicant's request to demolish existing (abandoned) chimney at north roofscape in preparation for various roof improvements.

The motion for the proposed work was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item #6: -- note: Ms. Starbuck confirmed a conflict of interest with this agenda item, abstaining from discussion and resulting resolution.

Property Location: 315 West Fourth Street

Property Owner: Beth Starbuck and Steven Goldner

Applicant: Beth Starbuck

Building Description, Period, Style, and Defining Features: This structure is a 3-bay, 2 1/2 story, detached, painted brick commercial and residential building with a gable roof, projecting cornice, front entry with arched transom, historic but not original storefront with leaded glass, and multiple attached rear additions. The building dates from the late 19th century and is mixed stylistically but the front portion is Federal Revival in style.

Proposed Alterations: It is proposed to replace the existing garage door with a Clopay Bridgeport steel door.

Guideline Citations:

- **Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SIS) 9.** -- see Agenda Item #1
- **Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of Historic Conservation District** -- see Agenda Item #1

Evaluation, Effect on Historic Conservation District, Recommendations: COA Application indicates intent to replace current garage door with Clopay "Bridgeport" steel door; existing door opening measures 7-feet tall x 12-feet wide, with opening and frame to remain untouched. Proposed finish of new garage door is Sandtone color with "woodgrain" texture. Visibility of garage from public right-of-way is limited. Current

garage door has four horizontal segments and four bays of solid panels and no lites along with basic hardware; proposed replacement garage door also has four horizontal segments and no lites but only three bays of solid panels, with each bay of upper-most horizontal segment divided into four panels; hardware is not indicated. Proposed replacement Clopay steel garage door is appropriate, with following clarification:

- consider smooth-surface finish as appropriate alternative to proposed “woodgrain” texture
- clarify intended hardware

Discussion: Beth Starbuck represented proposal to replace existing garage door with Clopay Bridgeport steel door. Applicant confirmed existing garage door is in poor location and needs replacing; continued that public visibility of garage is quite limited and nearby garages have very different door styles, with no obvious style to match. Applicant explained new door is fabricated from steel for longevity and panels for structural integrity; continued with personal preference for smooth surface rather than wood-grain finish but proposals for smooth doors resulted in significant cost increases. Applicant concluded by confirming replacement door will have simple lift handle, peep hole and no turn lock. Mr. Lader noted that Clopay manufactures high-quality garage doors and similar previous COA Applications resulted in determination of appropriateness within HCD.

Public Commentary: none

Motion: HCC upon motion by Mr. Cornish and seconded by Mr. Hudak adopted the proposal that City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed work as presented, with modifications described as follows:

1. Proposal to replace existing garage door with Clopay “Bridgeport” steel door was presented by Beth Starbuck.
2. New garage door includes following details:
 - a. existing door opening measures 7-feet tall x 12-feet wide, with opening and frame to remain untouched
 - b. replacement garage door has four horizontal segments and no lites along with three bays of divided panels; each bay of upper-most horizontal segment divided into four panels
 - c. finish of new garage door is Sandtone color with “woodgrain” texture
 - d. hardware includes simple lift handle and peep hole

The motion for the proposed work was approved: 4-0-1; abstention by Ms. Starbuck.

New Business: none

General Business: Minutes from HCC meetings on April 19, 2021 and April 26, 2021 were unanimously approved by those attending that meeting, with abstention by those not previously in attendance.

Mr. Lader reported observing extensive exterior renovations at 1007 Prospect Avenue (Mt. Airy Historic District), noting Owner’s failure to appear before HCC during meeting on Nov. 16, 2020 concerning inappropriate replacement windows. Mr. Simonson was already informed of on-going renovations at project location and contacted Owner to inquire; was informed that current work only involves exterior painting, which does not trigger HCC assessment. Mr. Lader continued that exterior siding and ornamental details have also been removed; Mr. Simonson explained such items were sent for in-kind repairs but will be reinstalled. Mr. Simonson also noted that Owner expects to submit COA Application for additional proposed exterior renovations for assessment during subsequent HCC meeting.

Mr. Lader expressed desire to discuss recent HCC assessments of proposed high-rise construction within Historic Conservation District (HCD), stressing need for consistency ... not with individual interpretations of relevant guidelines but with basis of HCC interpretation; continued that City of Bethlehem is in process of adopting new guidelines for height restrictions in South Bethlehem but those guidelines have yet to be formalized so guidelines identified by Historic Officer for each agenda item (Secretary of Interior’s Standards, Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03, Design Guidelines for Demolition, Design Guidelines for Signage and Awnings, etc.) must serve as basis for all HCC assessments leading to determination of either “appropriate” or “inappropriate”. Current guidelines limit building heights to 4-5 stories within HCD so

complications arise when HCC ignores that guidance to determine appropriateness based upon architectural style; continued that assessments cannot result in “approval based upon how nice it looks” or “because I like it” but rather appropriateness based upon adherence to relevant design guidelines. Mr. Lader stressed that individual interpretations of guidelines are important but also stressed that individual assessments cannot be based upon personal opinions. Mr. Cornish expressed appreciation for Mr. Lader’s comments, stressing “Historic” within names “Historic Conservation Commission” and “Historic Conservation District” are key to any COA assessment; continued by noting studies prove districts that maintain historical fabric (look and feel) become and remain economically successful while districts that were renewed (specifically through urban renewal efforts in 1960s and 1970s) are proven unsuccessful and now require renewal efforts yet again. Mr. Cornish expressed appreciation for potential economic development of recent proposals but noted that HCC is charged with maintaining existing “feel” (massing, scale, patterns, materials, etc.) of HCD and stressed to fellow HCC members that current guidelines limit building height to 4-5 stories until City of Bethlehem amends relevant ordinances. Mr. Simonson admitted City’s struggle to balance conflicting limitations about building height (guidelines, ordinances, economic development, etc.) and noted that current Zoning ordinance limits building height to 150-feet within HCD; continued by welcoming City’s pending approval of revised ordinance to resolve conflicting information so all commissions can assess projects based upon consistent guidelines. Ms. Starbuck admitted personal difficulties with recent HCC assessments of proposed high-rise development projects but noted City’s ordinance that created HCD will continue to be based upon Secretary of Interior’s Standards even if new ordinance concerning height restrictions is passed; continued that HCC does take economic hardship of Applicants into consideration (ex.: asphalt shingles as appropriate replacement for failing slate roof) but cannot accept current trend of developers claiming need for designs with more than five stories in order to make economically viable, citing many similar 4-5 story development projects within and near HCD. Ms. Starbuck continued that developers cannot accept Zoning limitations while ignoring other design criteria when choosing to develop projects within HCD, noting such projects are typically speculative when appearing before HCC so developers have yet to purchase actual properties; continued that proposed revisions to building height limitations are personally problematic, noting so-called ‘Benner Building’ has proven itself to be out of scale for immediate setting and for overall HCD but revised limitations would still allow rather than hinder development projects of similar size and scale. Ms. Starbuck recalled no public support of recent high-rise development proposals, with all public comments expressing concern for projects taller than nearby 2-, 3- and 4-story structures; also noted “per square foot density” of South Bethlehem is already comparable to downtown Boston and questioned need for even denser development. Mr. Cornish noted that current problem of prospective developers is “good problem” for City because it emphasizes on-going interest in South Bethlehem rather than more typical trend to abandon inner-city development. Mr. Hudak agreed overly tall buildings within HCD are inappropriate and encouraged fellow HCC members to remain vigilant with assessments of similar development projects; also expressed appreciation for public commentary in support of HCC’s recent decisions and found them reassuring.

There was no further business; HCC meeting was adjourned at approximately 8:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



BY:

Jeffrey Long
Historic Officer
South Bethlehem Historic Conservation District
Mt. Airy Historic District