

BETHLEHEM CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
10 East Church Street - Town Hall  
Bethlehem, Pennsylvania  
Tuesday, November 15, 2022 - 7:00 PM

PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

1. ROLL CALL

President Colón called the meeting to order. Present were Grace Crampsie Smith, Wandalyn J. Enix, Hillary G. Kwiatek, Rachel Leon, Paige Van Wirt, Kiera L. Wilhelm, and Michael G. Colón, 7.

PUBLIC HEARING

President Colón stated prior to the consideration of the regular Agenda items, City Council will conduct a Public Hearing to accept public comment on (2) two Zoning Text Amendments from Darlene Heller, Director of Planning and Zoning, 1. Amending the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Bethlehem at Part 13 of the Codified Ordinances entitled Miscellaneous 2. Amending the Zoning Ordinance of the City of Bethlehem at Part 13 of the Codified Ordinances entitled Design Standards. The Community Development Committee reviewed the proposed zoning amendments at its September 6, 2022 meeting and voted 3-0 to recommend that the amendments be forwarded to the full Council and be the subject of a Public Hearing.

*Communication 6 A - Lehigh Valley Planning Commission - Memo - Zoning Ordinance Amendments - Miscellaneous and Design Standards*

A correspondence dated November 3, 2022 was received from Jillian Seitz, Senior Community Planner of the Lehigh Valley Planning Commission. The LVPC Comprehensive Planning Committee reviewed the proposed two zoning ordinance amendments. It is noted that many of the proposed changes are minor in nature and provide language clarifications that improve usability of the ordinance. The LVPC commends the reduced parking minimums proposed in Section 4 Article 1319.01(a)(1) for multi-family dwellings/apartments with two or fewer bedrooms and workforce units, which supports context-specific design solutions and promotes more efficient development processes in urban areas.

President Colón called the Public Hearing to order concerning the (2) Zoning Text Amendments entitled Miscellaneous and Design Standards.

Darlene Heller, Director of Planning and Zoning, outlined the proposed changes. Ms. Heller noted that this Zoning Ordinance was enacted in 2012, but the staff occasionally provides updates in instances in which perhaps wording was not clear, some matters repetitively come before the Zoning Hearing Board and it becomes unnecessary or some things that are just not working efficiently. She began with the ordinance known as Miscellaneous Amendments. "Building to line" for front-yard setbacks in the core area of the City is desirable to match infill structures with existing structures on the block. The new provision suggests that new buildings should be within five feet in front or in back with the majority of the other buildings on the block. This applies to the CB and CL zoning districts. This would add the RT District. Section 2 deals with clear-sight triangles at corners. Some

exemptions exist, such as utility poles or signs. The proposal is to add porch posts. Also, the placement of drive-throughs are limited. It is preferred that they be placed to the rear of a building. If it is proposed anywhere else, Planning Commission review would be necessary.

The next change deals with parking. For multi-family dwellings and apartments, 1.75 parking spaces are now required per unit. The proposal would reduce this to 1.5. It has been found that excess parking now exists in the downtown areas for the new developments being constructed. They do not need as much parking as they used to. The City also is encouraging making its streets more walkable and more bike friendly. Walking and biking is encouraged in the core of the City. The Climate Action Plan also encourages reduction in impervious coverage. Language also states that if there is no ability to park on the street, additional parking must be made available, but that number would decrease from 2 per unit to 1.75. A section also has been added to encourage affordable or workforce units. In these instances, required parking would be reduced to one per unit.

Section 5 deals with wall and projecting signs in the core of the district. Signs cannot exceed 20 percent of the building face in CB and CL now. The maximum is 200 square feet. The proposal still would cap the size in the CB zone at 20 percent, but the 200-square-foot maximum would be removed.

Section 6 involves multi-family special provisions. Fifteen feet of green space is required between the building and parking. This was not required in the IR-R, CB and CL Districts. The new provision would also not require this buffer in the RT District. The front yard requirement in Article 1322.03.11(7)(i) would be eliminated in an effort to encourage more uniform setbacks and placement closer to the street.

Section 8 uses language from the Municipalities Planning Code (MPC). It states that a Zoning Hearing Board member may not hold any other elected or appointed City office and cannot be an employee. The Mayor also cannot remove any member for cause. Removal by the mayor is not permitted by the MPC and is being eliminated. However, removal provisions that are permitted are being added.

Section 9 deals with who may initiate a zoning amendment. The Planning and Zoning Bureau is being added. Ms. Heller said this permissibility was presumed in the past. The Planning and Zoning Bureau often is the source of amendments because it works with these things every day. However, to make the Zoning Ordinance clearer and more precise, it is suggested that this provision be added. Section 10 adds the timing of when the proposal shall be acted upon.

Section 11 is meant to clarify the language of the Student Overlay District. It better specifies where student housing is permitted and the boundaries are located.

Ms. Heller next addressed the Design Standards section. It has been clarified that an applicant seeking relief should go before the Planning Commission. Language is now clearer that the Zoning Hearing Board has jurisdiction over the Zoning Ordinance and the Planning Commission has jurisdiction on the Subdivision and Land Development Ordinance (SALDO). Removal of elements that appeared to overlap will be removed. Some other sections were repetitious, such as those involving trees. Much of this article is being deleted.

**Council Comment:**

President Colón asked what a workforce unit is.

Ms. Heller said it is considered to be a residence that a young professional could afford. This is sometimes confused with subsidized housing but it is not.

President Colón next asked the motivation of reducing the number of parking spaces required for workforce units.

Ms. Heller believed that the rationale was both to offer incentives for developers to build more workforce units. Sometimes parking can be an issue. She also believed that those with more income are more likely to use mass transit.

Ms. Wilhelm thanked Ms. Heller for her patience and knowledge in guiding Council through the process of reviewing the proposed changes.

**Public Comment**

*Benefit to Fewer Parking Spaces/Uniform Setbacks Not as Appealing*

Resident William Scheirer said he recently read that the cost of a surface parking space is about \$20,000. The cost of an underground parking space is about \$60,000. If you reduce the number of parking spaces, it reduces the cost of the housing. But, it also could create gridlock for parking spaces.

As to other proposed changes, he disagreed that uniform setbacks would be a good idea. The streetscape is less interesting. He cited the appeal of Church Street with its varying setbacks.

*Opposes Proposed Changes*

Resident Alex Hirsch disagreed with reducing the parking requirement. He also does not like the reduction in setbacks. He believes this would take away from "the beauty of the City." Mr. Hirsch also did not agree with allowing larger signs, such as a permitted 200-square-foot sign. He said all three of these elements sounded like doing "favors for developers." He said the message of a sign could be conveyed in less than 200 square feet.

President Colón advised that these ordinances will appear on the December 6, 2022 agenda for First Reading with Second Reading/Enactment anticipated at the December 20, 2022 Council meeting.

President Colón adjourned the Public Hearing at 7:24 PM.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

November 1, 2022

3. PUBLIC COMMENT (on any subject not being voted on this evening – 5 Minute Time Limit)

*EAC Annual Report*

Lynn Rothman provided the annual report on behalf of the Environmental Advisory Council. In June the EAC began to hold hybrid monthly meetings at Illick's Mill and via Zoom. In September, it changed its meeting location to the Northampton Community College Fowler Family Center on 3rd Street, in order to be more accessible in terms of location and public transportation. In accordance with the Sunshine Laws, meetings are open to the public and the EAC routinely benefits from outside attendance. Its most important work is supporting the City's Climate Action Plan (CAP), which aims to reduce our carbon footprint, increase sustainability and utilize alternative energy sources. In order to realize the goals of the CAP, the EAC worked with the City's Departments of Planning and Zoning, Codes and Fire to update the City's solar ordinances. The proposed amendments were recommended to City Council by the Environment and Human Resources Committee, the Lehigh Valley Planning Commission and Bethlehem City Planning Commission. City Council will vote on the ordinance at its December 6 meeting.

Additional Accomplishments for 2022 include:

Letters

The Department of Planning and Zoning gives the EAC the opportunity to comment and make recommendations for proposed developments. Our recommendations are based on furthering the goals of the CAP. All of our correspondence can be found on our website [www.bethleHEMEAC.org](http://www.bethleHEMEAC.org) and includes the following projects:

- 413 - 415 E. Third Street
- Nurture Nature Center Grant
- Westgate Mall Phase 3
- 218 – 226 W. Union Blvd
- LVIP VII Lot 90
- LVIP VII Lot 63
- 130 W. Goepp Street
- 2040 Ave
- 128 E. 3rd Street
- 2854 Linden Street
- Solar Ordinance Recommendations
- Tower Place
- Frankford Street Townhomes
- 3677 Commerce Blvd.
- 1780 E. Fourth Street; Lots 24A/24B
- 1559 Kelchner Road
- 2897 Easton Avenue

EAC 2022 Activities

- Membership on the Pedestrian Bridge Working Group
- Membership on the City's Climate and Environmental Justice Council

- Commented on the proposed revisions to the SALDO
- Commented on the Urban Forestry Master Plan
- Held successful clean-up of the Monocacy Creek in partnership with the Monocacy Creek Watershed Association
- Tabled at Rose Fest at the Bethlehem Rose Garden
- EAC members mentored three Lehigh University students in internships regarding Green Restaurants and Tree Ordinances
- Joined the Sierra Club and Coalition for Appropriate Transportation in forums on "Bethlehem As A Biking City".
- Attended WeConserve PA Roundtable: EACs and Environmental Justice
- Maintained and updated our website and Facebook page with increasing numbers of followers
- Created an Instagram account
- Re-engaged with Bird Town PA; currently working on an annual report on behalf of City
- Bethlehem, Allentown and Easton EACs coordinated a virtual Lehigh Valley EAC Network Forum featuring Becky Bradley, Executive Director of LVPC
- Continued to welcome members of the public to raise issues and participate on Committees

#### Speakers at EAC Monthly Meetings

- Anna Smith, southside resident and community activist: Southside Development and Environmental Justice
- Kathryn Semmens, Science Director, Nurture Nature Center: CREATE Resilience project and NOAA grant
- Angela DelGrosso Stein, Director of Mayor's Initiatives, and Janine Santoro, Director of Equity and Inclusion: Climate Action Plan
- Lehigh student Kendall O'Farrell: Urban Forestry Master Plan
- Lehigh students Alyssa Klinger and Emilie Cohen: Green Restaurants
- Steve Fernstrom, Executive Director of Bethlehem Parking Authority: Sustainability of operations
- Lehigh students Emily Newman, Corena Munroe, Maddie Watts and Kat Neumann: Southside Permaculture Park
- Anna Lazewski, Liberty High School student: Sustainability on the Monocacy
- Updated EAC bylaws
- Lehigh students Alexa Giraudon and Vaniah Barrera: PromiseCorps
- Heidi Shiver, President: Bird Town PA

Bethlehem Backyards for Wildlife is an active standing committee of the EAC with a dedicated group of volunteers. In the winter of 2022 Katie Trembler and Vibhor Kumar joined the EAC. In June, council member Beth Behrend stepped down. She was an invaluable member, chairing our Waste Reduction Committee and spearheading our proposed ban of single use plastic bags, for which we continue to work and research. In September we welcomed new member Mandy Tolino in her place. The Commission offered great appreciation to Tad Miller, City Clerk, and Judy Kelechava, Assistant City Clerk, for their assistance. They respond immediately to all of our requests and questions, place meeting notices in the newspaper and facilitate communication between the EAC and City Council. Additional appreciation to

Stephanie Augello, Chief of Staff, for facilitating communication with the Mayor's office. Members further complimented Darlene Heller, Director of Planning & Zoning, Chief Building Inspector Mike Simonson, Deputy Chief Craig Baer and former EAC members Brian Nicas and Elisabeth Cichonski for their work on the amendments to the solar ordinance. They were all extremely generous with their time and were of great assistance. Also, City Council liaison, Kiera Wilhelm, for her input, support, attendance at our meetings and continued efforts on behalf of climate action. They also acknowledge and thank Craig Peiffer, Assistant Director of Planning and Zoning, Michael Alkhal, Director of Public Works, and Steve Fernstrom, Executive Director of the Bethlehem Parking Authority, for their ongoing contributions to Bethlehem City. We commend City Council and the Administration for their support of the CAP and initiatives to make Bethlehem a greener, more pedestrian and bike friendly city. In 2023 we will continue to assist in implementing the goals and strategies of the CAP.

#### Bethlehem Backyards for Wildlife (BBFW) - Overview 2022

Mission: To work with the City of Bethlehem to support biodiversity and minimize negative environmental impacts by encouraging city residents, schools, businesses, and other organizations to implement wildlife-friendly and sustainable garden practices.

Native Plant Demonstration Gardens maintained by the BBFW committee and community volunteers: Meadow on the Southside Greenway, Hoover-Mason Trestle at the Steel Stacks, and the Rose Garden Pollinator Garden on the West Side

#### 2022 Highlights:

- Rose Garden Pollinator Garden – expanded and maintained the two native perennial gardens on 8th Ave that BBFW designed and planted in 2019
- Rose Garden – assisted with maintaining the refurbished pollinator garden beds at the Rose Garden

#### On-going projects:

In 2022, we were able to return to a full complement of volunteers to maintain the Hoover-Mason Trestle and the other native garden areas, all of which are a valuable asset to the City of Bethlehem. Twenty-five interns from PPL and Air Products spent a morning in May learning how to identify and remove the weeds from the ten garden beds along the Hoover-Mason Trestle at Steel Stacks. They also planted new native perennials in the beds to bring more blooming plants into the walkway garden beds. We look forward to continuing this relationship next year.

#### *Next Steps?*

Resident Alex Hirsch said it has now been 123 days since he has been told that he no longer qualifies for the Residential Parking Permit program and yet he does not appear to be closer to re-entry. He lives part-time in Bethlehem and Rhode Island, but can no longer participate because he does not have a Pennsylvania driver's license or vehicle registration. A few weeks ago, he proposed changing the ordinance to allow participation if a motorist could provide documentation that they pay local income tax, property tax, a water bill or something similar to

prove residency. He asked if he should submit proposed language to this effect or if anyone on Council would do the same in order to initiate consideration of his proposal.

*Set an Example*

Resident Arthur Curatola reminded Council that he has said in the past that Bethlehem should set an example for proper conduct. He said it is customary for government to take everything it can from the lower and middle classes but see that the upper class is taken care of. Specifically, Mr. Curatola said that it is customary in other cities that an extra hour is given to motorists with handicap parking plates or licenses by meters or designated parking zones. He learned a few weeks ago that this courtesy is no longer afforded in Bethlehem. He asked at what point did Bethlehem stop this practice. He said the public was not notified.

*Misnomer?*

Resident William Scheirer said that he would be paying his quarterly bill tomorrow for charges and fees that he said are “really taxes pretending to be something else.” These are for water, sewer, recycling, and stormwater sewer fees. He said his comments are not meant to be particularly critical of this administration. Other administrations and municipalities do the same. He said he considers these to be taxes because they are required payments for services provided by City government. Mr. Scheirer said that governments prefer to call these charges and fees rather than taxes because it allows government officials to say that they have not raised taxes even though we should expect taxes to rise because the cost of living almost always rises. So, to say that taxes have not been raised is only a half-truth. Mr. Scheirer asserted that not only are these “charges and fees” really taxes, but they are regressive taxes because we all pay the same amount for the services regardless of income level. He suggested that it would be nice if Bethlehem would lead the way in transparency in this area.

*Ask Questions*

Resident Stephen Antalics said that when Council Members were elected to serve, they accepted a role as a public servant and watchdog over negative actions or misdeeds by the Administration. He said there has been a lot of comment about appointments to various City commissions. In some cases, highly qualified people were not reappointed or there were some on the agenda to be appointed but the matter did not come up. As a watchdog, questions need to be asked about the circumstances of these events. Yet he said they are not. Not asking these questions and allowing the status quo is depriving the City of having qualified people in these positions. Meanwhile, highly qualified people are languishing, wishing to serve but not being allowed to. He called that negligence and asked if that is because those on Council and the Administration are all “members of the same club”, the Democratic Party. Or, is because of “passivity”? He said it is bothersome that Council – as the watchdog – is not asking the questions that need to be asked.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT (on ordinances and resolutions to be voted on by Council this evening – 5 Minute Time Limit)

*Caution Advised/Contract Reviews*

Resident William Scheirer cautioned to be careful when moving anything from the Zoning Ordinance to the SALDO to be sure that it is binding in SALDO before being legally removed from the Zoning Ordinance to protect the City's rights. He cautioned not to have a period in which certain prior restrictions are not enforceable so as to avoid an unwanted rush by developers to propose legally binding actions that are undesirable to City residents.

Mr. Scheirer also asserted that Council does not get much information on contracts that members are asked to approve. It is good that Council approval is sought, but members are in an awkward position. They are asked to trust that the Administration has done the right thing. If they ask questions, it may appear that they do not trust the Administration. He suggested that Council be provided with more information including demonstrated need, demonstrating that a contractor could do work more efficiently than perhaps staff, the number of proposals received, whether the lowest bid is being recommended and if not, why not, and how the proposals were evaluated. He suggested that when the Administration meets to award a contract, the chairperson of the associated Council committee be present, take part in the discussion but not vote. The chairperson could relay details and inform other Council members.

*Council Needs More Detail on Appointments*

Resident Stephen Antalics noted the appointment to the Zoning Hearing Board listed on tonight's agenda. He said questions that he might have include when a person is appointed, it implies a vacancy. He wondered if this vacancy was created by a person resigning and not reapplying or if they have not been asked to reapply, implying that they were qualified before but not after they had served their term. He suggested that the public and City Council needs to know information from the Administration as to these circumstances. He referred to Article 9 of the 3rd Class City Code stating that Council shall have the authority to appoint and remove all City officers other than elected officials. With this power, Council needs to be more active in the process of appointing those to or boards and commissions.

5. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Members of Council
- B. Tabled Items
- C. Unfinished Business

6. COMMUNICATIONS

- B. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Brendan Stanton, Inc. dba BSI Electrical Contractors – Chemically Enhanced Primary Settling Project – Electrical Construction Contract*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated November 1, 2022 from Edward Boscola, Director of Water & Sewer Resources, recommending a contract with Brendan Stanton, Inc. d/b/a BSI Electrical Contractors. The project consists of installation of components to improve the overall organic treatment capacity of the wastewater treatment plant. The electrical contract consists of a base bid plus one alternate. The base bid includes upgrading the existing electrical distribution



system to provide power to the new equipment, providing terminations and controls for heat tracing, and upgrading the instrumentation/SCADA system to facilitate implementation of the project components. The alternate bid includes construction of reinforced concrete communication ductbank, providing above ground and underground raceways and boxes and providing fiber optic cables including terminations and testing. The contract is for \$674,000. Substantial completion is required within 365 days from the Notice to Proceed with final completion required within 395 days of the Notice to Proceed. There are no renewals.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 A is on the agenda.

- C. *Director of Community and Economic Development – Recommendation of Award – Republic Services of NJ, LLC dba Raritan Valley Disposal – Curbside Recycling*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated November 15, 2022 from Laura Collins, Director of Community and Economic Development, recommending a contract with Republic Services of New Jersey, LLC d/b/a Raritan Valley Disposal, to provide curbside recycling services. The price of the initial two-year term of the contract is \$3,523,212. It is broken down by Year 1 as \$1,718,640; and Year 2 as \$1,804,572. The contract shall commence on January 1, 2023 and run through December 31, 2024. The City and the Contractor shall have the option for five (5) additional renewal terms of one (1) year each upon mutual consent of the parties.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 B is on the agenda.

- D. *Parking Authority Director – Resolution – Residential Parking Permit – S. 900 Block of Spring Street*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated November 9, 2022 from Steven Fernstrom, Executive Director of the Bethlehem Parking Authority, recommending that the 900 block of South Spring Street be included in the Residential Permit Parking program. A majority of the residents of the 900 block has signed a petition submitted to the Parking Authority. The Authority held a required Public Hearing on the matter at its September 28, 2022 meeting. The Authority's Board of Directors approved advancing this action to City Council for its consideration.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 C is on the agenda.

- E. *Director of Public Works – Recommendation of Award – Bracalente Construction, Inc. – City Hall Garage Surface Repair -Price Increase*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated November 9, 2022 from Michael Alkhal, Director of Public Works, with an attached Resolution, recommending a contract with Bracalente Construction, Inc. involving City Hall Garage Surface Repair. The original contract price was \$265,957.69, the sum of all change orders is \$44,810.41, and the updated total price is \$310,768.10. The change order was necessary to cover additional work and increase in quantities of asphalt tonnage.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 D is on the agenda.

F. *Director of Community and Economic Development – Ordinance – Amend Article 933 – Recycling Fee*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated November 9, 2022 from Laura Collins, Director of the Department of Community and Economic Development, on behalf of the Recycling Bureau. The memorandum recommends that Council enact an ordinance to amend Article 933 to increase the recycling fee effective January 1, 2023.

President Colón stated Ordinance 9 B is on the agenda for First Reading.

G. *Superintendent of Water Supply & Treatment – ARPA H10 PA Grant - Resolution*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated November 10, 2022 from Stephen Pallone, Superintendent of Water Supply & Treatment, requesting Council support of an application to the Pennsylvania Department of Community and Economic Development for a Covid-19 ARPA H2O PA Grant. The grant will assist in replacing the nearly 100-year-old Southwest Reservoir located along Mountain Drive North in Lower Saucon Township. The estimated \$1,935,450 project will demolish the existing reservoir and replace it with a 1-million-gallon tank. The grant is for \$1,290,300. The City would have to match not less than 50% of the cost, so it must pay \$645,150. Construction is not expected until 2024 at which time the appropriate funds will be budgeted in the Water Capital Account.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 E is on the agenda.

H. *Director of Community and Economic Development – Resolution – PY 2022 CDBG/HOME Annual Action Plan*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated November 10, 2022 from Laura Collins, Director of the Department of Community and Economic Development asking Council to submit to HUD an amended Program Year 2022 CDBG/HOME Annual Action Plan. This amendment is procedural and the primary purpose is to allow the City to submit its Program Year 2023 annual action plan next year, once the actual HUD allocation figures are known.

President Colón stated Resolution 10 F is on the agenda.

7. REPORTS

A. *President of Council*

B. *Mayor*

1. *Administrative Order – Lea B. Grigsby – Zoning Hearing Board*

Mayor Reynolds appointed Lea B. Grigsby to the Zoning Hearing Board, effective through December, 2026. Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-229 to confirm the appointment.

Dr. Enix said that she did not receive a resume for Ms. Grigsby.

President Colón said he received one. Additional discussion among Council Members indicated that a resume was included in Council's meeting packet but not clipped to the Administrative Order from the Mayor.

Dr. Enix was given a copy of the resume for her review.

Dr. Van Wirt requested that Council be made aware of whose seat is being filled and the circumstances of the opening, such as if a previous commissioner chose not to re-apply.

Ms. Crampsie Smith also asked if information for these appointments could be provided to Council a week or two before consideration rather than just the Friday before to afford more time for review of qualifications. She also applauded anyone willing to serve on these boards, but she reminded that City Council recently passed a Conflict-of-Interest Ordinance. She wanted to be sure that candidates do not have an inherent conflict of interest or, if they do, that they know to recuse themselves when appropriate. She wants to be careful of appointments and to be sure that Council is following the conflict-of-interest guidelines for recusal when necessary.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Resolution passed.

#### *Budget Preparation Efforts/Christmas Events*

Mayor Reynolds offered his thanks to those who worked on this year's budget, including Business Administrator Eric Evans and Director of Budget and Finance Linnea Lazarchak and all department heads. He also reminded that the Christmas Tree Lighting Ceremony will be at 5:00 PM on Friday. Christkindlmarkt will begin on Friday as well and will continue every Friday, Saturday, and Sunday through December 18.

#### 8. ORDINANCES FOR FINAL PASSAGE

None.

#### 9. NEW ORDINANCES

As new ordinances were about to be considered, President Colón reminded everyone that those related to the 2023 Budget would require two readings and votes. Tonight, will be the first reading. The second reading is scheduled for December 20. If any amendments are proposed, they would occur at a potential December 5 meeting. He said tonight's vote would be procedural to start the process. The opportunity will come for questions and review by each department in the coming weeks prior to potential amendments and the eventual Second Reading/Enactment.

#### A. *Bill No. 26-2022 – Amend Zoning Ordinance – Solar Energy Devices*

The Clerk read Bill No. 26-2022 –Amend Zoning Ordinance – Solar Energy Devices, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE ZONING ORDINANCE,  
PART 13 OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM, LEHIGH

AND NORTHAMPTON COUNTIES, PENNSYLVANIA,  
AMENDING SOLAR ENERGY DEVICES

Ms. Kwiatek thanked Ms. Heller for supplying a version of the ordinance showing additions and deletions to clarify the differences between the existing ordinance and the proposed language. She also thanked those who worked on the update.

Ms. Wilhelm also thanked Ms. Rothman for the EAC's efforts. She said this would show a demonstrable positive effect on sustainability in the City. She said she was honored to work with the EAC.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 26-2022 was passed on First Reading.

*B. Bill No. 27-2022 – Amend Article 933 – Recycling Fee*

The Clerk read Bill No. 27-2022 – Amend Article 933 – Recycling Fee, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM, COUNTIES OF  
LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON, COMMONWEALTH OF  
PENNSYLVANIA, AMENDING ARTICLE 933 ENTITLED,  
RECYCLING, OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF  
BETHLEHEM BY INCREASING THE RECYCLING FEE.

Ms. Leon asked about how the increase would work over the course of the year and if the recycling bill is paid late if it could adversely affect the other services that they are receiving.

Ms. Collins noted that the proposed increase is \$20 per year, but would be broken down into \$5 in each quarterly bill. She added that these quarterly bills include not only recycling but also water, sewer, and stormwater fees, so they are all included in one bill. Late fees would be applied to the entire bill. She believed that there is an 11-day grace period.

Mr. Evans said there is a "lengthy grace period." These services are billed together for efficiency. He said it is not the City's goal to collect penalties for late payments. Instead, they just want to collect the funding necessary to provide the services.

Mayor Reynolds recognized Ms. Leon's concerns for some who are struggling to make ends meet. He added that in the case of someone unable to meet the payment deadline for water or sewer service their water is not turned off the next day. He is aware that over the years the City has been willing to work with people. There need to be regulations and rules out of fairness to other customers and to cover the City's costs, but there is a willingness to try to be compassionate to help people through rough times.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 27-2022 was passed on First Reading.

C. *Bill No. 28-2022 – Adopting the 2023 General Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 28-2022 – Adopting the 2023 General Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE GENERAL FUND BUDGET FOR 2023

President Colón said the budget books were received last week, and he attended the Mayor's Budget Address on Friday when highlights were announced. He invited the public to attend Council's upcoming meetings that will detail revenues and expenditures. He said this is arguably the most important work that Council does.

Mayor Reynolds said he has asked all of the department heads to prepare their presentations to outline what their accomplishments have been in the past year and goals for 2023, but if Council wants a department head to focus on explaining certain aspects of their budget, they should not hesitate to ask.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 28-2022 was passed on First Reading.

D. *Bill No. 29-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Water Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 29-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Water Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE WATER FUND BUDGET FOR 2023

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 29-2022 was passed on First Reading.

E. *Bill No. 30-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Sewer Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 30-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Sewer Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE SEWER FUND BUDGET FOR 2023

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 30-2022 was passed on First Reading.

*F. Bill No. 31-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Golf Course Enterprise Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 31-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Golf Course Enterprise Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE GOLF COURSE ENTERPRISE FUND BUDGET FOR 2023

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 31-2022 was passed on First Reading.

*G. Bill No. 32-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Liquid Fuels Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 32-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Liquid Fuels Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE LIQUID FUELS FUND BUDGET FOR 2023

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 32-2022 was passed on First Reading.

*H. Bill No. 33-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Capital Budget for Non-Utilities*

The Clerk read Bill No. 33-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Capital Budget for Non-Utilities, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE 2023 CAPITAL BUDGET FOR NON-UTILITIES

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 33-2022 was passed on First Reading.

*I. Bill No. 34-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Capital Budget for Water Utilities*

The Clerk read Bill No. 34-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Capital Budget for Water Utilities, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE 2023 CAPITAL BUDGET FOR WATER UTILITIES

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 34-2022 was passed on First Reading.

J. *Bill No. 35-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Capital Budget for Sewer Utilities*

The Clerk read Bill No. 35-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Capital Budget for Sewer Utilities, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING  
THE 2023 CAPITAL BUDGET FOR SEWER UTILITIES

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 35-2022 was passed on First Reading.

K. *Bill No. 36-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Community Development Block Grant Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 36-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Community Development Block Grant Budget, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,  
ADOPTING THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT  
BLOCK GRANT BUDGET FOR 2023

Dr. Van Wirt clarified that this ordinance relates to the \$1.4 million to purchase and develop a non-congregate emergency shelter. This is under CDBG. The matter not being voted on at this time is the general and civic expenses in the budget for the homeless initiative allotting \$2 million. This was discussed at a previous joint committee meeting. She understands the need to support a shelter, but she is asking that the Administration come forward “with really hard data” on how annual operating expenses will be paid, whether that falls under discussion of CDBG or the civic expenses, it is just something she believed should be discussed while this money, coming from the American Rescue Plan, is being committed to the shelter. She added that the yearly operating expenses must come from elsewhere and that source should be discussed.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 36-2022 was passed on First Reading.

L. *Bill No. 37-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Storm Water Fund Budget*

The Clerk read Bill No. 37-2022 – Adopting the 2023 Storm Water Fund Budget, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, ADOPTING

THE STORM WATER FUND BUDGET FOR 2023

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 37-2022 was passed on First Reading.

M. *Bill No. 38-2022 – Fixing the 2023 Tax Rate for All City Purposes*

The Clerk read Bill No. 38-2022 – Fixing the 2023 Tax Rate for All City Purposes, sponsored by Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith and titled:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF BETHLEHEM,  
COUNTIES OF LEHIGH AND NORTHAMPTON,  
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, FIXING  
THE TAX RATE FOR ALL CITY PURPOSES  
FOR THE YEAR 2023

President Colón noted that the proposed real estate tax rate has remained the same for 2023 as it was for 2022.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. Bill No. 38-2022 was passed on First Reading.

10. RESOLUTIONS

A. *Approve Contract – Brendan Stanton, Inc. dba BSI Electrical Contractors – Chemically Enhanced Primary Settling Project – Electrical Construction Contract*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-230 that authorized to execute an Agreement with Brendan Stanton, Inc. dba BSI Electrical Contractors for specified work at the wastewater treatment plant.

Ms. Kwiatek asked whether the cost of \$674,000 included the alternate bid as well as the base work and materials.

Mr. Boscola confirmed that this would include the additional elements in the alternate bid including construction of reinforced concrete communication ductbank, raceways and boxes and fiber optic cables for terminations and testing.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Resolution passed.

B. *Approve Contract – Republic Services of NJ, LLC dba Raritan Valley Disposal – Curbside Recycling*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-231 that authorized to execute an Agreement with Republic Services of NJ, LLC dba Raritan Valley Disposal for curbside recycling services.



President Colón thanked Ms. Collins for the notice some weeks ago that recycling costs would be rising. He asked that single-versus dual-stream recycling be explained and how this contract will change past practice.

Ms. Collins said the contract proposes switching from dual-stream to single-stream recycling. Dual-stream required separation of different materials by residents for pick-up, such as cardboard from glass. The materials were kept separate during the recycling process. Single-stream allows residents to mix materials and for all to be collected in one truck. Separation occurs by the recycling service. She said that Recycling Director Michael Halbfoerster will be working on educational materials including a flier to advise the public on how the process will change. Ms. Collins added that one of the concerns about single-stream recycling is that the materials can be less clean as liquids may spill from bottles and cans onto paper and cardboard. Best practices will need to be conveyed to the public, so that is part of what the educational materials will be about. She also confirmed that single-stream recycling is the least-expensive method. This was done to save money in the face of the price increase. Both the dual-stream and the single-stream options were bid. The City also bid processing the materials themselves as opposed to the hauler doing so. The lowest bid is what is being presented to Council. Ms. Collins said it is also believed that more people will participate in recycling with the single-stream option because it is simpler.

President Colón also confirmed terms of the contract. The contract locks both parties into two years and then there are five, single-year options.

Ms. Collins said that the expiring contract was a four-year pact entered into in 2018. 2023 would have been the first of a potential five, one-year renewals but, because of market conditions, the contractor declined to exercise the contract.

Conversely, President Colón said the City could potentially opt out of any renewals after two years if it was thought that it was more favorable to rebid under those financial conditions. Ms. Collins agreed.

Dr. Van Wirt recalled that then-Director of DCED Alicia Karner outlined the expiring contract in 2018 and described the recyclables market as challenging. It was said at that time that recyclable material was being bought overseas, but the market was decreasing and there were backlogs of materials. She questioned whether there is a future for the City's materials.

Ms. Collins said that Republic collects recyclables and takes them to the City's recycling center and places it into bunkers. Cougle's then picks up the materials.

Mr. Halbfoerster said he does spot check to be sure the materials are being properly transported. He added that the City had gotten \$800,000 for its materials back in 2012, and that number is now down to \$100,000. That shows how much the market has deteriorated over the last 10 years.

Dr. Van Wirt also asked if anything else will change about recycling, including the frequency of pick-ups.

Mr. Halbfoerster said that nothing else is changing.

Ms. Kwiatek confirmed that changes will be effective January 1, not yet. She also wondered what impact this will have on the contract with Cougle's, believing that this would be more work for them.

Mr. Halbfoerster said there should not be much of a change. There will be some extra sorting.

Ms. Kwiatek also thanked the administration for its early warning that an increase was coming. She noted that the \$20 per year increase is more painful to some than others, yet she considered the City somewhat lucky that it was not worse given the involved factors. She thanked those responsible for getting the City a "reasonable contract."

Ms. Crampsie Smith asked whether pick-up schedules or zones will change.

Mr. Halbfoerster said schedules will remain the same.

Ms. Crampsie asked for more detail on alerting the public of the changes.

Ms. Collins said a mailed flier is expected to be the best method. But information will be included in the City's newsletter. This will come out later in the year but can serve as a reminder. Social media and the City website can be used, and those with questions may call the recycling center.

Ms. Crampsie Smith also noted that the name of the recycler is Republic Services of NJ, LLC doing business as Raritan Valley Disposal. She asked for clarification on the business arrangement.

Mr. Halbfoerster said that Raritan Valley was a privately owned company that was acquired in the early 2000s by Republic Services of New Jersey. So, rather than go through the permitting process all over again, this was what the name was legally changed to. So, this is still the same company.

Ms. Wilhelm asked about the potential renewal years. She noted language that said the increases could not be more than 5 percent.

Ms. Collins explained that the costs for the first two contract years are stated. The potential 5 percent increases would apply to the renewal years if both parties agree to them.

Mayor Reynolds noted that the single-stream will be easier for residents to follow. He added that, in theory, the City should gain in volume because of the single-stream provision. Mayor Reynolds commended Dr. Van Wirt for her legitimate question as to whether recycling remains financially worthwhile. He said that reducing the amount of materials that we are using is perhaps the key component and an additional goal, but reuse is important also. Recycling is not as good as it once was. We also need other behavior change in addition to recycling.

President Colón also pointed to a line item under department earnings. The amount for market for commodities has dropped significantly.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Resolution passed.

C. *Approve Resolution – Residential Parking Permit – S. 900 Block of Spring Street*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-232 that approved the Residential Permit Parking area at S. 900 Spring Street. The Bethlehem Parking Authority Board of Directors has moved to recommend inclusion of this block in the RPP program.

Ms. Kwiatek said this was the first time there has been an RPP request while she has been on Council, so she contacted Mr. Fernstrom to learn more about the program. Where an RPP does not already exist, neighbors can petition the Parking Authority if they have signatures from at least 50 percent of the neighbors. She learned the criteria required for RPP zone consideration beyond gathering sufficient signatures. She wondered if it was necessary to guarantee all residents a parking space on the common areas of City streets. Ms. Kwiatek said she would like to further study the RPP system in the near future and added that she would be voting no on this resolution. She said that we seem to have a zoned parking system in the City and then there is an application system within those zones to have an RPP and yet there is still a way that if you are not in a zone, you can also apply to create a zone.

Dr. Van Wirt also spoke with Mr. Fernstrom. She believed that this ordinance is rather old and might not reflect the best City parking practices now. She said the BPA just received a prestigious accreditation and she believes in his guidance in trying to accommodate parking in tight areas. But, the City is also trying to not encourage having two cars for every house. We are trying to encourage pedestrian friendly conditions. She believes this may be a good time to update the practices.

Ms. Kwiatek noted that there have been some zones that have been added over the years, so there are some from 1990 and some from 2005 or so.

Ms. Crampsie Smith said some of her neighbors at one time considered applying for an RPP zone. In the end, they did not after their own evaluation of what was involved. One issue would be if a family has an adult child visiting and whether someone would have to park elsewhere. Ms. Crampsie Smith said that she would support this request because it is stated that the majority of the people in the requested block want the RPP designation.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, and Mr. Colón, 6. Voting NAY: Ms. Kwiatek, 1. The Resolution passed.

D. *Approve Contract – Bracalente Construction, Inc. – City Hall Garage Surface Repair – Price Increase*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-233 that authorized to execute an agreement with Bracalente Construction, Inc. for a change order associated with the City Hall Garage Surface Repair project.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Resolution passed.

*E. Approve Resolution – ARPA H20 PA Grant*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-234 that authorized Mayor J. William Reynolds and Director of Water and Sewer Resources to execute all documents and agreements to facilitate and assist in obtaining the requested grant.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Resolution passed.

*F. Approve Resolution – Approval of PY 2022 CDBG/HOME Annual Action Plan*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-235 that approved the Annual Action Plan for PY 2022 for the City of Bethlehem for the period from January 1, 2022 to December 31, 2022 and authorized to submit the PY 2022 CDBG/HOME Annual Action Plan and the necessary assurances and certifications for HUD approval.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Resolution passed.

*Motion – Considering Resolutions 10 G through 10 J as a group – Certificates of Appropriateness*

Ms. Wilhelm made a motion, seconded by Ms. Crampsie Smith, to consider Resolutions 10 G through 10 J as a group.

Voting AYE: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Motion passed.

*G. Certificate of Appropriateness – 77 West Broad Street*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-236 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to install three directory signs for emergency personnel and customers at 77 West Broad Street.

*H. Certificate of Appropriateness – 574 Main Street*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-237 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to install one double-sided hanging sign on an existing bracket at 574 Main Street.

*I. Certificate of Appropriateness – 438 High Street*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-238 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint certain trim details on the front porch of the home at 438 High Street.

*J. Certificate of Appropriateness – 30 East Market Street*

Ms. Wilhelm and Ms. Crampsie Smith sponsored Resolution No. 2022-239 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to install lighting fixtures at the rear entrances of Apartment #2

and Apartment #5, as well as install lighting fixtures above the left side rear steps. This work is required by a rental inspection on September 15, 2022 at 30 East Market Street.

Voting AYE on Resolutions 10 G through 10 J: Ms. Leon, Dr. Van Wirt, Ms. Wilhelm, Ms. Crampsie Smith, Dr. Enix, Ms. Kwiatek, and Mr. Colón, 7. The Resolutions passed.

11. NEW BUSINESS

*Support of Council Efforts*

Ms. Wilhelm wanted to clarify that a lot of work is done by Council Members beyond simply attending Council meetings. There are many conversations that take place with the Administration, for example. It is understandably that the public is not aware of these, the questions that are asked, and the research that is done. She wanted to provide this assurance that this is an extremely hard-working group. "We are doing the work that you elected us for," she said. "You just can't necessarily see it all."

*Tree Lighting Date*

Ms. Crampsie Smith said she appreciated those comments. She also asked why the tree lighting is happening before Thanksgiving.

Mayor Reynolds believed that last year was the first year for this timing. This came at the request of a lot of the downtown merchants to expand the holiday season. This moved it a week earlier.

*Affordable Apartments?*

Ms. Crampsie Smith also saw the groundbreaking for redevelopment of the Goodman Building. She noted that there will be 12 rental apartments. She said this would be a great opportunity for affordable housing units. She asked if anyone knows what the rates will be.

Mayor Reynolds said the goal is to offer affordable housing. He said the owners have talked about this in the past. At this point, they have said this is their intention, but they need financing and commercial tenants to see what will happen. It is a little early for assurances.

President Colón added that redevelopment of the Goodman Building was a long process. The building was falling down. He said the Law Bureau deserves a lot of credit as well as others at City Hall. Now progress can be made.

*Housing Survey Update?*

President Colón also asked for an update on the housing survey that is online. He asked when the survey will conclude.

Mayor Reynolds said he believes that will be at the end of November. He added that he believes 3,000 already have been completed.

*Believes Contract Process Appropriate/Reminder of Religious Diversity*

Ms. Kwiatek also thanked Ms. Wilhelm for her comments about Council's work ethic. She said she intended to "put in the work" when she took office in January and believes that she and others have done so whether it is making phone calls or writing emails to gain information or sitting down with anyone in the administration. Having said that, she pointed out that serving as a Council Member is a part-time position and that most on Council also have full-time jobs. There are only so many hours in the day. The idea that we would be involved in every RFP award process at the moment of the award is not feasible for our schedules and perhaps not appropriate in every case. However, this information is gathered by the Administration and received by Council in advance of passage. The opportunity is present to ask questions or obtain more information. She appreciates those from the Administration being present at meetings to answer questions that may arise prior to votes. She said that something else weighing on her mind since January is the fact that she is Jewish and lives in the Christmas City and loves it here. But, especially with the rise of antisemitism, to be constantly lectured to about Jesus Christ at a City Council meeting – with a separation of church and state and freedom of religion – she wanted to remind that this is a diverse city. People of many faiths, people of no faith, and people who chose to live their lives in a different way, so she would appreciate if people would be more sensitive concerning diverse religious beliefs. She said she is impacted.

*More Parking Challenges to Come*

Mayor Reynolds said he concurred with all that Councilwoman Kwiatek said. Additionally, he agreed with Dr. Van Wirt that the parking ordinances were written in a different time. As a City, we need to look at that. He agreed with Councilwoman Kwiatek's comments that some people believe that they are entitled to a parking spot in front of their homes paid for by tax dollars, which just is not the case. Mayor Reynolds said the philosophy toward parking will have to change and agreed with Mr. Scheirer that parking is a huge driver when it comes to any type of new housing. There will have to be a tradeoff between parking convenience and how people feel about parking and making parking available versus the cost of housing. It is a big factor. This is why we have to talk about parking minimums. Some decisions will have to be made.

We are going to be tested on that, especially when we start talking about electric charging stations. Electric vehicles are coming. Some of us will put these in our driveway or garage, but many will have to go in the street. We have seen in other cities that the first people who buy electrical vehicles are the people with money. But, you also cannot encourage people to buy electric vehicles if they have no place to plug them in. There is no good answer to this question. We have watched in other cities when they have accepted federal money to install the charging stations how controversial they become in neighborhoods. It happened in Philadelphia. People wondered why the two people who could afford electric cars could have the two spots that now have electric charging stations. It is something that the City will have to be engaged in because those days are coming. He believed that he has heard that the major car companies will not be making any non-electric vehicles by 2035. We cannot wait until 2035 to start building this infrastructure. This will be a challenge in dense neighborhoods such as the downtown and in the areas of our universities. This will take a lot of planning and probably will be a difficult conversion over a number of years, but it is something that we are increasingly going to have to talk about. As we start talking about housing, that parking convenience, and what it is going to do to neighborhoods versus the cost of housing, it is going to be one of those tradeoffs that we are going to have to balance.

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:14 PM.

ATTEST:

Tad J. Miller  
City Clerk