

CITY OF BETHLEHEM

HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

DATE: 6 October 2021

APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD

Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.

Submit original plus 10 copies.

HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION

MEMBERS PRESENT

Beth Starbuck
Marsha Fritz
Diana Hodgson
Connie Postupack
Michael Simonson
Fred Bonsall
Joe McGavin

VISITORS PRESENT/Virtual Attendance

Bruce Campbell, Campbell Real Estate
Fran Gotzon, Lehigh Valley Fence Co.
Kristin Illick, 232 East Wall Street
Flex Illick, 232 East Wall Street
Ed Courrier, Bethlehem Press

MEMBERS ABSENT

Rodman Young

STAFF PRESENT

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer
E-Mail:
jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com

MINUTES

There were no comments on the 1 September 2021 Minutes. A motion was made by Beth Starbuck and seconded by Mike Simonson to approve the minutes as submitted. The Minutes were approved unanimously as submitted. The 6 October 2021 meeting of HARB was called to order by Chairperson, Beth Starbuck at 5:00 PM.

Item #1: The applicant/owner of the property located at 14 West Church Street proposes to paint their home and garage.

Property Location: 14 West Church Street

Property Owner: Campbell Real Estate

Applicant: Bruce Campbell

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 14 West Church Street proposes to paint their home and garage. The proposed paint colors for the various building elements, as manufactured by BEHR, are as follows.

- Siding: Livingston
- Trim & Rails: Swiss Coffee
- Front, Side, & Garage Doors: Deep Breath
- Fire Escape: Black
- Front Shutters: Upper Shutters – Black
Lower Shutters – Swiss Coffee
- Lattice at Base of Porch: Livingston

Character Defining Features: The two and one-half story structure is topped with a low-sloped gabled roof with two street facing gabled dormers and a simple, molded, unadorned cornice. The smooth brick façade contains two over two light windows fitted with sloped wood hoods and thick sills. The second-floor windows are fitted with dark colored, louvered shutters. The first-floor windows are fitted with light colored paneled shutters. The off-center front door is topped with an arched, fanlight transom window. The two-story wood framed side porch is open on the first floor and infilled on the second floor. The second floor of the porch is clad with wood, fish scale siding. The rear additions are clad with horizontal wood siding and trims.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Marsha Fritz asked if the porch columns would be painted the trim color. The applicant responded in the affirmative. Diana Hodgson asked if the second floor of the porch would be painted and the applicant indicated that is would. Marsha Fritz asked if the Applicant knew what year the building was constructed. Mr. Phillips stated that it likely was built in the late nineteenth century since adjacent buildings were built between 1883 and 1885. Ms. Fritz noted that it was common for buildings such as this, with Italianate details, to be painted in warm colors such as the Applicant was proposing. Connie Postupack asked if the window hoods were proposed to be painted and the Applicant responded in the affirmative. Beth Starbuck asked if the porch floor was going to be painted. The applicant indicated that the porch floor would be painted, but he neglected to specify a color. Marsha Fritz suggested a grey or dark brown color for the porch floor and the Applicant agreed. Beth Starbuck questioned whether the garage doors would be painted Deep Breathe and the adjacent trim painted Swiss

Coffee. The Applicant confirmed this was the case. Marsha Fritz asked if the Applicant was considering replacement of the garage roof. The Applicant indicated that he would like to replace the garage roof at some point in the future and asked if he could get approval to do so with this Application. Beth Starbuck stated that she saw no problem with this as long as the roof was replaced using GAF Slateline Shingles. The Applicant agreed to do so.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the painting of the house and garage, as well as the reroofing of the garage.

Motion: Connie Postupack made a motion to approve the painting of the house and garage, as well as the reroofing of the garage, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. Paint colors shall be as submitted in the Application.
2. The porch floor shall be painted a grey tone or a dark, neutral, brown.
3. The garage trim color will be Swiss Coffee.
4. The garage will be reroofed using GAF Slateline shingles. Any new drip edge material will match the existing, any new gutters will be half round, and the downspouts will either be repainted or replaced with prefinished round downspouts.

Second: Fred Bonsall

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the painting of the house and garage, as well as the reroofing of the garage, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation: Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#5 Distinctive features, finishes, (paint) and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

#9 Exterior alterations (painting) shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #2: The applicant/owner of the property located at 415 High Street proposes to replace an existing wood fence with an earth tone vinyl (PVC) fence.

Property Location: 415 High Street

Property Owner: Mary Louise Brion

Applicant: Mary Louise Brion / Lehigh Valley Fence Co.

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 415 High Street proposes to replace an existing wood fence with an earth tone vinyl (PVC) fence. The existing fence is seven feet tall and the proposed fence will be six feet tall.

Character Defining Features: The two-story Classical Revival home has a cross-gabled slate roof with a central shed dormer. The substantial, modillioned cornice is otherwise simply detailed. The home is constructed of a smooth brick façade with a central, hipped roof entrance porch. The six light over 4 panel entrance door is centered on the entrance porch. The six over one light double hung windows are symmetrically placed. The second-floor windows have heavy wood sills and louvered over paneled shutters. The first-floor windows utilize brick heads and sills and are not fitted with shutters.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. The Applicant, Fran Gotzon, from Lehigh Valley Fence Company, stated that the proposed vinyl fence has a thirty-year fade resistance warranty. Beth Starbuck asked if Mr. Gotzon had installed this exact type of fence on any other projects and, if so, how long have they been completed and subjected to the weather. Mr. Gotzon indicated that he has installed this fence on other projects, but they have only been in place and in the weather for two years. Ms. Starbuck voiced her concern that this was not enough time to establish a history or track record of acceptable performance. Diana Hodgson questioned where the product was made and how it was constructed. The Applicant indicated that the product was manufactured in Buffalo, New York, comes in 8'-0" sections, and that the gateposts had metal inserts and that the top rails and fence "boards" were hollow vinyl. Connie Postupack asked why the fence was being installed. The Applicant responded that fence would have a gate facing the street and would run approximately 100 feet toward the back of the property and butt into the corner of the neighbor's garage to provide a background for the garden. The Applicant further stated that a high-quality cedar fence is either currently unavailable or is overpriced. Beth Starbuck asked why the owner would not just continue the ornamental metal fence that is located on the Wesley Street side of the property. Marsha Fritz asked if the existing wooden fence was beyond repair. The Applicant responded that the posts were rotted and the panels are beyond repair. Joe McGavin stated that he visited the site and agrees that the existing wood fence is beyond repair. Beth Starbuck stated that she was afraid the proposed vinyl fence would look way too uniform and that vinyl fences have not been approved by HARB and are not allowed in the Historic District. Ms. Fritz

stated that HARB is open to new materials, but some products come and go and the proposed product does not have a long history or track record. She further stated that the color of the proposed product will never look natural, unlike cedar that changes over time. Ms. Fritz also explained that the seven-inch width of the proposed vinyl “boards” is not in keeping with the scale of a traditional board width of five inches. Beth Starbuck stated she was not in favor of approval and that HARB would need to see more history, approximately five to ten years, to see how the vinyl product ages and hold up before it could be seriously considered. Diana Hodgson asked the Applicant to encourage the owner to consider matching the metal fence to what exists on the Wesley Street side of the property. Ms. Starbuck also reminded the Applicant that a cedar wood fence was also an appropriate option. Mike Simonson reminded the Applicant that any new fence must be resubmitted to HARB for review and asked the Applicant to inform the owner that she needs to resolve the previous Application that she submitted for reroofing her garage and that she completed without HARB review and without issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The HARB voted to deny the Application as submitted.

Motion:	Beth Starbuck made a motion to deny the application and to consider the installation of a wood or metal fence, in accordance with the discussion outlined above and the Guideline Citation outlined below.
Second:	Diana Hodgson
Result of vote:	The vote was unanimous to deny the application, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#2 The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

#5 Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

#6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Bethlehem Historic District Guidelines

Page 13: Fences: Wood and cast or wrought iron are traditional materials for fences in the City of Bethlehem.

The HARB Discourages:

- Installing non-traditional fencing materials, such as vinyl.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work does not conform with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation or the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have a negative impact on the historic district.

Item #3: The applicant/owner of the property located at 232 East Wall Street proposes to replace eleven windows. Five windows are located on second floor and six windows are located on the third floor.

Property Location: 232 East Wall Street

Property Owner: Kristin Illick & Jeffrey Frank

Applicant: Kristin Illick

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 232 East Wall Street proposes to replace eleven windows. Five windows are located on second floor and six windows are located on the third floor.

On the second floor the existing wood windows in the east and south rear facing rooms (numbers 1 to 4 on the included photographs) will be replaced with "Pella Lifestyle Series Wood Double-Hung Windows" with "Enduraclad Brown" aluminum cladding. These replace the existing aluminum clad windows.

The third-floor existing vinyl windows and second-floor bathroom vinyl windows (numbers 5 to 11 on the included photographs) will be replaced with "ProVia" vinyl windows with exterior aluminum cladding in "dark brown bronze". These will match the existing cladding and new Pella Cladding.

In addition to replacing the existing windows, the applicant will replace rotting sills and repair sills that have pulled away from the home. Existing aluminum arched cladding on the front/street facing third-floor window will not be replaced.

Character Defining Features: The three-story home with a hexagonal slate, gambrel main roof is intersected by a street facing gabled roof with horizontal siding & a pair of arch-topped windows with heavy wood trim and a heavy bracketed cornice. The smooth brick façade includes a full-length, low-slope, hipped, shingled roof porch with decorative, light weight metal supports. One over one light double hung windows are generally fitted with exterior storm windows and have arched brick heads and heavy sills. The second-floor windows on the street façade are fitted with louvered shutters and the first-floor street facing windows are fitted with paneled shutters.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. Diana Hodgson asked the Applicant why she was not replacing the third-floor windows with wood windows. The Applicant responded that the wood windows are more costly, so she is proposing to replace the third-floor windows with vinyl windows that match the existing windows. The Applicant clarified that the vinyl windows are windows number 5,6,7,8,9,10 and 11. Beth Starbuck informed the Applicant that vinyl windows are not allowed in the Historic District and that they are not very long-lasting. The Applicant informed that the existing window openings are racked and shifted in their openings. Marsha Fritz responded that a good builder/craftsmen can shim the windows to fit the opening. Ms. Fritz asked what the materials were that are surrounding the rear windows. The Applicant informed that the siding and materials wrapping the trim are aluminum. Ms. Fritz asked if there was a nearby home with a gable end design that is similar to the applicant's home. The Applicant responded that the home on the right end of the attached row of houses was similar in design to hers. Mr. Phillips provided a photograph of the similar home to the board. The Applicant advised that her contractor told her that he can't replicate or replace the aluminum trim wrap on the arch of the windows on the front gable end. Furthermore, rectangular windows have been installed in the arched openings. Marsha Fritz stated that vinyl windows are just not a good product and asked the Applicant if she would be willing to use the Pella Windows with aluminum cladding in lieu of the vinyl windows. Beth Starbuck suggested talking to other contractors that can repair the existing, original second floor windows. Ms. Starbuck informed the owner that repairing the windows may be the same or less cost as replacing the windows. Mr. Phillips offered to supply the Applicant with a list of window repair/rehabilitation contractors. Ms. Starbuck followed that repairing the windows and installing a storm window will result in a window installation with almost the same R-value of a new double pane window. Marsha Fritz agreed with Beth Starbuck that the Applicant should investigate repair/rehabilitation of the original windows. Ms. Fritz indicated that Pella, Andersen, Marvin, and Northwood manufacture good quality wood windows that would be acceptable for replacing the vinyl/non-original windows. Beth Starbuck advised that there are also quality windows manufactured with a composite of wood and resin materials. The Applicant questioned if the existing vinyl windows could be replaced with new vinyl windows and Ms. Fritz stated that they could not.

The HARB voted to deny the Application as submitted.

Motion:	Marsha Fritz made a motion to deny the application and to consider the repair/rehabilitation of original windows and replacement of the existing vinyl windows with quality wood windows, in accordance with the discussion outlined above and with the following direction.
----------------	--

1. Repair of the original wood windows and the addition of storm windows should be the first priority. (This relates primarily to the second-floor windows.)
2. Since the third-floor windows are not original, the Applicant should investigate the replacement of these windows with quality wood windows.
3. The existing aluminum cladding on the trim surrounding the windows only needs to be replaced if required by the repair or replacement of the existing windows.
4. Composite material windows can be considered as an option for the replacement of non-original windows, but must be submitted to HARB for review.

Second: Beth Starbuck

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to deny the application, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#2 The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

#5 Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

#6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Bethlehem Historic District Guidelines

Page 10 Windows:

The HARB encourages:

- Regular window maintenance, repair, and repainting
- Installing interior or exterior storm windows
- If the applicant can demonstrate evidence of window deterioration requiring replacement, installing true divided light replacement windows with an exterior painted finish that match the material, historic size, shape, operation, muntin pattern, profiles, and detailing to the greatest extent possible

The HARB discourages:

- Decreasing, increasing or altering window size, shape or operation to allow for installation of stock window sizes or picture windows
- Encasing or capping window surrounds with aluminum or vinyl
- Installing vinyl or aluminum clad replacement windows at window openings that are visible from the public right-of-way

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work does not conform with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation or the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have a negative impact on the historic district.

There being no further business, the vote was unanimous to adjourn the meeting at 6:15 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "H. Joseph Phillips". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA
Historic Officer