

CITY OF BETHLEHEM

HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

DATE: 1 June 2022

APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD

Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.

Submit original plus 10 copies.

HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION

MEMBERS PRESENT

Connie Postupack
Diana Hodgson
Joe McGavin
Rodman Young

VISITORS PRESENT

Frank Boyer, 234 East Market Street
Alexis Kovacs, 77 West Broad Street, Unit 17C
Francis Gotzon, 415 High Street
Jeremy T. Carr, 123 East Market Street
Jeff Myers, 258 East Wall Street
Paul Wright Roofing, 243 East Church Street
Ed Courrier, Bethlehem Press

MEMBERS ABSENT

Fred Bonsall
Michael Simonson
Nik Nikolov

STAFF PRESENT

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer
E-Mail:
jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com

The 1 June 2022 meeting of HARB was called to order by Chairperson, Connie Postupack at 5:00 PM.

MINUTES

There were no comments on the 4 May 2022 Minutes and upon a Motion by Diana Hodgson and a Second by Connie Postupack, the Minutes were approved unanimously as submitted.

Item #1: The applicant/owner of the property located at 234 East Market Street proposes to replace the existing slate roofing with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color.

Property Location: 234 East Market Street

Property Owner: Frank & Beth Boyer

Applicant: Frank & Beth Boyer

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 234 East Market Street proposes to replace the existing slate roofing with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate Color. The existing gutters and downspouts are to remain.

Character Defining Features: The two and one-half story home, constructed in the 1860's, has a gabled roof facing the Street, an intersecting gable on the left side, and an intersecting gable dormer roof on the right side. The half round gutters and round downspouts are painted green to match the wood roof trim. The lower two stories consist of a simple brick façade. The upper half story and gable faces are clad in scalloped wood siding. All of the double hung windows, with heavy lintels and sills, are fitted with paneled shutters. The off-center front door, with transom window above, is ornamented with a wood surround, incorporating fluted pilasters and a shallow metal clad hood.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the roof replacement project based on the Application package. Mr. Phillips asked the Applicant if the existing box gutter on the rear section of the house would be reused. The Applicant advised that it would be reused if possible and if it is deteriorated beyond repair, it will be replaced by a half round gutter located at the roof edge. The Applicant advised that the existing slate is original to the home's construction in the 1860's and is beyond the normal replacement and repair that has been done over time. The Applicant also noted that the shingles proposed are the same shingles previously approved by HARB and installed on a small porch located at the rear of the home. Rod Young asked if shingles

would also be installed on the projecting bay at the side of the home. The Applicant responded in the affirmative.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing slate roofing on the home and replace it with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color.

Motion: Rodman Young made a motion to approve the removal of the existing slate roofing on the home and replace it with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The existing box gutter on the rear section of the house will be reused, if possible, and if it is deteriorated beyond repair, it will be replaced by a half round gutter located at the roof edge.
2. The color of any aluminum drip edge material shall match the color of the adjacent trim.
3. All flashings will be of a real copper material.

Second: Diana Hodgson

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing slate shingles on the home and replace them with GAF Slateline shingles in the Antique Slate color, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 7: Roofing: The HARB encourages, Replacement of roofing materials when beyond repair, matching original color, pattern, material and texture

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #2: The applicant/owner of the property located at 77 West Broad Street, Unit 17C proposes to install a new sign on an existing wall mounted bracket.

Property Location: 77 West Broad Street

Property Owner: Payson House Condos

Applicant: Alexis Kovacs

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 77 West Broad Street, Unit 17C proposes to install a new carved foam sign on an existing metal wall mounted bracket. The sign will be 24" high by 36" wide. The underside of the existing bracket is approximately 10'-8" above the walkway and the underside of the new sign will be approximately 8'-8" above the walkway. The sign will include three colors; white, gold, and black.

Character Defining Features: The three-story smooth brick contemporary colonial building is a series of ground floor shops with apartments above. An at-grade diagonal link connects Broad Street with the Sun Inn Courtyard.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project. The Applicant advised that the proposed sign would incorporate a narrow pinstripe border one-half inch in from the perimeter edge of the sign. Dianna Hodgson stated that a white colored pinstripe border would be most appropriate. Connie Postupack asked the Applicant to confirm the height of the existing mounting bracket and the anticipated height to the bottom of the proposed sign. The Applicant confirmed that the sign will be 24" high by 36" wide. The underside of the existing bracket is approximately 10'-8" above the walkway and the underside of the new sign will be approximately 8'-8" above the walkway.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a new hanging blade sign to be mounted on an existing metal wall mounted bracket.

Motion: Diana Hodgson made a motion to approve the installation of a new hanging blade sign to be mounted on an existing metal wall mounted bracket, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citations outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The sign graphics will be as shown in the Application and will only include the logo that is shown on the submitted document. The graphics shown on the four corners of the document will not be included on the sign.
2. A white pinstripe border will be positioned one-half inch from the perimeter edges of the sign.
3. The sign will be 24 inches high by 36 inches wide and will be mounted so that the bottom edge of the sign will be a minimum of 8'-6" above the surface of the walkway below.

Second: Rodman Young

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the installation of a new hanging blade sign to be mounted on an existing metal wall mounted bracket, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation: Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 15: Signage: The HARB encourages signage that does not obscure or damage architectural features, identifies the business, complements the style of the building and is appropriately scaled for its location.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #3: The applicant/owner of the property located at 415 High Street proposes to replace an existing wood fence with a fence of the same height.

Property Location: 415 High Street

Property Owner: Mary Louise Brion

Applicant: Francis Gotzon

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 415 High Street proposes to replace an existing wood fence with a new wood fence of the same height of 6'-0", but different design as shown in the Application. This Application was previously denied on 6 October 2021 because the Applicant was proposing to replace the existing wood fence with a vinyl (PVC) fence.

Character Defining Features: The two-story Classical Revival home has a cross-gabled slate roof with a central shed dormer. The substantial, modillioned cornice is otherwise simply detailed. The home is constructed of a smooth brick façade with a central, hipped roof entrance porch. The six light over 4 panel entrance door is centered on the entrance porch. The six over one light double hung windows are symmetrically placed. The second-floor windows have heavy wood sills and louvered over paneled shutters. The first-floor windows utilize brick heads and sills and are not fitted with shutters.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package. The Applicant confirmed that the proposed new wood fence would be placed in the location of the existing wood fence. Diana Hodgson asked if there would be a new gate proposed as part of the fence installation. The Applicant advised that a short section of new fence would be installed 90 degrees to the main run of fence and travel approximately 30 inches to meet the house. Connie Postupack asked if this short portion of the fence would be attached to the house. The Applicant advised that the fence will be attached to a new post that will be adjacent to the house. Diana Hodgson asked if the post caps would be as shown in the Application. The Applicant advised that the post caps, posts, and fence would all be manufactured of western red cedar. The Historic Officer asked if the Applicant was proposing a clear or colored finish for the cedar materials. The Applicant advised that the Owner preferred a natural, weathered finish. Rod Young asked if any of the aluminum fence that is shown

on the site plan would be replaced at this time. The Applicant advised that there will be no work related to the existing aluminum fence.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of an existing wood fence with a new wood fence of the same height of 6'-0", but different design as shown in the Application.

Motion: Connie Postupack made a motion to approve the replacement of an existing wood fence with a new wood fence of the same height of 6'-0", but different design, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citations outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. All elements of the fence will be manufactured of western red cedar material.
2. The new fence will be located in the same location as the existing fence with the exception of a short 30" return to the existing house.
3. The wood fence material will not receive any finish and will be left to weather naturally.

Second: Diana Hodgson

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the replacement of an existing wood fence with a new wood fence of the same height of 6'-0", but different design, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation: Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #4: The applicant/owner of the property located at 123 East Market Street proposes to replace the existing flat roof, slate roof and skylight.

Property Location: 123 East Market Street

Property Owner: Lloyd Kemmerer

Applicant: Jeremy T. Carr

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 123 East Market Street proposes to replace the existing slate roof with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color. New prefinished aluminum drip edge will be installed at the perimeter of the roofs. New chimney flashing will be installed as/if required and new vent pipe flanges will be installed to replace the existing. New shingle covered ridge vents will also be installed.

The existing flat roof will be replaced with a WeatherBond .060 rubber membrane roofing system. White metal roof edging will be installed around the perimeter of the flat roofs. The existing roof railing at the rear flat roof will remain in place and flashed with EPDM material per manufacturer's recommendations.

The existing box gutters will receive new round downspouts. Also, all gutters installed on the rear attached to the flat roof system, on the rear side and right side, and a small portion of the shingle roof in the rear will be replaced.

Furthermore, the applicant/owner proposes to remove the existing skylight and replace it with a new Velux Skylight. The new skylight will replicate the shape and dimensions of the existing skylight.

Character Defining Features: The two- and one-half story home has a cross-gabled slate roof with a wide shed dormer facing the Street. The simple brick façade is painted. All of the double hung windows, with simple heads and heavy sills, are six over one light and are fitted with black shutters. The louvered shutters on the upper floor windows are very narrow and appear to be nonoperating. The paneled shutters on the first-floor windows are of a proper width. The centered wood paneled entrance door with a half-round transom window above is slightly recessed in an arched opening with wood panel sides containing a narrow sidelight.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package. Diana Hodgson questioned how the new skylight would be

installed. The Applicant advised that the new skylight would utilize the existing skylight curb and framing. The new skylight, trim, and flashings will be in a Tuxedo Grey color. The Applicant also advised that the skylight is very difficult to see or view from the public way at the rear of the home. Ms. Hodgson asked if the old flat rubber roof would be removed prior to installing the new roofing system. The Applicant responded in the affirmative and that it would be replaced in-kind. Furthermore, the Applicant stated that the rear dormer and flat roof would receive new half round gutters with round downspouts. The existing box gutters will be lined with an EPDM membrane and be fitted with new round downspouts. All trims and roof edgings will be of a color to match the adjacent roof trim.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing slate roofing and replace it with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate Color, replace the existing flat roof in-kind, and replace the existing skylight.

Motion: Diana Hodgson made a motion to approve the removal of the existing slate roofing and replace it with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate Color, replace the existing flat roof in-kind, and replace the existing skylight, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The color of any aluminum drip edge material shall match the color of the adjacent trim.
2. Any chimney and/or roof penetration flashing shall be copper.
3. The existing box gutters will be lined with an EPDM membrane and receive new round downspouts.
4. All skylight, trim, and flashing material will be Tuxedo Grey in color.
5. The front and rear flat roofs will be replaced in-kind.

Second: Joseph McGavin

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing slate roofing and replace it with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate Color, replace the existing flat roof in-kind, and replace the existing skylight, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 7: Roofing: The HARB encourages, Replacement of roofing materials when beyond repair, matching original color, pattern, material and texture

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines/Guidelines for Sustainability and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #5: The applicant/owner of the property located at 258 East Wall Street proposes to remove and existing side door and cover the opening with siding in a size, profile, and color to match the adjacent existing siding. (They are removing the doors to renovate the kitchen.)

Property Location: 258 East Wall Street

Property Owner: Jaden Myers

Applicant: Jayden Myers

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 258 East Wall Street proposes to remove and existing side door and cover the opening with siding in a size, profile, and color to match the adjacent existing 12 inch by 24-inch fiber-cement shingle siding. (They are removing the doors to renovate the kitchen.)

Character Defining Features of the Site: The existing home appears to be a converted one-story garage building and sits well back from the street. An addition at the rear of the structure is low slung and cottage like. It appears that this structure and property was at one time part of one of the adjacent larger homes.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the project based on the Application package. Connie Postupack asked the Applicant if he knew the age of the home. The Applicant responded that he thought the home was a converted garage that had an addition constructed at the rear of the building in the 1960's. Rod Young asked if the Applicant was intending to replace just one door. The Applicant responded in the affirmative and advised that Mike Simonson had been out to the site to confirm that the removal of the door would not negatively effect egress from the home. The Applicant further advised that a new fiber cement shingle/siding that matches the existing siding would be used in the infill area and would be painted to match the existing siding color. Diana Hodgson asked that the Applicant "tooth-in" the new siding with the existing so that the infill will appear to be seamless. The Applicant agreed. Ms. Hodgson also advised the Applicant that any existing building materials that are removed must be disposed of properly. The Applicant agreed. Connie Postupack asked if the wall mounted lighting fixture adjacent to the door that is to be removed will also be removed. The Applicant advised that the existing wall mounted lighting fixture will remain in place to help illuminate the walkway that runs along the side of the home.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing door in the kitchen and infill/cover the opening with siding in a size, profile, and color to match the adjacent existing siding.

Motion: Joseph McGavin made a motion to approve the removal of the existing door in the kitchen and infill/cover the opening with siding in a size, profile, and color to match the adjacent existing siding, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. The new fiber cement siding shall be toothed-in with the existing so that the infill will appear to be seamless.
2. The new fiber cement siding will be painted to match the color of the existing siding.

Second: Rodman Young

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing door in the kitchen and infill/cover the opening

with siding in a size, profile, and color to match the adjacent existing siding, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:

Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

Item #6: Emergency Roof Replacement Application. The applicant/owner of the property located at 243 East Church Street proposes to remove the existing slate roofing on their home and replace it with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color, remove the existing EPDM flat roofing and replace it in-kind and install new half round gutters and round downspouts in a white color.

Property Location: 243 East Church Street

Property Owner: Brian & Diane Cassel

Applicant: Paul Wright Roofing

Proposed work: The applicant/owner of the property located at 243 East Church Street proposes to remove the existing slate roofing on their home and replace it with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color, remove the existing EPDM flat roofing and replace it in-kind and install new half round gutters and round downspouts in a white color.

This Application was provided to Connie Postupack and the Historic Officer on 20 May 2002 by Mike Simonson in his position of Chief Building Inspector/Building Code Official after receiving the "emergency" submission from Paul Wright Roofing. After reviewing the information with Connie, the Historic Officer's response to Mike Simonson was as follows.

If this is truly an emergency, we are okay with this moving forward and them coming to HARB after the fact to present why this was an emergency and what they have done.

The replacement shingle shall be GAF Slateline in the Antique Slate Color. All flashings shall be real copper and any roof edge trim, such as drip edge material, shall be the same color as the adjacent trim. Any change in color of the existing trim must get prior approval from HARB.

Discussion: The Historic Officer, Joe Phillips, gave an overview of the emergency roof replacement project based on the Application package submitted by the Applicant. The Applicant provided pictures of the new roofing installation which was completed earlier that day. He noted that the 200 lineal feet of 1"x 12" deck boards were replaced because of water damage and rot. Rod Young asked if the downspouts would also be replaced. The Applicant advised that new half round gutters and round downspouts will be installed in a white color to match the existing roof trim.

The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing slate roofing on the home and replace it with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color, replace the EPDM flat roofing in-kind, and install new half round gutters and round downspouts.

Motion: Diana Hodgson made a motion to approve the removal of the existing slate roofing on the home and replacement with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color, replacement of the EPDM flat roofing in-kind, and installation of new half round gutters and round downspouts, in accordance with the discussion outlined above, the Guideline Citation outlined below, and with the following conditions.

1. All drip edges and trims shall match the color of the existing roof trim.
2. All chimney & roof flashing shall be real copper material.

Second: Connie Postupack

Result of vote: The vote was unanimous to approve the removal of the existing slate roofing on the home and replacement with GAF Slateline Shingles in the Antique Slate color, replacement of the EPDM flat roofing in-kind, and installation of new half round gutters and round downspouts, as per the motion.

Guideline Citation:Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s)

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the historic property and its environment.

#10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines

Page 7: Roofing: The HARB encourages, Replacement of roofing materials when beyond repair, matching original color, pattern, material and texture

Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations: The proposed work conforms with the intent of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the Bethlehem Historic District Design Guidelines and will have no negative impact to the historic district.

New Business

1. The Historic Officer advised HARB that Connie Postupack and he had met with City Staff and the Applicant for the Skyline West Project to discuss proposed revisions to the design of the new building and submission of a revised Application to be reviewed by HARB at a future meeting.
2. The Historic Officer reminded HARB that, because of the Fourth of July Holiday, the next HARB Meeting will be held on Wednesday 20 July 2022.

There being no further business, upon a Motion by Joe McGavin, a Second by Rod Young and a unanimous vote, the meeting was adjourned at 6:01 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



H. Joseph Phillips, AIA
Historic Officer